

## AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> February 23, 2022
TITLE: 674 S. Whitney Way - Exterior Renovations of a Planned Commercial Site in Urban Design District (UDD) No. 3. 19th Ald. Dist. (69784)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: Jessica Vaughn, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
DATED: February 23, 2022	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Cliff Goodhart, Chair; Lois Braun-Oddo, Tom DeChant, Shane Bernau, Jessica Klehr, Christian Harper, Rafeeq Asad, and Russell Knudson. Excused was Christian Albouras.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of February 23, 2022, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for exterior renovations of a Planned Commercial Site in UDD No. 3 located at 674 S. Whitney Way. Registered and speaking in support was Brad Koning, representing Sketchworks Architecture, LLC. Registered in support and available to answer questions was Mark Krameer.

Koning presented plans to update and modernize the building. The existing building is constructed of a stucco-like concrete mix material that is part of the structural system, along with cedar shakes on the modified Mansard roof. They do not intend to change the patio or general site, instead focusing on modifying the roof and bringing the building up to a modern standard. The wooden enclosures for trash and brewing equipment located on the back of the building would be replaced with composite contemporary-style enclosures. The proposed design squares off the Mansard roof and adds EIFS, which is scored to look like running bond. This design allows for signage on the corner, which is visible from the street and parking lot. A cantilevered canopy is proposed to highlight the front entry. The existing stone on each side of the front door would be continued throughout the lower half of the front wall and added below the bay windows and on the fireplace on the Whitney Way elevation in order to tie everything together. Above each bay window, a small canopy is introduced to create an eyebrow accent that relates back to the main entry. They propose adding windows on each side of the fireplace on the Whitney Way elevation in order to bring more natural light into the dining room area. On the west façade, the sidewalk and parking are tight to the building, and Koning requested input on the treatment of that side of the building.

The Commission discussed the following:

- This is an interesting site in terms of trying to navigate how to get in the building and where to park. The entrance could use more pop or interest because it's all still the same geometries and colors. I'm wondering if maybe it's a lighting solution, but it could be more pronounced because of the wayfinding issue.

- Is there a possibility of changing the EIFS to metal panels? EIFS is very flat, and with the amount you have on here, a metal panel would be more appropriate because it is more interesting with its texture and sheen.
- I understand the need and desire to modernize structures, but one thing about Vintage now is its sense of place; it is funky as it is. The new modernization lost that. I wonder if you could maintain some of that detail that is so recognizable and unique about this building now.
- Look at the scale of the EIFS and running bond and compare that to the scale and texture of the stone below. The facades with bay windows and stone have a certain aesthetic that is fighting with the EIFS and running bond above, and it could get balanced out more.
- I understand the existing roof might not be desirable, but it really set it as a place and the way it casts shade and shadow along the façade adds interest. If you consider the suggestion for metal paneling, maybe you could play with the metal paneling (in and out, different surfaces that cast shade and shadow) to add texture to the façade because you're losing a bit with removing features on the existing architecture.
- What is the height of the roof? It looks like the roof is half the height of the building, which is my #1 issue; it's just too big and out of scale. When you go modern, sometimes you simplify, but the front of the building is way too simple. The scale of the roof is too big, and the scale of the roof material fights with what is on the bottom. I think the massing could work, but it needs more detail and design. It can be modern and still have some interest and aesthetic to it, which is what is missing here. The roof is way too tall.
  - The building height is 21feet.
- One thing about the Mansard roof is that it recedes as it slopes away. Along Whitney Way, it also has dormers that break up the roof mass, where the new design doesn't do that at all. Those dormers brighten up a heavy roofline. Looking at the back of the existing building where it is all Mansard, it is too heavy and too much roof. I would encourage a different panel system because this is a lot of EIFS, and break it up with an expression like the original design did. The building still has its integrity, so maybe it could be as simple as replacing the shakes with a metal roof or other roofing material over the existing Mansard. Echoing earlier comments to keep the funkiness a little bit.
- What will remain as far as outdoor seating? Will the front of the building and main entry purely be a walkway? Align whatever you might do to make the entryway pop with the overall intent of the entryway.
  - The front has a few existing chairs now as a waiting area, and the intent was to keep the outdoor seating in the back patio area.
- What are the CMG dark bronze column covers like?
  - It is a composite metal panel system, not a light gauge metal; it has substance so it doesn't dent.
- Compliments to the design team and developers on the trees placed in the plaza. Some haven't made it, so it is important to keep up the maintenance until they sustain themselves.
- Reiterate the issue of the heaviness of the roof. I agree that it seems to fight the bay structures on the Whitney Way side. Do what you can to lighten it and bring more verticality up like the front entrance; elements like that could lighten it. Bring that around to the west and south side as well. The west side is a big blank wall and needs relief; on the south side, you'll need to solve the utility issue. Do something that breaks the weight of the roof structure.
- I didn't know there was an outdoor space. Hopefully adding glazing on the Whitney Way side integrates the outdoor space into the restaurant space because it's a lost amenity. It should be more of an asset than it seems to be right now.
- One way to break up the roofline could be to do something over the patio. Highlight it because it is a feature. You're talking about adding glazing to the patio side, but maybe the front could use it too to pull you into the space. To the left of the front door, it seems like it wants to be a window, which would help

lighten the façade once you take care of the thickness of the roofline. I like the eyebrows and entry canopy, but I don't think it works with the massing of what is around it.

**ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.