



Project Name & Address: 1246 Spaight Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [60137](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: April 27, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Barb Sherkow

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new garage structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) Gross Volume.
 - (b) Height.
 - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
 - (d) Materials used in the street facades.
 - (e) The design of the roof.
 - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
 - (g) Directional expression.
 - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
 - (i) Landscape treatment.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new detached garage structure. The proposal would remove the existing concrete parking pad, construct a new garage in that location, and reconstruct the driveway. While a three-car garage was constructed at the rear of the property in 1925, it was demolished in 1969. The proposed new garage structure is similar in size and scale to garages in the vicinity. It is located behind the principal structure and in line with the driveway.

In 1995, the Preservation Planner issued a Certificate of Appropriateness to install 4/4 vinyl siding on the house to replace the historic clapboard. The proposal for the garage is to use 4/4 vinyl siding to match that on the house. There are currently no product sheets for the garage door or pedestrian door. The sliding window will not be visible from the street and is in keeping with the utilitarian style of the garage structure. The other trim details are in keeping with the materials and style of the principal structure.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) The gross volume of the garage is in keeping with the gross volume of other accessory structures within 200 feet.
 - (b) The single-story garage is of a similar height to other accessory structures in the vicinity.
 - (c) The new garage would have a similar proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades of other garages visible from the street.
 - (d) The house is currently clad in 4/4 vinyl and the garage would have the same cladding on its street façade.
 - (e) The gable-front roof is the typical roof form for accessory structures in the vicinity.
 - (f) The original garage was located along the rear property line and the new garage location would be 25-feet from the rear property line. The other properties in the vicinity have a mix of garages located along the rear property line and located closer to the principal structure. Given the mix of locations, this proposal is in keeping with the rhythm of buildings and masses.
 - (g) The gable-front garage has similar directional expression to other garages within 200 feet.

- (h) Staff would recommend submittal of final product sheets to ensure that the vinyl siding used on the garage has a smooth surface and that the garage and pedestrian doors are similar in style to other garages in the vicinity.
- (i) The driveway and concrete pad in front of the garage are a consistent landscape treatment for accessory structures in the vicinity.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal with the following conditions:

1. Staff approval of final specifications for the siding, garage door, and pedestrian door