

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** October 21, 2009

TITLE: 1252 Williamson Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) **REFERRED:**
for a Mixed-Use Building with 31 **REREFERRED:**
Residential Units and 2,400 Square Feet of **REPORTED BACK:**
Commercial Space. 6th Ald. Dist6. (15686)

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: October 21, 2009 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Mark Smith, Richard Wagner, Mark Smith and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 21, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1252 Williamson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was J. Randy Bruce, representing Scott Lewis. Bruce detailed the modifications to the plans as a response to the Commission's previous comments highlighting the following:

- A revised landscape plan featuring a rain garden in a modified shape with inclusion of yellow and purple flowering elements within the prairie drop seed mix.
- After consultation with the Parks Street Tree Division, replaced a proposed pear tree with Skyline Locust in the Baldwin Street right-of-way, along with the replacement of a Pin Oak with a Burr Oak on-site.
- An Ostrya Virginiana has been replaced with a Sienna Glen Maple.
- The trellis feature at the side/end elevation on Williamson Street has been redesigned to feature vertical piers with a metal trellis above.
- The architectural modifications include the incorporation of cantilever bays on Baldwin Street which have been narrowed to be elongated and more proportional to the façade of the building as a whole.
- Staff noted substantial controversy with the designed cantilever bays on the building as an issue with Planning staff and required further formal consideration by the Landmarks Commission based on their inclusion within the project as currently proposed. In response, Bruce noted that the cantilevers are only on the Baldwin Street elevation. The Commission noted the cantilever issue is beyond the Landmark Commission's charge and are appropriate, especially with the Landmarks Commission's charge not to create a historic duplication. The Commission further noted that the use of cantilevers is a product of its time.

Continued discussion by the Commission noted the following after review of the material and color palette by Bruce:

- Look at "skatelite" as an alternative to hardipanel.
- Like cantilevers but pull metal siding and/or fiber cement around the return.

- Remove soldier coursing over small windows on the Baldwin Street elevation; a suggestion.
- Problem with high canopy on end cap of upper elevation; looks heavy.
- Miss arched window detail on upper end cap elevation of the corner element; eliminate metal canopy and return arched window feature.
- Return second tree to the Baldwin Street right-of-way as previously proposed.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Ferm, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion provided for the following:

- The arched window feature shall be added to the upper end cap on the corner elevation with the modified elevation to be approved by staff.
- The Urban Design Commission supports the use of the cantilever features as detailed on the Baldwin Street elevation with flexibility on the cantilevered elements either being slanted or straight but strongly support cantilevers as currently detailed.
- The Urban Design Commission strongly feels that cantilever bays are appropriate for a new building in a historic district where the overall design respects the area's historic character with the bay not having a "fakey" design.
- The cantilevers are OK as clad with fiber cement with an option to look at the use of a "skatelite" material.
- Option to eliminate Soldier coursing over on small windows.
- Encourage two trees within the Baldwin Street right-of-way.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7, 7.5, 7.5, 7.5, 8, 8 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1252 Williamson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	6	6	-	-	7	8	8
	7	8	7	-	-	6	9	9
	7	8	6	6	-	6	8	8
	8	6.5	7.5	7.5	-	8	8	7.5
								7.5
								7
	6.5	7	6.5	-	-	6.5	8	7.5
		7						7
	6	7	6	-	-	6	6	6

General Comments:

- Great addition to the Williamson St. Neighborhood.
- Canted bays are an excellent element of design while overall design respects historic nature of neighborhood.
- Canted elements appropriate for historic district.
- Solid infill project: good work by all.
- Appropriate scale massing to a historic context with details reflecting current time.