



Project Name/Address: 917 E Mifflin Street, Breese Stevens Field

Application Type: PUBLIC HEARING
Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations on a landmark site

Legistar File ID # [53273](#)

Prepared By: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: November 14, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Mike Sturm, City of Madison Parks Division

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations on a landmark site

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site, Breese Stevens Field, is a landmark site located along East Washington Ave.

On December 17, 2017, the Landmarks Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new concessions addition.

The current request is for the next phase and involves hospitality and field improvements, including public access on top of the previously-approved concession addition, additional bleachers, hardscape, and linear digital signage along the playing field with lighted graphics panels.

On October 15, 2018, the Commission opened the public hearing on the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness, received an informational presentation on this proposal, then recessed the public hearing until November 19, 2018.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest

expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

All work will be done within the confines of the existing perimeter wall with the exception of replacing two doors in existing openings in the perimeter wall. Staff believe that the aspects of the project that potentially impact the historic aspects of the landmark and therefore need to be considered as part of the Certificate of Appropriateness include:

1. The public access on top of the previously-approved concession addition
2. The additional seating and drink rails in the grandstand
3. The proposed overhead door replacement in the exterior wall along E. Mifflin St.
4. The proposed door replacement in the exterior wall facing the corner of E. Washington Ave. and N. Patterson St.
5. The proposed door replacement in the exterior of the end bleacher wall towards E. Washington Ave.

There are other aspects of the project-- including the linear digital signage, free standing bleachers, and new hardscape-- that staff do not believe impact any of the historic architectural aspects of the landmark and are not visible from the exterior of the site along any adjoining streets, and therefore do not need to be considered as part of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Section 41.18(1)(a) instructs the Landmarks Commission to review the alteration request using the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. A discussion of the SOI standards follows:

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. The property is being used as an outdoor entertainment venue, which is similar to its original use as a baseball field. The current use requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. Overall, the historic character of the property is being retained and preserved. The doors replacements are all within existing historic openings and the new doors are compatible with the design and use of the spaces to which they will provide access. The proposed alterations to the grandstand and on top of the new concession addition will not detract from the historic character of the property.
3. No changes are being proposed that would create a false sense of historical development.
4. All changes to the property that have acquired historic significance in their own right are being retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize this property are being preserved.
6. This proposal does not address the need to replace any missing or deteriorated historic features
7. This proposal does not address the need to use chemical or physical treatments
8. No archeological resources are known to exist on this site.
9. Except for the replacement of the doors on the exterior walls, the proposed alterations are not any more visible from the street than the top of the current, historic grandstand seating and are being designed to be as unobtrusive as possible. The alterations do not destroy any historic materials or features and are designed to have a minimal impact on the site.
10. If removed in the future, the proposed alterations would not affect the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment.

41.18(1)(d) Because the proposed alterations facilitate the use of the landmark while preserving its historic features, staff believe that the request will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission find that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request.