

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 15, 2008
TITLE: 718 South Orchard Street – Additions to a Three-Unit on a Lot With a Coach House, Amended PUD(GDP-SIP). 13 th Ald. Dist. (12027)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 15, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair; Bruce Woods, Jay Ferm, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 15, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of an Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 718 South Orchard Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Todd Kiley, Duane Steinhauer and Greg Karn, with Lenny Kanter speaking in opposition. Todd Kiley, the applicant and Greg Karn, architect presented details on the revised site/building plans in response to the Commission's previous informational review (September 24, 2008) and Planning Division comments which emphasized downsizing of both the garage and parkside additions, including elimination of pavement encroachment into the adjacent park with additional elimination of impervious area onsite for landscaping adjacent to an adjoining lot line. Kanter spoke in opposition noting his general support but also declaring issue with the potential obstruction of park and lake view effects by both additions. Following a review of plan details, in combination with photographs of Kanter and Kiley's properties combined with aerial photographs, the Commission generally felt that any potential impacts were not obvious.

ACTION:

On a motion by Luskin, seconded by Weber, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (9-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 718 South Orchard Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	6	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	5	6	6	-	-	-	-	6
	6	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	7	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	5	5	-	-	-	-	5	5

General Comments:

- Reasonable additions, and a good way to sensitively add a bit of density, appropriately.
- Nice use of native plant material.
- Nice attention to maintaining character of house.
- Well designed, attractive addition.