

**Jeff Rosenberg**

---

**From:** Brian Munson [BMunson@vandewalle.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 07, 2012 4:37 PM  
**To:** Jeff Rosenberg; Dan Day  
**Subject:** FW: Grandview Report

Brian Munson  
Principal

Vandewalle & Associates  
120 East Lakeside Street  
Madison, WI 53715  
608.255.3988

---

**From:** rbruceallison tds.net [mailto:rbruceallison@tds.net]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 07, 2012 4:35 PM  
**To:** Brian Munson  
**Subject:** Re: Grandview Report

November 7, 2012

Mr. Brian Munson  
Vandewalle and Associates

Dear Mr. Munson,

At your request I met with you at the Grandview Commons Planned Unit Development site on Cottage Grove Road near North Star Drive. You have asked that I comment on several of the trees on the proposed development site. You have provided me with a site plan showing the location of select trees numbered 1-12, a proposed landscape plan with a list of trees to be planted, and also a power point presentation titled "Grandview Commons Oct 2012 Mature Trees to be Razed for Copp's Parking Lot."

My measurements and examination of the trees in question show factual errors in the data provided in the power point presentation. Trunk circumferences measured at DBH (4.5 feet above ground level) are as follows for the 3 bur oaks and 1 hickory on the east border behind the existing townhouses:

1. 113 inches not 156 inches
2. 100 inches not 132 inches
3. 101 inches not 108 inches
4. 71 inches not 91 inches

Regarding ages, be aware that it is difficult to age trees precisely without using an increment borer to actually count annual rings. Growth rates are a function of available sunlight, moisture, soil nutrients and general health. In 2001 I conducted a research project on "Bicentennial Oaks" published on the Dane County Tree Board website [www.treeboard.org](http://www.treeboard.org). (see attached). For bur and white oaks we determined trunk circumferences of 120 inches indicated 200 years of growth. Using that metric there is only one bur oak that qualifies as a bicentennial, located on the southwest corner and having a circumference of 135 inches.

11/7/2012

Another factual error is on the slide titled "Tree #5 Burr Oak Circum:72" Aprox. Age 115." The tree species in the foreground of the photo is actually a black walnut with a trunk circumference of 70 inches and is more likely nearer in age to 30 years. A search of Dane County or City of Madison historic aerial photography will clarify that fact. To the south of that walnut in the tree line numbered 11 in your site plan are the following:

Hackberry with a structural defect of co-dominant 12 inch diameter stems;  
Black Cherry, 25" DBH with structural defects of cavity and decay;  
Black walnut, 16" DBH;  
Norway Maple, 15" DBH;  
Arborvitae row;  
Norway Maple, 22" DBH;  
Sugar Maple, 16" DBH;  
Hackberry, 22" DBH;  
Norway maple, 25" DBH planned for preservation;  
Spruce 12" DBH planned for preservation.

The woodlot numbered 12 on your site plan is a collection of second growth (average 12 inch diameter) invasive trees primarily black locust and boxelder with some black cherry interspersed.

Regarding the landscape plan, I strongly encourage the selection and careful placement of larger oaks to mitigate the loss of the hickories and bur oaks. Purchase good quality 3-4 inch caliper Balled in Burlap bur, white or swamp white oak. My favorite is the naturally occurring hybrid between the bur oak (*Quercus macrocarpa*) and the swamp white oak (*Quercus bicolor*) often called the Schuetti oak. Do plant a mix of oaks however to diversify and choose appropriate locations and soil sites to maximize growth and ecological contributions. Replace each of the larger oaks and hickories removed for development with 4 replacement oaks. Silver maple numbered 7 on your site plan has trunk decay and presents a hazard near the roadway. It should be removed promptly with no mitigation required.

The true bicentennial tree on the property, bur oak 6, is currently designated for preservation. It is highly visible to traffic on Cottage Grove Road and therefore a landmark tree. Be sure to provide adequate root zone space for its continued growth. Build tree preservation specifications into your construction documents, place tree protection fencing around it during the construction, do not allow any soil disturbance in that zone. Have a competent, reliable person monitor it during the entire development process.

Respectfully submitted,

R Bruce Allison, MS, PhD  
For Allison Tree Care, Inc.  
Adjunct Professor  
Department of Forest and Wildlife Ecology  
University of Wisconsin-Madison

On Wed, Nov 7, 2012 at 9:10 AM, Brian Munson <[BMunson@vandewalle.com](mailto:BMunson@vandewalle.com)> wrote:  
Bruce,

Would you have any time this morning to discuss your findings?

Brian Munson  
Principal

11/7/2012