
Regarding: 1910 Regent Street – University Heights Historic District – Exterior alteration involving a rear addition and three car garage addition. 5th Ald. District. Contact: Ed Kuharski (Legistar #25289)

Date: March 12, 2012
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

General Information:

The Applicant is proposing to remove two existing detached garages on the property and construct an addition to the existing residence that will be located on the rear and to the side. The garage addition is held significantly back from the front face of the Regent Street elevation and interrelates with the proposed rear addition. The proposed rear addition is placed to allow the original building corner and roof hip to be expressed. The architectural details and materials of the new construction will match the existing aesthetic.

The Applicants came before the Landmarks Commission during the Public Hearing for this item on February 13, 2012. The Landmarks Commission referred the item to a future meeting pending design revisions that would better meet the standards of the Ordinance.

Relevant Sections of the Landmarks Ordinance:

33.19(12)(d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs in R2 and R4A Zoning Districts.

6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the building or structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing building and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the building rather than contrast with it. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

Staff Comments:

It is not the purpose of the Ordinance to create a museum setting for the buildings in a historic district. Instead, the Ordinance is supposed to allow for change in a guided historically logical way. Four square forms are the most difficult forms to successfully integrate additions. This proposal respects the original structure by holding the rear addition off of the back corner and off the main roof hip. The proposed garage attaches to the proposed rear addition leaving the original side elevation largely exposed and uncovered.

Since the Landmarks Commission meeting of February 13, 2012, Staff has worked with the Architect to revise the design. From the current submission documents and conversations with the Architect, Staff notes the following details of the proposal:

- The exterior materials and detailing of the proposed addition will match the existing materials and detailing.
- The original window sash that would be covered by the proposed addition will be removed and relocated in the addition.
- The width of the garage has been reduced from the previous proposal and the proposed mass is proportional to the mass of the original residence. The garage element (walls and roof) are related to the architecture of the original residence.
- The hyphen element (which attaches the garage to the rear addition) is pushed back from the front plane of the garage and touches the original corner of the residence. The roof ridge of the hyphen is held as low as possible to visually drop into the background.
- The landscaping plan and proposed driveway configuration may also assist the proposed addition by obscuring the hyphen in particular and by further softening the garage.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed addition may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions:

1. Staff approval of the proposed window and door details.
2. Staff approval of the materials of the proposed raised patio.