



**Project Name & Address:** 1233 Jenifer Street

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in a historic district.

**Legistar File ID #** [53289](#)

**Prepared By:** William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** October 30, 2018

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Ted Hill – Hill Apartments

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for front porch repairs

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The site is located at 1233 Jenifer Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - (i) Height
    - (ii) Landscape treatment
    - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
  - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the front porch railing system. The applicant appeared before the Commission on October 15, 2018 and the request was referred to allow the applicant to work with staff on details of the project. While progress has been made and the applicant is now proposing a style as recommended by staff, the exact details of the top handrail and the base and top of the columns still need to be resolved.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- c) The work done to date that replaced the posts and railing of the first floor porch did not retain the original or existing historical materials. It seems clear from the photos that the design and dimensions of the recently removed posts were not original. However, it seems that the railings and balusters may have been original. The proposed railing design is simple and appropriate for this style of house. Staff recommended this approach for the first floor porch even though it does not reflect the non-original railing on the upper porch.

## Recommendation

Staff believe that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve this request subject to the following condition:

- 1) The details of the top rail shall be approved by staff.
- 2) The details of the treatment to the top (capital) and bottom (base) of the columns shall be approved by staff.