

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 7/29/19

TITLE: 2450 Atwood Ave - Exterior Alteration to a Designated Madison Landmark (St. Bernard's Catholic Church) - Replacement of roof and gutters; 6th Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 8/5/19

ID NUMBER: 56615

Members present were: Stuart Levitan, Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, and Katie Kaliszewski. Excused were Arvina Martin and David McLean.

SUMMARY:

Jason Krause, registering in support and available to answer questions

Bailey explained that the proposed work includes replacing existing asphalt shingles with synthetic slate roofing tiles and removing deteriorated flashings, gutters, and downspouts and replacing with copper to match existing materials on the rest of the building. She discussed the applicable Secretary of the Interior's Standards and said that the existing asphalt shingles are not historic and she does not consider them to be a character-defining feature. She pointed out that the historic church roof has flat clay tiles, which have a particular profile. She said that this building has never had slate roofing, and the synthetic slate tile has a texture that differs from the smooth clay tiles on the historic portion of the building. She displayed images of the historic clay roof alongside the proposed synthetic slate tile, and said that the synthetic slate is not compatible. She said that she believes the standards can be met and the project should be approved with the condition that the applicant work with staff to find a roofing product that approximates the historic clay tile roofing. She explained that she doesn't object to using synthetic tile, but instead objects to the style of the tile proposed.

Krause said that they decided to use synthetic tile versus real clay tile because of concerns with heavy snow loads potentially breaking the clay tile. He said that he doesn't have a problem with using a different type of synthetic tile, and suggested Brava. He said that another alternative could be to install copper roofing in those sections. Bailey said that if there is no precedent for that area having copper, it may be a challenge to meet the standards. She said that she would prefer simple asphalt over changing to copper because there is currently asphalt on that area of the roof; however, because this is a landmark, it would be nice to have a better treatment. She said that she thinks there are synthetic tile options that will allow them to differentiate from the historic, while still keeping with the character of the look of the roof. Krause asked for clarification that she would prefer tile that is more characteristic of the historic roof tile, and Bailey confirmed that she would. Krause said that he is fine with that.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Andrzejewski, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the applicant work with staff to find a roofing product that approximates the historic clay tile roofing. The motion passed by voice vote/other.