

## Comparison of Parking and TDM Policies and Strategies by City

STRATEGIES	Madison, WI	Buffalo, NY	Grand Rapids, MI	Hartford, CT	Milwaukee, WI	Minneapolis, MN	Oakland, CA
<b>DEVELOPMENT</b>							
Zoning – Parking Minimums	Yes, with exceptions/waivers	No, eliminated 2016	Yes, with exceptions/waivers Currently undergoing comprehensive review of policies.	No, as of 2017. Some exceptions & guidelines.	Yes, with exceptions/waivers Most developers build more than minimum required.	Exceptions/waivers Plan to eliminate in the future	Yes, with exceptions/waivers.
Zoning – Parking Maximums	Yes		Yes. > 20% over maximum requires approval & a fee per space >20%.	Yes	Yes, by ordinance.	Yes. In Minneapolis 2040, plan to re-evaluate to better align with city goals.	Yes, dependent on zoning and other factors.
Payment in Lieu of Parking	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes
TDM Requirements for (some) new developments	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes
Adopted policy on TDM requirements and enforcement	Zoning code, not comprehensive, not enforceable.	<a href="#">Yes</a> , Point based “credits” for specific strategies. Reporting requirements, but no enforcement - noted for non-compliance.	<a href="#">TDM Strategy Guideline Report</a> Zoning code indicates it may be required – not comprehensive. Compliance/enforcement not specified in code.	No	No	Zoning code-not comprehensive. Compliance enforced via security agreement. Failure to demonstrate achieving goals of TDM results in forfeiture of security.	<a href="#">Yes</a> , Annual reporting requirements and “enforcement as provided in conditions of approval”. No requirement that goals actually be achieved, just that plan is followed.
Transportation Management Association	No	Yes, <a href="#">Go Buffalo Niagara</a>	No, recommended in TDM strategy report	Yes, <a href="#">The Ride Share Company</a>	No	Yes, <a href="#">Downtown Minneapolis Transportation Management Organization</a>	One of 9 San Francisco Bay Area Counties, it belongs to the Metropolitan Transportation Commission. <a href="https://mtc.ca.gov/">https://mtc.ca.gov/</a>
<b>ON-STREET PARKING</b>							
Variable Pricing (on-street)	No	No	Considering – currently undergoing comprehensive study of parking management strategies	No	No	No	Yes, pilot project, similar to Sacramento, CA’s.
Flex Loading Zones or fees required	No		Considering – currently undergoing comprehensive study of parking management strategies	Yes, 10” LZ for Uber Eats, Grub Hub, etc.. Requires fee, placard.		Businesses request LZ in metered area for set time frame. One busy night-life area, LZ before 10 a.m. at metered.	Chinatown Loading & Parking Pilot proposed to combine scheduled metered loading & parking zone.
Daytime Residential Parking Permits	Yes	Yes – in pilot phase	Yes	Yes	Yes	Residential & Business.	Res., Biz, & Car Share
Night Parking Restrictions	No	No	No	Yes, prohibited 2am-5am by ordinance. Short-term permits for exceptions (construction, out-of-state visitors).	Yes	Yes	
Visitor Permits On-Street	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Other On-Street Permit Programs	No	No	Caregiver (RPP), Monthly Commuter (RPP) although none sold to date.	No	Yes, night shift worker for night	On-street Dis zones	Res. DIS Parking Zone
<b>CITY-OWNED OFF-STREET</b>							
Park & Ride Lots	Minimal –NTP only one with regular service & multiple routes.	16 Metro Bus free lots 5- 10 miles & 1 is 15 miles. Metro Rail 2 lots. UB 5 lots w/shuttle.	Yes, frequent bus service operated by RTA. Free downtown circulator. BRT –area somewhat limited.	Yes. State system with 46 locations within a 20 – 25 mile radius serving Hartford.	Six in city. Total of 13 in county.	Yes –Extensive regional system, 104 free park & ride lots and 40 carpool lots.	Yes. Combination of 11 public and private lots. One lot for Caltrans, AC and Bart.
City-Owned Parking Leased to Developers to reduce developer parking requirements	Yes (several long-term agreements)	Yes	Yes, 10 agreements	Monthly permits only.	Yes	Monthly permits.	Not renewing leases to eliminate “deals”. Focused on market-based pricing.

## MOAPS: Grand Rapids, Michigan Parking Strategies

### ON-STREET PARKING PROGRAM: Residential Parking Permit Program

Establishing: The requirements to establish a Residential Parking Permit Zone (RPPZ) are:

- Minimum 3 blocks in length
- Within 1,500 feet of a defined traffic generator (such as hospital, educational institution or commercial concern); and
- The block faces must be continuous.

Additional factors may be considered for zone boundaries, primarily with respect to natural boundaries, major and minor arterials, parking capacity of the street, and land use characteristics.

Analysis: Parking staff follow a yearly parking study schedule that includes all neighborhoods in the city to verify whether there is a transient parking problem. Requests for study from Neighborhood Associations are accepted but not required.

#### Permit Limit:

- **Residential:** One per licensed driver, per household. (Maximum of 4 permits)
- **Guest:** No limit on amount of guest passes per qualified applicant. Guest permits may be purchased in advance and are valid for 24 hours.
- **Caregiver Permit:** One per qualified licensed driver, per household.
- **Monthly parking permit:** One permit per qualified applicant.

Delivery, service, or emergency vehicles parked in residential parking zones while making short-term (defined as 20 minutes or less) service calls to residential dwellings within the zone do not require a permit.

#### General Comments:

Changes or additions to the Residential Parking Permit Program are currently on hold pending the outcome of a comprehensive study of parking issues and policies. Staff don't anticipate substantial changes to the program.

Grand Rapids will be undergoing a curb management review for potential parking policy changes. Loading zone issues and areas that could be more flexible to fit demand will be considered. They are trying to develop innovative methods to develop occupancy counts to develop demand based pricing. Looking to pilot new technology for collecting data parking occupancy data such as drones and autos that upload into GIS.

## **MOAPS: Grand Rapids, Michigan Parking Strategies**

### **OFF-STREET PARKING MINIMUMS AND MAXIMUMS**

The City is currently undergoing a comprehensive review of policies. It is unclear what the outcome of this review will be. There is currently no minimum parking requirement in the City Center. In other areas the planning commission allows developers to go below minimums if other factors support this such as nearby transit service, based on a transportation plan and parking study.

City Ordinance provides for the potential for parking incentives to encourage transit ridership, however this policy has not been put into action, pending outcome of strategic plan revisions.

### **OFF-STREET PARKING LEASES**

The city has approximately ten shared parking agreements, where they lease out parking to a developer who then leases to tenants or other developments. This is not common but they are looking to expand this. Downtown daytime parking occupancy is 95% or higher in city center. There is a 6-12 month waiting list for downtown monthly parking permits.

The city has a substantial number of park and ride lots outside of the downtown where they sell monthly permits for commuters. They have had a big uptick in popularity recently. Cost is \$2 to park all day, while downtown monthly parking is about \$150. These are served by buses to the downtown that have a 3-7 minute headway. They partner with the Regional Transit Authority which operates, maintains, and stores the buses, while they city purchases the buses. In addition the city has a free downtown circulator and autonomous shuttle trial which helps make the park and ride lots more useful once transit riders get downtown.

The RTA recently received a grant for transit oriented development, this will be done through their department but funded by the RTA. The RTA is also going through a comprehensive operational analysis.

The City is not looking to build more public parking, as they don't know if there will be demand for these facilities long-term. Most recently they started leasing 300 spaces from a new private garage. The most recent parking garage the city built 10-12 years ago. They leased this garage to developers.

## MOAPS: Buffalo, New York's Parking Strategies

### ON-STREET PARKING PROGRAM

Background: Due to parking pressure from a nearby development, there is a trial residential parking permit program in the Fruit Belt neighborhood. Current state statute allows for this trial, but state law would have to change in order for more areas to be added to the program.

Eligibility: Residents must have a mailing address in the Fruit Belt Neighborhood. Vehicles must be registered to the person receiving the permit. Permits are free of charge and valid for 2 years. Residents can obtain as many permits as they need.

Changes anticipated: After the Fruit Belt trial started, residents from other neighborhoods also expressed interest in a similar program in their neighborhood. If State Statute is changed to allow for expanded residential parking permits the city would consider this, and likely model their system on what Montreal, Canada does with specific residential permit parking zones.

### OFF-STREET PARKING MINIMUMS AND MAXIMUMS

Parking minimums were removed in 2016 with adoption of the Buffalo Green Code, though certain developments are required to complete a transportation demand management plan. The resulting TDM plan can result in the provision of off-street parking. Anecdotally they have seen mixed-use developments advertising parking availability.

### OFF-STREET PARKING LEASES

The city owns nine parking garages, these are managed by Buffalo Civic Auto Ramps (BCAR), a private organization. Rates and permits are proposed by BCAR, with the city parking commissioner suggesting changes, and the Mayor and Common Council approving.

There are three "levels" of off-street leases available. The general lease allows the lease holder to park at a particular facility when space is available. The next tier allows parking on the first level of a facility in a pooled reserved area when space is available. The top tier provides a signed reserved space for the permit holder only.

BCAR has parking lease contracts with private businesses and schools.

### GENERAL PARKING DIRECTION/PLANS

The focus recently is addressing insufficient parking in the downtown. The goal is to move all day parkers into periphery and combine this with shuttle service to open up spaces in the downtown for short term parking during the day. They are currently drafting an RFP for shuttle service. They are considering increasing short term parking rates downtown and opening up more parking on the periphery.

Hartford Parking Authority's Residential/Neighborhood Permit Program:

- ❑ Residents may apply for two permits and one visitor pass per household.
- ❑ Permits are valid for one year. Each zone has its own renewal month.
- ❑ Cost is \$25 annually and prorated on a monthly basis.
- ❑ Permit fees may be waived at the discretion of (the) Hartford Parking Authority (HPA) if the applicant meets selective criteria related to physical disability or financial hardship.
- ❑ Application Process:
  - Initially submit in person.
  - Applications can be downloaded from their website.
  - With their application, residents must submit vehicle registration and proof of residency.
  - Resident's taxes must be paid in full and the vehicle must be free and clear of any parking citations.
- ❑ Renewal:
  - Permits need to be renewed (15 days) before they expire.
  - Renewals, where all (the) information is current, may be mailed including payment by money order or check.
- ❑ Visitor permits can be purchased when the applicant meets the necessary residency requirement.
- ❑ Vehicles without permits are subject to citations and towing. Through the program's webpage, responses to Frequently Asked Questions about the Residential Parking Permit Program are available to download as a PDF.

Additional On-Street Parking Strategies:

- In 2017, to reduce abuse, HPA no longer allows free on-street, metered parking for motorists displaying accessible parking permits intended for people with disabilities.
- A city-center parking scheme was created with an increase per hour from \$1 to \$2 an hour.
- Instituted ten minute loading zones with permits for Uber Eats and Grub Hub to pick up an order for delivery. It requires a placard for a fee
- Revised commercial loading zones so that smaller businesses without a special type of license plate can use it.
- Monthly off-street permit fees were increased by \$5 a month.

Hartford's Zoning Code: Parking Minimums/Maximums:

Effective in January of 2016, Zone Hartford is a "comprehensive and complete overhaul of the City of Hartford's zoning language, the goal of which is to reduce redevelopment burdens, advance smart-growth principles, and promote environmental stewardship." The two-year project with extensive community engagement, garnered the city the 2017 Connecticut Main Street Catalyst Award (for) ZoneHartford: A Transformative Citywide Form-Based Code." One aim was to create a more "livable and walkable city" for Hartford residents by allowing the market to primarily dictate parking allotments. The change was sparked by conversations led by the city's Planning Chair, Sara Bronin, and UConn Professor Norm Garrick. The professor's research found that the city was losing an estimated \$50 million in tax revenue due to the amount of land used for parking. Hartford is the second city in the U.S. to eliminate parking minimums from its zoning policy; Buffalo, NY was the first.

Parking Requirements:<sup>1</sup>

Accessible parking: parking structures accessible for persons w/ disabilities must be compliant with the federal/state standards for accessibility.

Automobile Minimums:

As of February 13, 2019, “Outdoor Sales Lot for Vehicles”, under Retail Uses, still requires off-street parking minimums (and maximums).

Automobile Maximums:

Parking maximums are in place for most residential and non-residential land-uses. See Figure 1, p. 3, for specifics.

Bicycle & EVCS Minimums:

Zoning establishes minimums for bicycle parking and electric vehicle charging stations (EVCS) based on land-use categories. Minimums are mostly based on square footage, some are based on building occupancy during maximum capacity. See Figure 2, p.4, for detailed min and max requirements for bicycle parking.

Multi-Use Reductions:

Developments are allowed multi-use reductions through a special permit review. Demand for parking within multi-use properties are assessed through the “Parking Time Periods Per Use” table, Figure 3, p.4.

Parking Design Standards:

The zoning policy also includes design standards for both automobile and bicycle parking design. The specifications establish standards for dimensions, location, access, slope, signage and the illumination of parking facilities.

Loading Requirements:

All land-uses—apart from the residential/lodging, civic, and institutional categories—are required to provide off-street loading spaces. The requirement is based on the property’s square footage.

Public Parking : Businesses and Organizations:

HPA leases to businesses through their monthly off-street permit programs. In lieu of leasing city-owned parking to developers instead of constructing, HPA would sell the land to the developer.

Transportation Demand Management:

In terms of TDM, Mingo Gomes, the CEO of HPA, perceives that they are not in a position to implement other changes. He thinks that there needs to be an increase in the residential population before they tackle TDM

---

<sup>1</sup> The ‘Parking Minimums and Maximums’ section is primarily authored by Noah G. Lee, 07/30/2019, with additions and editing by A. Turner, 09/23/2019, “Hartford”.

USES	REQUIRED NUMBER OF OFF-STREET PARKING SPACES
<b>Residential &amp; Lodging Uses</b>	
One-Unit Dwelling	Maximum 4 spaces per zoning lot For One-Unit Dwelling Building in N-1-1, maximum 6 spaces per zoning lot
2- & 3- Unit Dwelling, Multi-Unit Dwelling, Efficiency/Micro Unit	Maximum 2 spaces per unit
Bed & Breakfast, Hotel/ Apartment Hotel	Maximum 1.5 spaces per guest rooms
Temporary Shelter Facility	Maximum 1 space per bed
Group Living, Group Living for Health Reasons	In accordance with special permit review; guideline is maximum 1.5 spaces per adult resident, or for foster homes and children's homes guideline is maximum 2 spaces per 4 children residents
Residential Care	Maximum 1 space per bed (excluding bassinets)
Roominghouse/ Boardinghouse	In accordance with special permit review; guideline is maximum 1 space per rooming unit, plus maximum 1.5 spaces per dwelling unit of owner or manager
<b>Civic &amp; Institutional Uses</b>	
Hospital	In accordance with special permit review; guideline is maximum 1 space per bed (excluding bassinets)
Library/Museum	None
All Other Civic & Institutional Uses	In accordance with special permit review
<b>Open Space Uses</b>	
Park, River Uses, Urban Farm	In accordance with special permit review
<b>Retail Uses</b>	
Outdoor Sales Lot for Vehicles	1 space for each unregistered vehicle permitted to be sold, plus 1 additional space per minimum 10, maximum 5 such vehicles, reserved for visitors/ employees
All Other Retail Uses	Maximum 3 spaces per 1,000 square feet net floor area devoted to retail space

USES	REQUIRED NUMBER OF OFF-STREET PARKING SPACES
<b>Service Uses</b>	
Automobile Fueling & Limited Service, Automobile Service/Car Wash, Drinking Places, Entertainment Assembly, & Smoking Places	In accordance with special permit review or, if special permit not required, in accordance with site plan review
Eating Places	Maximum 3 spaces for every 5 persons based on maximum capacity
All Other Service Uses	Maximum 3 spaces per 1,000 square foot of net floor area devoted to customer service
<b>Adult Uses</b>	
Adult Establishment	In accordance with special permit review; guideline is minimum 1 space, maximum 3 spaces per 600 square feet net floor area devoted to retail space; OR for assembly-type uses: minimum 1 space for every 4 persons based on maximum capacity
<b>Employment Uses</b>	
All Employment Uses	Maximum 4 spaces per 1,000 square feet
<b>Infrastructure Uses</b>	
All Infrastructure Uses	In accordance with special permit review
<b>Industrial Uses</b>	
All Industrial & Warehouse Uses	Maximum 1 space per employee

Notes:  
These off-street automobile parking requirements shall not be applied to zoning lots in the DT-1, DT-2, and DT-3 districts.

Where special permit review is required for particular projects, these off-street automobile parking requirements shall be used as guidance but are not binding.

Figure 1 "Figure 7.2-A Required Off-Street Automobile Parking", ZoneHartford, p. 232.

Required Bicycle Parking:

BICYCLE PARKING		
Use	Minimum Long-Term Bicycle Spaces	Minimum Short-Term Bicycle Spaces
One-Unit Dwellings, 2- Unit Dwellings 3-Unit Dwellings	No minimum requirement	No minimum requirement
Bed & Breakfast, Hotel/Apartment Hotel	1 per every 60 sleeping rooms	1 per every 30 sleeping rooms, with 4 minimum
All Other Residential Uses	1 per every 30 dwelling units, rooming units, or beds, as applicable	1 per every 15 dwelling units, rooming units, or beds, as applicable, with 4 minimum
Assembly Use & Stadium/Arena	1 per every 500 seats	1 per every 50 seats
Higher Education Facility	1 per every 15,000 square feet of building area	1 per every 5,000 square feet of building area
Transit Station	30 spaces within a .125-mile radius	100 spaces
All Other Civic & Institutional Uses	1 per 15 employees	1 per every 10,000 square feet, with 10 minimum
Parks & Urban Farms	1 per every 15,000 square feet, with 15 minimum	1 per every 15,000 square feet, with 15 minimum
Retail & Service Uses	No minimum requirement	1 per every 3,000 square feet
Office/ Employment Uses	1 per 15 employees	1 per every 10,000 square feet
Commercial parking lots and garages	1 per every 30 automobile parking spaces	1 per every 15 automobile parking spaces

Figure 2 Bicycle Parking Minimums, Long- &amp; Short-Term Spaces.

Multiple Use Reduction:

PARKING TIME PERIODS PER USE						
Use Category	Weekdays			Weekends		
	Midnight-7:00 am	7:00 am-6:00 pm	6:00 pm-Midnight	Midnight-7:00 am	7:00 am-6:00 pm	6:00 pm-Midnight
Residential	100%	50%	80%	100%	80%	80%
Retail & Service	5%	100%	80%	5%	100%	60%
Hotel & Inn	100%	65%	100%	100%	65%	100%
Assembly	0%	30%	50%	0%	100%	75%
Eating & Drinking Establishment	50%	70%	100%	70%	60%	100%
Office	5%	100%	5%	5%	5%	5%
Theater / Entertainment	5%	30%	100%	5%	80%	100%

Figure 3 "Parking Time Periods per Use"



## MOAPS: Milwaukee, Wisconsin's Parking Strategies

**Milwaukee ON-STREET PARKING PROGRAM:** Permits include an Overnight Parking Permit, Commuter Impacted Residential Area Day Parking Permit, Temporary Overnight Parking Permission, Resident-Only parking permits, Night Shift worker Parking Permit, Residential Nonconforming Use Day Parking Permit, and Disabled Night Permit.

Background: The overnight parking permit program began in December 1951. Parking overnight between 2 and 6 am on Milwaukee streets requires a permit. Alternate side parking in winter is typical, though some exceptions have been allowed beginning in 1979. In 2016, some districts began to allow parking on both sides of the street except during snow emergencies.

Establishing: Commuter impacted streets are designated by the parking commissioner. These areas are generally located near factories, schools, hospitals or large employment centers.

Eligibility<sup>1</sup>: Valid Wisconsin driver's license with the same address on the application. Vehicle must be registered to the same address as on the application.

Night shift workers who are not provided with off-street parking facilities by the employers may park their vehicle during the period of employment.

Vehicles bearing plates or identification cards for disabled drivers are exempt from purchasing overnight permits, however they do need to obtain a no cost Special Disabled Night Permit.

Residential Nonconforming Use Day Parking Permits are available for residents living in housing erected prior to Oct. 27, 1970, does not have adequate off street parking, or the vehicle is needed to transport a person with a mental or physical disability.

There is reciprocity with permits issued by the village of West Milwaukee and city of St. Frances. These permits are effective during such time as those entities have authorized parking.

Motor trucks, luxury limousines, motor buses, trailers, semitrailers, camping trailers, motor homes, mobile homes and tractors are not eligible for special parking permits.

### Permit cost:

1. Overnight Permits \$55/year or \$20/4-month.
2. Temporary guest permits free, up to 3 times in a 30-day period.
3. Commuter Impacted Residential Area Day Parking, one permit per household, free.
4. Resident Only parking \$15/year).
5. Night Shift Worker Parking-free.

Parking for Persons with Disabilities: A no cost Special Disabled Night Permit is required in addition to the state issued parking identification card.

---

<sup>1</sup> Their webpage <https://city.milwaukee.gov/ParkingServices/ParkingPermits.htm#.XXux4KN8AuU>

includes links for the program and other related (P) issues.

## **MOAPS: Milwaukee, Wisconsin's Parking Strategies**

Changes anticipated: Eliminate physical permits and use vehicle license plate as identifier. Overall the program is well received and since many of the policies have been in place for nearly 70 years it is well understood.

### **OFF-STREET PARKING MINIMUMS AND MAXIMUMS**

Milwaukee has not eliminated parking minimums, but the current zoning code (adopted in 2002) created provisions to use alternative methods (such as on-street parking, shared parking & leased parking) to meet parking requirements. Parking maximums are by ordinance, exemptions to the maximums may be made by the commissioner of neighborhood services if certain criteria are met (Ordinance 295-404 d.)

Some land uses have never had minimum parking requirements. For example there are no parking requirements in most downtown districts because parking lots and parking structures are plentiful. Some other land uses (such as day care centers) do not have parking requirements, but most day care centers require approval from the Board of Zoning Appeals and the Board has the authority to mandate parking.

Milwaukee considers their parking requirements low. In most cases developers choose to provide more parking than is required because they feel their business model requires more parking than is required.

### **OFF-STREET PARKING LEASES**

The city works with developers and enters into lease agreements when there are available spaces in city facilities. These are typically leased at market rate. There is one lease from the 1990s for an entire structure in downtown Milwaukee. This is with Johnson Controls, and was done as an incentive to keep them in the downtown area.

Minneapolis's On-Street Parking Permit Program:

Background: In 1977, the Critical Area Permit Program, for residents and businesses, was passed following a U.S. Supreme Court ruling. The ruling allowed a municipality to place restrictions in the Right of Way.<sup>i</sup>

Currently, the CPA, it seems, is not meeting its objectives effectively as Dillon Fried, Assistant Parking Systems Manager, for the City of Minneapolis, MN Traffic & Parking Services, considers it to be outdated based on the city's various land uses. Since implementation, changes have been to the schedule.

One change in process is to the CPA's basic mechanics of the program. Mr. Fried considers their current system antiquated as it requires a physical permit. It is located next to the vehicle's license plate, which is one of several factors that make enforcement challenging. Their Residential Parking Only (RPO) permit program is easier. To improve the mechanics of the permit program and its enforcement, they have contracted with Paylock to use virtual permits based on a vehicle's license plate along with LPR<sup>1</sup>. Eventually, people will be able to go online to obtain visitor permits, make updates and similar. They plan to convert to the Paylock system starting with smaller CPA's as their renewal dates become due. They have a total of 31 areas.

Establishing:

To establish a CPA, an engineering study is required to determine the following four findings.

- 1) Area is detrimentally impacted by parking of commuter, student, customer or visitor/guest vehicles generated by area businesses, institutions or recreational/entertainment facilities during the proposed hours of restriction.
- 2) Insufficient off-street vehicular parking for the use and convenience of the residents thereof in the vicinity of their homes.
- 3) Vehicle noise, pollution or congestion will work unacceptable hardships on the residents of the area if present parking is allowed to continue unregulated.
- 4) Health, safety and welfare of residents of the area and the city as a whole and the attractiveness and livability of specific neighborhoods will be promoted by a system of preferential parking enacted under this section<sup>ii</sup>

Areas: The CPA is employed in 1 or 2 hour time limited parking zones. Others include areas with designated No Parking 5 p.m. – 12 midnight except by permit with time limits near bars and commercial areas. Here in Madison, an example might be the 1700 and 1800 blocks of Monroe Street.

---

<sup>1</sup> LPR is License Plate Recognition.

Eligibility: “Licensed drivers who live at or have businesses at qualified addresses within a CPA are eligible for permits.”<sup>iii</sup> Businesses and small offices, which are embedded in a neighborhood, are included in the program. To verify that their address is in a CPA, prospective applicants can use their interactive “Critical Parking Area Map” GIS based webpage to find out.<sup>iv</sup>

#### CPA Residential Permits:

1. Two per licensed driver.
2. One visitor permit per dwelling unit.
3. One service permit per dwelling unit.

CPA Business Permits: two per business but visitor or service permits are not designated.

CPA permits cost \$25 per year. A ten dollar setup fee applies the first year an area is established. They are good for up to one year. Permits expire on the last day of that area’s designated expiration month. A permit’s cost may be reduced to \$15 when purchased within the last 6 months of the permit’s calendar year. There is a one month grace period prior to the expiration date for newly issued permits.<sup>v</sup>

#### Visitor and Service Permits:

- Δ \$10 each,
- Δ Share the same expiration date as the qualified CPA
- Δ Transferable
- Δ Cannot be used on a resident’s vehicle
- Δ May not be resold
- Δ Purchasing is optional.
- Δ Are not required to purchase a CPA residential permit.<sup>vi</sup>
- Δ Disabled residents may purchase and do not need to be a licensed driver.<sup>vii</sup> If they are housebound, they can mail in their application.<sup>viii</sup>

Temporary permits – purchase in person, \$2/day or \$5 for up to 30 days. Businesses are not eligible to purchase temporary permits.<sup>vi</sup> *If someone needs to “park a vehicle other than the one (they) have permitted--for example, (they) have a rental car while (their) car is in the shop—(they) may purchase a temporary permit.”<sup>ix</sup>*

#### On-Street Disability Zones<sup>x</sup>

Minneapolis Parking Services offers commercial and (residential) property owner applications for disability transfer and parking zones. Both include a questionnaire to gather more background information on the applicant’s needs and request. The “property owners” application includes a “Location Options for Disability Zone” map form.

Off-Street Parking Minimums and Maximums:<sup>xi</sup>

Minimums: The requirements are, in general, as follows.

Uses	Square Footage	Minimum
Non-residential	1,000 <	Exempt
	1,000 >	4 stalls or Amount Specified, whichever is >
Multiple- tenant/use	1,000 <	Exempt 4 uses < 1 stall = each commercial/ necessary vehicle

Maximums: Currently, “uses subject to a maximum parking requirement may provide parking up to the amount specified (in table 541.1) provided that a development with one (1) or more non-residential uses shall not be restricted to fewer than ten (10) total accessory parking spaces on a zoning lot.”

Reducing: Minneapolis’s “Reducing Off-Street Parking Requirements”<sup>xii</sup> offers the options of shared parking<sup>xiii</sup>, shared vehicles<sup>xiv</sup>, “transit incentives for multiple-family dwellings”<sup>xv</sup>, valet parking<sup>2xvi</sup> and a bicycle incentive.<sup>xvii</sup>

Minneapolis 2040 – The City’s Comprehensive Plan:

For the future of parking minimums as part of a “Pedestrian-Oriented Building and Site Design”, they plan to

Eliminate the requirement for off-street parking minimums throughout the city, acknowledging that demand for parking will still result in new supply being built, and re-evaluate established parking maximums to better align with City goals.<sup>xviii</sup>

This is part of fulfilling Minneapolis’s

- Δ Goal 5: Healthy, Safe, and Connected People<sup>xix</sup> which “Policy 6: Pedestrian-Oriented Building and Site Design” is intended to support with action steps.<sup>xx</sup>
- Δ Goal 6: High-Quality Physical Environment.<sup>xxi</sup>
- Δ 2040 Topics “Land Use and Built Form Policies”<sup>xxii</sup>
- Δ Transportation Policies,<sup>xxiii</sup>

As to the future of parking maximums, in Minneapolis 2040, one action step is to “re-evaluate established parking maximums to better align with City goals.”<sup>3</sup>

Per Dillion Fried, though not a zoning expert, eliminating the off-street parking minimums still needs to be finalized, requiring ordinance changes. There hasn’t been a lot of discussion. There are questions in terms of policy and practice, lead to greater demand and big ticket items.

<sup>2</sup> 541.210. - Valet parking. “The off-street parking requirement for restaurants, hotels, and theaters located in buildings existing on the effective date of this ordinance may be fulfilled by maintaining a valet parking service for customers.”

<sup>3</sup> 2040, p.120, action task I.

Mitigating Parking Demand Tensions:

One option available to the public, for example, is a business owner, who requests 1-hour limited parking to insure turnover, would be financially responsible for the expenses. This includes the fees to pay for the necessary signage and annually they pay \$150 for every 20 feet of on-street parking space.

Leasing Public Parking to Businesses and Organizations:

This is offered through monthly parking.

<sup>i</sup> Per Dillion Fried, Assistant Parking Systems Manager, City of Minneapolis, MN Traffic & Parking Services, during a conversation in 09/2019.

<sup>ii</sup> “About the Program”, [http://www.minneapolismn.gov/parking/critical/parking\\_critical\\_about-the-program](http://www.minneapolismn.gov/parking/critical/parking_critical_about-the-program), accessed on 08/06/2019.

<sup>iii</sup> Critical Parking Permits – City of Minneapolis, <http://www.minneapolismn.gov/parking/critical/>, 08/06/2019.

<sup>iv</sup> “Critical Parking Area Map”, <http://cityoflakes.maps.arcgis.com/apps/InformationLookup/index.html?appid=852707cb77fb4e359071a7ef70d2e844>, accessed 09/17/2019.

<sup>v</sup> Critical Parking Permits - City of Minneapolis, <http://www.ci.minneapolis.mn.us/parking/critical/index.htm>, accessed 09/17/2019.

<sup>vi</sup> Visitor/Service Permits – City of Minneapolis, [http://www.ci.minneapolis.mn.us/parking/critical/parking\\_critical\\_visitor-service-permit](http://www.ci.minneapolis.mn.us/parking/critical/parking_critical_visitor-service-permit), accessed 09/17/2019.

<sup>vii</sup> Per Dillion Fried, Assistant Parking Systems Manager, City of Minneapolis, MN Traffic & Parking Services, during a conversation in 09/2019.

<sup>viii</sup> Per the above conversation with Dillion Fried.

<sup>ix</sup> “Critical Parking Permits – City of Minneapolis”, <http://www.ci.minneapolis.mn.us/parking/critical/index.htm>, accessed 09/18/20-19.

<sup>x</sup> “Commercial Request for On-Street Disability Zone”

<sup>xi</sup> Minneapolis’s Ordinances, 541.170, Introduction to “Table 541-1 Specific Off-Street Parking Requirements.”

<sup>xii</sup> In Minneapolis’s Ordinances, “Article IV. – Reducing Off-Street Parking Requirements” of Ch. 541, Off Street Parking and Loading.

<sup>xiii</sup> Minneapolis, MN ordinance 541.190. – Shared parking. (2009?)

<sup>xiv</sup> 541.195 – Shared vehicles (2009?)

<sup>xv</sup> 541.200 – Transit incentives (2009?) (Amended 2015?)

<sup>xvi</sup> 541.210 – Valet parking (2009 and 2013?)

<sup>xvii</sup> 541.220 – Bicycle incentive. (2009 and 2013?)

<sup>xviii</sup> “Minneapolis 2040 – The City’s Comprehensive Plan”<sup>xviii</sup>, plan policy 6, “Pedestrian-Oriented Building and Site Design” Action Step I”, p. 120.

<sup>xix</sup> Minneapolis 2040, p. 30.

<sup>xx</sup> “Minneapolis 2040 – The City’s Comprehensive Plan”<sup>xx</sup>, plan policy 6, p. 119.

<sup>xxi</sup> 2040, p. 32.

<sup>xxii</sup> 2040 p. 58.

<sup>xxiii</sup> 2040, p. 82

\\Fps2\data2\Tacommon\Plans and Studies\MOAPS\Parking Strategy Summaries\MOAPS MINNEAPOLIS MN Parking Strategies Summary.docx

OAKLAND'S ON-STREET PARKING PERMIT PROGRAMS:

- 1) Residential/Business Permit Application
- 2) Free Floating Zone Parking Permit for Car Sharing Organizations, (CSO).
- 3) Dedicated Space Parking Permit for CSOs.

Thoughts & Observations:

- 1) Around for a long time
- 2) Not a huge part of what they do.
- 3) Politically (popular) and residents like it.
- 4) Proper use is for single family homes where it works best
- 5) Not in keeping with density
- 6) Lacks an equity component,
- 7) Commonly used near commercial areas.
- 8) Plan to do enforcement with License Plate Recognition for cost effectiveness and to reduce the repetitive motion required of enforcement employees. When enforcing two-hours parking limits, every time they return to enforce a block, enforcement personnel have to type in each plate to determine whether or not it has a permit.

Alternative Transportation: Challenges have been easier (to deal with) in place of parking. Scooters initially faced a lot of opposition. Though with people focused on covering the last mile, they've become more popular.

CURB MANAGEMENT:

Keith Schuerholz, the city's transportation liaison, said they're using Sacramento's parking model and described them as "geniuses." Sacramento, California uses a Tiered Pricing Structure. He stated that Oakland has consolidated all off-street parking. Their focus is on revenue instead of permits and citations. They use wayfinding extensively to assist drivers to locate parking. He noted that the young are not (into) owning cars.

On-Street Parking - Utilizing a Demand Parking Strategy:

Currently, they have a variable parking rate pilot project in the Montclair neighborhood. They aim to charge premium prices when drivers are wanting to park in areas that are impacted by rush hours. So, the more desirable a location is at any given time of day or day of the week, the more expensive it will be to park on the street. Rates are adjusted quarterly.

Curb Colors:

The city relies on them to designate various on-street parking and loading zones. People have to pay the city when requesting a particular zone. For instance, a green 12-Minute Parking zone costs \$820 each time. If the curb's color fades and can't be enforced, the fee has to be paid again. If a customer wants to have their driveway red-tipped for a No Stopping, Standing or Parking at Any Time zone, they will have to pay \$484 to have it done. They are responsible for maintaining it. However, the city does maintain the white Passenger Loading curb zones.

Curb Color	Example	Purpose
Red	<b>NO PARKING ANY TIME</b>	No stopping, standing or parking at any time.
Yellow	<b>COMMERCIAL LOADING</b>	Between 7 a.m. – 6 p.m., for passengers and materials. Only 3 minutes to unload passengers. Vehicles with commercial license plates have no more than 30 minutes to load and unload.
White	<b>PASSENGER LOADING</b>	3 minutes to load/unload passengers. Mostly between 7 a.m. – 6 p.m.. Exceptions are in front of a hotel and hospital 24/7, theater, hall or place of public assembly 24/7 except when closed. May then park for only one hour.
Green	<b>12 MINUTE PARKING</b>	Between 8 a.m. – 6 p.m. Do not apply on Sundays or parking holidays.
Blue	<b>PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES</b>	Parking for persons with disabilities whose vehicles display either a valid disability placard or license plate.

Chinatown Parking & Loading Pilot (CPLP): It started in the fall of 2018 and they plan to move out from there, area by area. The CPLP project intends to respond to constituents concerns about parking and mobility challenges, as noted in *Figure 1*.



Figure 1 Park Oakland's "Demand Responsive Parking & Mobility Management Initiative", "The Chinatown Loading and Parking Pilot Project", "Project Background", p.2.

This initiative has three primary goals for downtown Oakland:

1. Increase parking availability through variable pricing and time limits,
2. Improve customer satisfaction, and
3. Actively manage the parking supply to support environmental, economic, and social equity goals.

Transportation Demand Management is also a critical component of this initiative by improving travel options other than driving, including bicycling, transit, and shared mobility.

As part of the Chinatown project, one novel idea is combining metered on-street parking with metered commercial loading zones. Loading may be permitted for three hours once or even twice a day with metered parking available at other times.

As part of transportation mode-shift, there is the opportunity to identify preferences for discounted passes to various mobility options. They include an all-inclusive discounted pass to AC Transit, BART, SF Bay Ferry, FordGoBikes and others.



If Chinatown were to become a Parking Benefit District, they solicit preferences and suggestions for amenities like benches, transit shelters, trees, free Wi-Fi, bike racks, new lighting and other.

#### OFF-STREET PARKING REQUIREMENTS:

##### Automobile Minimums and Maximums:

Oakland's requirements for off-street parking vary. Depending on the zone or combinations of zones, it spans from spaces are not required to a fraction of a space to x number of spaces per room unit, bedroom or dwelling unit, per employees, to prescribed by the director, to maximums to maximums are not required.

##### Density Bonus and Incentive Procedure:

The procedure is to "encourage the construction of affordable housing, senior housing, the provision of child care facilities, and other incentives and concessions, following California Government Code." The maximum Density Bonus is thirty-five percent. Other options include, at the least, land donations, on-site child care facilities and apartment-to-condominium conversions. Reductions in development standards include but are not limited to: required off-street parking, setbacks, maximum building height, open space, maximum floor area ratio, maximum lot area and minimum courtyards. It further covers the integrity of the units, maintaining affordability, eligibility, resale, management and monitoring, and an administrative fee for the city to monitor the target living units. At the request of the developer, who meets the category criteria, the city shall not require a "vehicular parking ratio" to exceed the following.

1. Zero to one bedroom: one onsite parking space
2. Two to three bedrooms: two onsite parking spaces
3. Four or more bedrooms: two and one half parking spaces.

##### Leasing Off-Street Parking:

They are not renewing leases, etcetera with businesses and organization. Saying, we need that space. They are eliminating the "sweetheart deals" that businesses and organizations had been getting previously. They are focusing on market based pricing and not making it easy for people (to park).

Transportation Demand Management: Their efforts are to get employers to assist employees. He states that they are approaching (all of this) from a Customer Success Platform.