



**Project Name & Address:** 3241 Garver Green  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations on a landmark site  
**Legistar File ID #** [56616](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** July 22, 2019

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Bryan Moroder – Baum Revision  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of signage.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The landmark site is located at 3241 Garver Green

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
- (a) The size or design of the sign(s) would adversely affect the historic fabric of the structure or the district;
  - (b) The sign(s) fails to comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
  - (c) The sign(s) fails to comply with specific standards and guidelines for signs adopted in each historic district under this ordinance.

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## **Analysis and Conclusion**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install signage on the property. The signage proposed will have a monument sign with individual signage for the various tenants in the Garver building complex. The proposal will retain all of the legacy or historic signage that is still painted on the building. The two neon signs (one on the historic backside of the building and one on the historic front side of the building) are being installed in a fashion that they do not read as having been originally a part of the building. The neon sign on the historic front of the building (which is now functioning as the back of the building) is located inside a glass entry. It is currently unclear how the sign is affixed to the transom or where the wiring located behind the sign connects to power.

**41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) Work appears to comply with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) N/A
  - (c) N/A
  - (d) This project will further public interests in that it is sensitively revitalizing a Madison Landmark.
  
- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
  - (a) Of the several signs proposed the ones on the building are in keeping with the size and scale that would be appropriate for the building without overshadowing the historic signage. The new monument sign is located at a significant distance away from the historic building, and therefore does not adversely affect the historic character of the historic building.
  - (b) The sign package is currently being reviewed by Zoning and is proceeding through the Comprehensive Design Review process as it does not meet the standard signage requirements. The Design Review Board will review the submittal at its July 31 meeting.
  - (c) N/A

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. The property has been placed into a new use that is compatible with the site and buildings. The final stage of the process is to install signage for the tenants in the buildings.
2. N/A
3. The project is not introducing conjectural features. The building never featured neon signage, but the way that the neon signs are installed is done in a fashion that it is obviously part of the new rehabilitation of the property rather than reading as a historic recreation. It therefore does not create a false sense of history.
4. N/A
5. N/A
6. N/A
7. The project is not proposing to use any chemical treatments.
8. The project does not appear to impact any likely archaeological resources.
9. The new signage looks like a product of the current time while still being sensitive to the historic character of the property.
10. N/A

**Recommendation**

Staff believes that standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness (CoA) for have been met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.