

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 23, 2007
TITLE: 1815 University Avenue – Demolition and Development of a 64-Unit Apartment Project, PUD(GDP-SIP). 5 th Ald. Dist. (05949)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 23, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Marsha Rummel, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Michael Barrett and Richard Slayton.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 23, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1815 University Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Patrick McGowan, Laurel Brown, Steve Brown, Tim Wadlington, Robbie Webber and Joseph C. Hanauer. The presentation directed by McGowan emphasized the following changes to the proposed plans:

- The building material palette has been altered to provide that masonry brick will be used on all sides, in combination with a buff colored limestone banding and above the first floor level and stone veneer base.
- The masonry brick will be economy in size.
- Building setbacks have been adjusted from a previously proposed 2-feet to 6-feet at the corner abutting Princeton Avenue, in addition to 7-feet at the corner along University Avenue.
- The south side (rear of the building) has been pulled in to provide for a minimum setback of 5-feet along the rear property line to accommodate landscaping.
- The collective adjustments to the setbacks at Princeton Avenue and University Avenue provide for the resolve of safety issues with the site distance raised by neighbors.

Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- A good job with setback adjustments; look at the utilization of hydrangea and other species relevant to survival issues, in addition provide a more formal hedge treatment instead of alternating.
- Good work, better project; consider the full application of stone veneer on the center portion of the building featuring the main entry on the north elevation (University Avenue) with the ends of the building featuring all brick. Cornice details still detracting with the rear elevation fenestration needing more variety and window types.
- The design of the building should not preclude the potential for retail use despite being beyond the purview of the Commission.

ACTION:

On a motion by Woods, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-1-1) with Barrett voting no and Wagner abstaining. The motion provided that the applicant return with final building materials and colors, as well as revised building elevations per comments within the staff report, along with consideration of dentils as a cornice treatment.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6/7, 7 and 7.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1815 University Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7.5
	6	6	6	-	-	-	7	6/7
	6	6	6	-	-	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	6	6
	5	5	5	5	-	5	4	5
	7	7	6	6	-	-	8	7

General Comments:

- Nicely done. Good infill, appropriate massing and size.
- Much improved street interface.
- Very nice to see project continuing to improve.
- Not acceptable only because the design precludes retail. Yes, a street as major as old University Avenue must have retail; right now it is a retail desert.
- Look at amount of stone, window pattern at south façade.