



Project Name & Address: 1314 Jenifer Street
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in a historic district
Legistar File ID # [51829](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: May 30, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Vaughn Brandt
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations including construction of a rear addition and other items in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) NA
 - (b) NA
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. Height.
 2. Landscape treatment.
 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.

- (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The sun room addition was completed without approvals or permits. The applicant is now coming to the Commission to request a retroactive Certificate of Appropriateness for the work. The submission materials indicate that there are fish scale shingles on the rear elevation and lap siding on the side elevation with a low sloping shed roof. The property owner is willing to make changes to the appearance of the addition. Because the addition was constructed without permits, it was not reviewed by Building Inspection and those reviews may require changes to the appearance of the addition. If changes are required by Building Inspection, the addition may be brought back before the Commission.

41.18 (1)(c) instructs the Commission refer to 41.23. A brief discussion of the applicable standards of 41.23(9) follows:

- (a) The sunroom addition may be compatible with other historic resources related to height and landscape treatment. The size of the rear sun room mass and its placement are not typical to the rhythm of masses and spaces in the district.
- (b) The existing stainless steel chimney pipe is visible down the driveway from the sidewalk. The removal of the chimney would be welcome. The applicant is proposing replacing the chimney with a solar dome (skylight). The removal of the chimney and the repair of the remaining hole in the roof with similar materials would be most appropriate. Solar domes are skylights and should not be visible from the street since they are not historical materials.
- (c) Not applicable
- (d) Not applicable
- (e) Not applicable

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. The alterations made to structures in historic districts should be carefully evaluated to ensure retention of historic significance and character in the district. Protecting the historic resources means using appropriate materials for the components. For example, the rake board is covered with short sections of aluminum soffit material and the foundation is covered with metal.

Staff cannot provide analysis and recommendations for the third story porch or roof addition or the rear entry door selections because materials were not provided for review. The Commission should refer to the Third Lake Ridge standards for exterior alterations and the Certificate of Appropriateness standard related to frustrating the public interest to evaluate these requests.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the rear addition and removal of the stainless steel garage chimney may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval if requested by the Commission:

1. If it remains, the rear addition should have appropriate materials used for its components. The rake board should be wood or composite or wrapped with aluminum. The walls should be lap siding that terminates at an apron board to transition to the foundation material.
2. The sunroom addition is likely built on piers and does not have a uniform solid foundation wall surface. The Commission shall discuss the appropriate treatment of the foundation.
3. The removal of the chimney and the repair of the remaining hole in the roof with similar materials would be most appropriate. The solar dome could be located on a part of the garage roof that is not visible from the street.