



Project Name & Address: 1121 Rutledge Street
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and exterior alterations
Legistar File ID # [76446](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: February 28, 2023

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: James McFadden, McFadden & Company
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an addition, lower the height of the existing rear addition to create a rooftop deck, replace one window, and create new window and door openings.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
 2. The removal of historic features on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 3. The introduction of conjectural architectural features without historic precedent on the building is prohibited.

- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (b) Wood
 - 1. Replacement siding shall imitate the original siding within one inch of historic exposure/reveal.
 - 2. Where more than one layer of siding exists on the structure, all layers except the first must be removed prior to re-siding.
 - 3. All trim must project beyond the face of the siding to the same extent it did with the historic siding.
 - 4. Wrapping of trim and ornament is prohibited.
- (5). Windows and Doors
 - (a) Openings
 - 2. New window openings may be added to elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - 3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
 - (c) Windows
 - 5. Incompatible, non-historic windows may be replaced with new windows compatible with the historic character of the building.
 - (d) Pedestrian Doors
 - 2. Doors shall not have a textured fake wood grain.
 - 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view, wood or aluminum, and shall be compatible with the entrance door and the overall design of the building.
- (7) Building Systems
 - (a) Mechanical Systems
 - 3. Installing mechanical equipment on the roof that is highly visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 - 1. Decorative light fixtures shall replicate the original in style and placement.
 - 2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.
 - 3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 - 4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.
 - (d) Rooftop Features
 - 1. Rooftop decks or terraces and green roofs or other roof landscaping, railings, or furnishings shall be installed so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the street.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 - 2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
 - 3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
 - 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
 - 2. New additions that destroy significant historic materials or character-defining features are prohibited.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General

1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
- (a) General
 1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.
 - (b) Wood
 1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
- (a) General
 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
 - (b) Materials
 1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
 2. Any roofing materials shall be permitted on flat or slightly sloped roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - (g) Rooftop Features
 1. Rooftop decks or terraces and green roofs or other roof landscaping, railings, or furnishings shall be installed so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) General
 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
 2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
 1. Doors shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
 2. New door openings shall have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.
 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view and have a non-reflective coating.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to complete alterations to the rear additions to a historic resource in Third Lake Ridge. The front portion of the house is an 1899 Queen Anne style house. Later period additions to the rear of the house greatly expanded the footprint and while representative of the time of construction, are not generally in keeping with the style of the house. The proposal is largely to alter the areas on the rear of the building, with a few minor alterations on the sides, and a 57 square foot addition on the back of the building as part of the overall alteration to the back of the structure. The introduction of a rooftop patio is addressed in the alteration standards as a "rooftop feature."

In general this proposal will be minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way. The enlarged windows on the side of the building (at the lower level and first floor level, at the edge furthest from the front) and a small portion of the rooftop patio will be minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.

- (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. The proposed alterations are on later period additions. The alterations to that portion of the building are largely in keeping with the simple character and removing features that are more out of character with the rest of the structure.
 - 2. No historic features are proposed to be removed and the changes will only be minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - 3. There are no conjectural faux-historic features as part of this project.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (b) Wood
 - 1. The building is currently clapboard and the proposed alterations will replace the siding on the rear of the structure with smooth-surfaced fiber cement board, with a reveal similar to the existing.
 - 2. The alterations are to a nonhistoric portion of the existing structure, so no historic siding is proposed to be preserved.
 - 3. All trim will project fast the face of the siding.
 - 4. For the project, there are no details for how the trim is proposed to be treated, but it is not to be wrapped.
- (5). Windows and Doors
 - (a) Openings
 - 2. The proposal will largely alter existing window openings, but a few new window openings on the rear of the structure are proposed, which is in keeping with this standard.
 - 3. The design of the rear of the building is largely simple, with little ornament. The proposed design introduces a more regular rhythm of window openings and sizes, which is compatible with the overall design of this portion of the building.
 - (c) Windows
 - 5. The windows on the sides of the building that are proposed to be altered with new openings are nonhistoric. The larger fixed windows are not out of character with the character of this portion of the building.
 - (d) Pedestrian Doors
 - 2. There are no specifications for the proposed doors, but they need not to have textured fake wood grain.
 - 3. It is unclear if there will be storm doors, which would need to be full-light or full-view.
- (7) Building Systems
 - (a) Mechanical Systems
 - 3. There are no details on any associated mechanical equipment. If there are any new mechanicals proposed as part of this undertaking, it will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 - 1. There are no details about any exterior lighting for this alteration. Any new lighting will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.
 - 2. If there is new security lighting proposed, it will need a CoA.
 - 3. If there is exterior mounted conduit, it will need to be covered with line-hide, but ideally with the remodel, the electrical can be accommodated without needing exterior conduit.
 - 4. It is unlikely that this project will include any roof appurtenances, but if so, it will require a CoA.
 - (d) Roof Features
 - 2. The alteration to the rearmost single-story addition to remove the existing roof and convert the area to a rooftop patio will be minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way. By removing the roof, the deck area will sit more than a foot below where the roof was located. The cable railing will allow this space to mostly read as open, making it as inconspicuous as possible.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 2. There is a 57 square foot addition proposed for the rear of the house. It will rework one area and make a continuous wall plane in what is otherwise an irregular space. It will be subordinate and in keeping with the character of the rear of the structure.
 3. The addition is certainly visually separated from the historic portion of the building and is also separated from the rest of the nonhistoric rear addition with the new roof that covers just that area.
 4. The window and door openings on the addition are in keeping with the altered window and door openings on the rear of the structure.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. The new addition is secondary and on the noncharacter defining rear side of the structure.
 2. No historic materials or character-defining features will be destroyed as part of constructing this addition.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 1. This small addition is in keeping with the character of historic resources in the vicinity.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 1. The addition will have the same fiber cement siding as the rest of the rear of the structure.
 - (b) Wood
 1. The fiber cement siding will need to be smooth surfaced.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 1. The roof on the new addition is in keeping with the roof form of the rear of the house, which has a variety of roof forms.
 - (b) Materials
 1. There are no specifications for the proposed roofing, which will be required.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 1. The window and door openings are consistent with the proposed altered window and door openings on the rear of the structure.
 2. While the overall character of the new window and door openings seems to be consistent, we need product specifications to ensure compliance with this standard for compatible finish.
 - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
 1. The proposed doors are compatible with the design for the rear of this structure.
 2. The new door openings are consistent with the style of openings on the rear of the structure.
 3. It is unclear if there are storm doors proposed for the rear of the structure.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Final window, door, siding, and roofing specifications to be approved by staff.
2. Any lighting or exterior mechanicals proposed as part of this remodel will also need a Certificate of Appropriateness.