



Project Name & Address: 515 South Paterson Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [55997](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: May 29, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Tracy Dietzel

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a door on a second-story porch and relocation of an existing window.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove a decorative window on the second-story street façade of the building and relocate it to the side of the building. Introduce a door in that former window opening on the façade, with the door replicating the style of the window it would replace. Previous survey of the property indicated that the house was constructed prior to 1872, but the Assessor information identifies the building as being constructed in 1899. In 1995, the Landmarks Commission approved construction of a new porch, which included a second story to what had previously been a single-story porch.

The request to relocate a decorative, original window from a street façade does not appear to meet the standards for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. However, introduction of a door would make the second-story porch area more functional. The project would be more viable if it were to elongate the opening for the narrow double-hung window on the front of the house, which has been functioning as the entry to the upper porch.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) N/A.
 - b) The proposal would alter the existing and historical proportion of solids and voids by modifying a square window opening and making it a full door opening. It would therefore not retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids on the street façade.
 - c) Technically the original window on the street façade would be retained by relocating it to the side of the building. However, the purpose of this standard is to retain the original materials on the street façade rather than relocate them to other places on the building.
 - d) The proposal would not alter the roof.
 - e) The proposal would specifically alter the original proportional relationship of the door and window sizes on the street façade, and this standard specifies that those be retained.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are not met as proposed and recommends that the Landmarks Commission deny the proposal.