



---

# Landmarks Commission's Role in Reviewing Demolition Requests

Plan Commission Special Work Session  
December 8, 2022

# Advisory Recommendation to Plan Commission

Landmarks Commission provides advisory recommendations to the Plan Commission on the historic value of properties with proposed demolitions

- MGO 28.185
- Landmarks Commission Policy Manual

LANDMARKS COMMISSION	Agenda - Approved	November 14, 2022
<b>CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL</b>		
<b>APPROVAL OF MINUTES</b>		
October 10, 2022: <a href="http://madison.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx">http://madison.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx</a>		
<b>PUBLIC COMMENT</b>		
1.	<a href="#">60576</a>	Landmarks Commission Public Comment Period
<b>DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS</b>		
Members of the body should make any required disclosures or recusals under the City's Ethics Code.		
<b>REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS</b>		
2.	<a href="#">73984</a>	23 N Pinckney St - Exterior Alteration to a Designated Madison Landmark (Maeder Building/Ellsworth Block) - Signage; 4th Ald. Dist.
<b>REGULAR BUSINESS</b>		
3.	<a href="#">68859</a>	Secretary's Report - 2022 -2023 meeting schedule
4.	<a href="#">68860</a>	Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2022 -6604 Odana Road -6209 Mineral Point Road -2412 Waunona Way -1617 Sherman Avenue -3100 E Washington Avenue -402 W Wilson Street -4522 E Washington Avenue -1309-1311 Theresa Terrace -1401-1403 Theresa Terrace

# Standards & Procedures

## MGO 28.185(7)(b)

If the Landmarks Commission determines that the property with the proposed demolition or the structure proposed for removal has historic value, then the Plan Commission shall approve the demolition or removal under sub. (9) below, after considering input from the Landmarks Commission.

## MGO 28.185(9)(c)(4)

The Plan Commission has received and considered the report of the City's historic preservation planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report that may be submitted by the Landmarks Commission.



# Landmarks Policy Manual

## Historic Value Advisory Recommendation

When advised by the Preservation Planner regarding a demolition request, the LC may provide a report to the Plan Commission on the historic, architectural or cultural significance of the structure for which a demolition permit is sought, to assist the Plan Commission in its determination of whether the standards of Chapter 28 are satisfied. The determination of historic value does not look at the proposed project for the site - only the historic value of the existing building.


For any advisory recommendation related to the historic value of buildings proposed for demolition, the Commission shall take one of the following actions:

- a. The Commission finds that the building(s) has no known historic value.*
- b. The Commission finds that the building(s) has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, or as the work/product of an architect of note, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally or culturally significant.*
- c. The Commission finds that the building(s) has historic value based on architectural significance, cultural significance, historic significance, as the work/product of an architect of note, its status as a contributing structure in a National Register Historic District, and/or as an intact or rare example of a certain architectural style or method of construction.*

The Commission may also provide a separate report regarding a property proposed for demolition to the Plan Commission. This report can further describe the historic value of the property outside of the language of the actions above.



# Demolition Listserve

<b>Date Request Submitted:</b>	11/29/22
<b>Request Status:</b>	APPROVED
<b>Date Processed:</b>	11/29/22
<b>Contact Information</b>	
<b>Name:</b>	
<b>Company/Organization:</b>	
<b>Address:</b>	
<b>Email:</b>	
<b>Primary Phone:</b>	
<b>Demolition Information</b>	
<b>Anticipated Application Date:</b>	12/15/22
<b>Type of Building:</b>	Commercial - Drive thru Bank
<b>Demolition Address:</b>	3809 E Washington Ave Madison, WI 53704
<b>Comments</b>	
<b>Applicant Comments:</b>	Hy-Vee is looking to demolition the drive thru bank on their property at the above address. The drive thru has been vacant for many years. They do not have a plan for this area at this time. The building and canopy would be taken down to finish floor grade. There is no basement. All site asphalt, concrete and landscaping will not be disturbed. It is being used by homeless people for an outdoor shelter and restroom area. Garbage and human feces have become a huge annoyance.



# Landmarks Commission Review

## PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

November 14, 2022

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Application Type: DEMOLITION REVIEW

Legistar File ID # [68860](#)

Prepared By: Meri Rose Ekberg, Community & Cultural Resources Planner

Date Prepared: November 9, 2022

### Summary

#### Relevant Ordinance Section:

28.185(7)4. The Plan Commission shall consider the report of the City's historic preservation planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report submitted by the Landmarks Commission.

#### 6604 Odana Road

Commercial building constructed in 1989.



Google Street View



Google Earth

**Applicant:** Randy Christianson, Walter Wayne Development

**Applicant's Comments:** N/A

**Staff Findings:** A preservation file for this property does not exist. There is no site file with the Wisconsin Historical Society. Previously the Market Square Cinema.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommends a finding of no known historic value.

## 6604 Odana Road

- Commercial building constructed in 1989.
- No City preservation file or WHS site file.



Google Street View



Google Earth

Staff finding: No known historic value.



# Buildings Proposed for Demolition

## Motions for Advisory Recommendation on Demolitions

- a. The Commission finds that the building(s) has no known historic value.
- b. The Commission finds that the building(s) has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, or as the work/product of an architect of note, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally or culturally significant.
- c. The Commission finds that the building(s) has historic value based on architectural significance, cultural significance, historic significance, as the work/product of an architect of note, its status as a contributing structure in a National Register Historic District, and/or as an intact or rare example of a certain architectural style or method of construction.



# Example: 609-617 E Dayton Street

- LC demolition review- 3/7/22
- PC recommended project work with LC to explore preservation options
- LC provided advisory recommendation on plans- 7/25/22





# Example: Johnson, State, Gorham Redevelopment

- LC provided detailed findings and discussion on historic value, 2/15/21
- Applicant integrated salvaged materials from the facades of historic value



# Example: 601 Bay View

- LC provided findings related to significant sculpture and Hmong cultural land uses- 11-11-19



Google Street View



Google Street View



Google Earth

# Example: 2412 Waunona Way

- Single-family home constructed in 1903
- No City preservation file or WHS site file
- Within the boundary of a known burial site- the Waunona mound grouping (DA-1403, BDA-0609)



Google Street View



Google Earth

Staff finding: Potential historic value related to vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the building itself is not architecturally or culturally significant. Archaeological site is historically and culturally significant to our tribal partners.



---

## Landmarks Commission's Role in Reviewing Demolition Requests

Plan Commission Special Work Session  
December 8, 2022