

Regarding: **209 North Prospect Avenue – construction of a new single-family home in the University Heights Historic District and adjacent to a designated landmark (Ely House)**
INFORMATIONAL REVIEW
(Legistar #20928)

Date: January 10, 2011
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon

General Information

The Applicant is proposing to construct a new residence on the parcel located at 209 North Prospect Avenue in the University Heights Historic District. This parcel was subdivided from the adjacent landmark property, the Ely House, at 205 North Prospect. The parcel is Lot 2 on the Certified Survey Map dated May 30, 2008 (I.D. #09438) which states:

Any new construction or exterior alterations on proposed Lots 1 and 2 will be subject to the criteria and standards for alterations and new construction on landmark properties as set forth in the Landmarks Commission ordinance, section 33.19 of the Madison General Ordinances as per document 1388858.

A tree survey and tree preservation plan shall be submitted as part of any plans for new construction on Lot 2 and shall be approved by planning division staff and the Landmarks Commission.

Relevant sections of the Landmarks Ordinance:

33.19 (12)(f) Criteria for the Review of New Construction in the R2, R4, R4A, R5, R6, C1, C2 and OR Zoning Districts.

1. Principal Buildings.
 - a. Height. The maximum height for new buildings and structures in the R2, R4 and R4A Zoning Districts shall be 35 feet and shall not exceed 2-1/2 stories except as provided in Section 28.08(5)(e) of the Madison General Ordinances.

The maximum height for new buildings and structures in the R5, C1 and C2 Zoning Districts shall be 40 feet.

The maximum height in the R6 Zoning District for new buildings and structures shall be 50 feet. All new buildings and structures in all zoning districts within University Heights shall be no less than 15 feet high.
 - b. Materials. Materials for the exterior walls of new buildings and structures shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less

inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing buildings in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl must be visually compatible with buildings in the visually related area. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.

- c. Visual Size. The gross area of the front facade, i.e., all walls facing the street, of a single-family, two-unit or commercial building shall be no greater than 125% of the average gross area of the front facades of buildings in the visually related area. The gross area of the front facade of a multiple family dwelling shall be no more than 125% of the average gross area of the front facades of all buildings within the visually related area or variations in the setback shall be designed in the front facade of the building to repeat the rhythm and proportions of buildings to space between them within the visually related area.

33.19(5)(b) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction and Exterior Alteration.

- 4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
 - a. Whether, in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done; and
 - b. Whether, in the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would adversely affect or not harmonize with the external appearance of other neighboring improvements on such site; and
 - c. Whether, in the case of any property located in an Historic District designated pursuant to the terms of Subsection (6)(d) hereunder, the proposed construction, reconstruction or exterior alteration does not conform to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for said district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
 - d. Roof Shape. The shapes and pitches of roofs on new buildings and structures shall be similar to the roof shapes and pitches on existing buildings within the visually related area.
 - e. Roof Materials. Roofing materials on new buildings or structures shall be similar in appearance to roofing materials used on buildings within the visually related area. Modern-style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials

may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.

- f. Parking Lots. No new parking lots will be approved unless they are accessory to and on the same zoning lot as a commercial building or multiple family dwelling. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

Staff Comments

Since this is an informational presentation, a staff recommendation is not provided at this time.

The Applicants are interested in understanding the Landmarks Commission position on the massing, roof shape and location of the building on the site before they move forward with developing the final design proposal.