

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

**PRESENTED:** June 25, 2014

TITLE: 1001 Wisconsin Place – PD(SIP), Signage  
Plan for “The Edgewater Hotel.” 2<sup>nd</sup> Ald.  
Dist. (34518)

**REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**

**REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

**ADOPTED:**

**POF:**

DATED: June 25, 2014

**ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Cliff Goodhart, Lauren Cnare, Tom DeChant, Melissa Huggins and Richard Slayton.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of June 25, 2014, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a signage plan for “The Edgewater Hotel” located at 1001 Wisconsin Place. Appearing on behalf of the project were Scott Bertrand and Patrick Basche. Sign plans were presented for the following:

1. The steak house (restaurant) with halo glow channel letters located over the entrance;
2. Coming down the stairwell to the common area will be a backlit LED sign that would reflect back into the sign cabinet, built into the wall;
3. Halo glow letters mounted above the main entrance.
4. On the 40s building, mounted on the canopy with opaque vinyl and outer edge lighting. This would be mounted on a raceway hidden by the soffit of the awning.
5. On the 40s building, building identification. It was suggested that the sign band was too small of an area, or the plaque to be moved down into a window area, which would not be very visually appealing. In discussing this with the Landmarks Commission, this design was acceptable.
6. Two signs mounted on the inside of the building, readable from inside and outside, for the café.
7. Dusted/crystal vinyl at different locations of the building, on the doorways as you enter.
8. The “Edgewater Shop” installed on the inside of the 40s building at the plaza and grand stair.
9. As you descend the stairs, a fitness club sign is proposed, internally illuminated mounted on top of the “eyebrow.”
10. Non-illuminated letters onto the “eyebrow” above the entrance of the executive offices.
11. A projecting sign as you go down the grand staircase. They have changed the font and background color per Landmarks comments.
12. A “Boathouse” sign in red with the font matching the canopy signage.
13. A lit sign to identify lake traffic coming into the building.
14. Two ice hall signs located up on the plaza.

There was a right-of-way sign that has since been deleted from the package.

Matt Tucker, Zoning Administrator noted that the Commission has a lot of flexibility here. The projecting sign for the boathouse that projects into the grand stair area should be closely looked at. If the sign does project out 3-feet, that's a 1-foot sign. That piece of the project was significantly discussed. This does not project into the conservation easement.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- The fitness club signage looks more Frank Lloyd Wright-esque than Art Deco.
  - Landmarks comment was to lower that sign, we had it sitting on a pedestal. They approved "B."
- The executive office sign seem to have a much more style than the fitness club type face.
  - The owner wanted a different flavor for each venue you're entering. That walkway down, he wanted to represent a street-like look. Each item has its own identity in a Main Street type of look.
- E9.2 and E10, when is the decision going to be made regarding the font?
  - E9.2 has been approved by the owner. These have all been approved by Mr. Dunn.
- Executive offices, can I just go in there if I go down the stairs?
  - They're not going to be open outside of business hours. You could walk in and plan your wedding, or retirement party.
- This notion of boats coming up to the boathouse, did the pier get approved?
  - That's not in our wheelhouse. I believe that's still being worked out.
  - There was a notice in this morning's paper about the public meetings.
- If it's not approved would you still continue with the same type of signage?
  - I believe ownership would, because the boathouse is going to be a place for the public to come down to, and it would add some illumination at night sitting around the patio area down there.
- My minor concern is, are you aware of how much your "Ice House" sign looks like "Ice House Beer?"
  - That's pretty much dumb coincidence, honestly.
- We see a little snippet of your sign amongst the circular windows, and yes Landmarks approved it and I trust their opinion but I am concerned that it does take away from the pattern of surface.
- There's a rhythm to those windows going up and now all of the sudden there's a sign there.
- (Tucker) I talked with Amy about this one and the problem is it's a glass wall. It's a plaque so Amy had encouraged them to put at this location.
- Those Wisconsin signs are so discreet but here on the Langdon building they're not.
- I don't understand why it couldn't be in the storefront system with a metal panel on the back of it. It would infill one of the rectangles but you don't have to look at the back of the metal from the inside. I agree it looks really big for a brass plaque in the middle of a bunch of circles.
- I don't like it in the windows because the windows have such a strong design and that was one of the big features of that original building. I don't know that the sign needs to be on the building.
- Without more elevations it's hard to tell.
- The purpose of naming the buildings is?
  - To direct people to the correct building on all these different levels. There was a significant amount of time discussing how to name them.
- When I drive up Wisconsin Avenue is there an overall sign that says "The Edgewater?"
  - There is not, the only place to put that was in the right-of-way.
- I really do have a problem with the Langdon building signs.
- Yes, you could put it on the ground or on a pedestal somewhere.
- I find the lettering on the Edgewater much more attractive than most of the other lettering you have.

- I am struggling with this concept of a “Main Street” with all these different fonts and approaches, it’s getting a little jumbled in my mind. The one that stands out as not fitting in is the fitness club. You’ve got the right design elements on the Edgewater Shop but the Ziggurats is not appropriate for that particular version of Deco.
- There’s something about the two boathouse signs too, the one down on the lake is actually fairly attractive, but the blade sign doesn’t have that same sense about it.
  - The blade sign we originally had lettering that would match what you see on the Edgewater Shops and Amy asked us to change it to match the boathouse lettering down on the water.
- From a branding point of view it makes sense to use the same logo, but I like the elegance of the sign with the same free-standing lettering. The boxes make it busy.
- Not the physical box, the visual box.
  - I think that would give the sign no character whatsoever.
- This kind of a blade sign doesn’t strike me as having any relationship to the Art Deco building at all. I think maybe there could be something better on this one (“Boathouse”).

**ACTION:**

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0). The motion provided for approval of all of the signs except for the Langdon Street building sign. The applicant is encouraged to find another location for this sign. The applicant is also encouraged to try and capture some of the elegance and charm of the “Boathouse” sign in the design of the projecting “Boathouse” sign, with all modifications approved by staff.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 6.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1001 Wisconsin Place**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	-	-	6	-	6	6