

---

Regarding: **1123 Jenifer Street – Third Lake Ridge Historic District – Exterior alterations involving the replacement and repair of soffit and fascia on the front porch. 6<sup>th</sup> Ald. District. (Legistar #23607)**

---

Date: September 19, 2011  
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon

---

**General Information:**

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace and repair soffit and fascia on the front porch of the residence. Similar work on the eaves of the main roof was started without a permit and was finished with administrative review and approval. Staff suggested that the existing front porch fascia and soffit materials could be repaired with administrative approval or the aluminum replacement work could be reviewed by the Landmarks Commission.

---

**Landmarks Ordinance sections:**

33.19(11)(i) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.01(11)(g). *Included below for reference.*
2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
  2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
  3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
-

**Staff Comments:**

The Applicant provided images of other residences to show that the proposed soffit and fascia alterations would be similar to the houses nearby. Staff believes vinyl and aluminum soffit materials in particular are not compatible with the original or historical finishes since the direction of the “joints” are turned perpendicularly from the original direction of the soffit boards. The original soffit boards were typically nailed to the underside of the roof rafters and were parallel to the exterior wall of the building. Due to the flexible quality of aluminum and vinyl materials, the construction industry has promoted products that are not historically accurate due to their method of installation and thus the final appearance is altered from the historic finish.

Because the Landmarks Commission has established the precedent to allow the use of vinyl and aluminum in historic districts to be compatible with the historic finishes, Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations can be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission.