



Project Name & Address: 112 S Hancock Street
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and exterior alterations
Legistar File ID # [76796](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: March 28, 2023

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Doug Pahl, Aro Eberle Architects
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a dormer addition and exterior alterations.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is in the First Settlement Local Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
 - 2. The removal of historic features on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 - 3. The introduction of conjectural architectural features without historic precedent on the building is prohibited.
 - (c) Replacement

1. Existing features shall be replaced in-kind if they are too deteriorated to repair.
- (3) Exterior Walls
- (b) Wood
 1. Replacement siding shall imitate the original siding within one inch of historic exposure/reveal.
 2. Where more than one layer of siding exists on the structure, all layers except the first must be removed prior to re-siding.
 3. All trim must project beyond the face of the siding to the same extent it did with the historic siding.
 4. Wrapping of trim and ornament is prohibited.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) Openings
 1. A limited number of openings in walls above the foundation not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be filled in a manner that retains the original opening pattern and size, and is similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the surrounding wall.
 2. New window openings may be added to elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
 - (b) Sill and Head Height
 1. Infilling at the head or jambs is prohibited.
 2. The new or reconfigured openings shall have similar appearance to the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 3. The sills of historic window openings on elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be raised to serve bathrooms and kitchens.
 - (c) Windows
 7. New windows that are compatible with the historic character of the building may be reinstated in openings that had previously been filled in.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
- (a) Replacement
 1. An entire entrance or porch that is too deteriorated to repair shall be replaced using any available physical evidence or historic documentation as a model to reproduce the porch features.
 - (b) Porch Elements
 2. Accessible graspable railings may be added to stair railings and should be painted to match the associated railing.
 3. Spaces beneath porches and stairs shall be enclosed with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards, masonry, or other approved openwork design to allow ventilation.
 4. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.
- (7) Building Systems
- (a) Mechanical Systems
 1. Mechanical and service equipment shall be installed so that it is as unobtrusive as possible and does not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 1. Decorative light fixtures shall replicate the original in style and placement.
 2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.
 3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 - 1. New additions on the front of the principal structure are prohibited, except for restoring or reconstructing missing historic features that can be documented.
 - 2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
 - 3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
 - 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
 - 5. Rooftop additions, decks, terraces, and mechanical and service equipment shall be located to be set back from elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way in order to minimize its visibility and impact on the historic character of the building.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
 - 2. New additions that destroy significant historic materials or character-defining features are prohibited.
 - (c) Accessibility
 - 1. Whenever possible, access to historic buildings should be through a primary building entrance.
 - 2. Barrier-free access requirements shall be complied with in such a manner that the historic building's character-defining exterior features and features of the site and setting are preserved or impacted as little as possible.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 - 1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
 - 2. New site features (such as parking areas, access ramps, trash or mechanical equipment enclosures) shall be designed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible, retain the historic relationship between the building and the landscape, and are visually compatible with historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 - 1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.
 - (b) Wood
 - 1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 - 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
 - (b) Materials
 - 1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
 - 2. Any roofing materials shall be permitted on flat or slightly sloped roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - (f) Dormers
 - 1. Dormer additions not visible from the developed public right-of-way shall be permitted.
 - 2. Dormer additions visible from the developed public right-of-way shall be located on side roof slopes where the front edge of the dormer is no less than twelve (12) feet from the front edge of the roof.
 - 3. The ridge line of a dormer shall not extend above the ridge line of the main roof or extend beyond the face of the main structure wall below.

4. Dormer roof form, overhang, cladding, trim, and window shall be compatible with the character of the structure.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) General
 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
 2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
 1. Doors shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
 2. New door openings shall have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.
 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view and have a non-reflective coating.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
- (b) Balconies and Decks
 1. Rear yard decks shall be constructed so that they are not visible from the developed public right-of-way to which the building is oriented.
 2. Spaces beneath decks and stairs visible from the developed public right-of-way shall be screened.
 3. All parts of the deck or balcony, except the flooring and steps, shall be painted or opaquely stained.
 4. Projecting, partially projecting, and inset balconies are prohibited on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way.
- (7) Building Systems
- (a) Mechanical Systems
 1. A split system mechanical unit may be installed in a manner that will have minimal impact on the historic character and result in minimal loss of historic building material and shall be placed on an elevation not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 2. Installing mechanical equipment on the roof that is highly visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be placed in a location on an elevation not visible from the developed public right-of-way or on the roof. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way are prohibited, unless technically infeasible. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent materials.
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
 2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
 3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to construct a rear addition, replace existing dormers with larger dormers, rehab or replace existing siding, add new windows on the side, raise sill height on two windows to accommodate two kitchens, and modify the front porch to return it to a previous appearance. The building was constructed in 1905 and designed by Claude & Starck.

The building suffered a fire last year and as part of renovating the building, the property owner is looking to add units to the multi-unit structure. This will primarily involve alterations to the side windows; replacing the existing small dormers for larger ones; and an addition on the rear to accommodate increased space on the 3rd floor, an enclosed emergency egress, and an accessible ramp from the parking lot into the building. At some point the original siding was covered in vinyl. The proposal would remove the vinyl siding and either rehab the historic siding underneath or replicate if it is beyond repair. Finally, the existing front porch has evolved over time. The 1908 Sanborn shows a single-story porch, but by the 1942 Sanborn, the three-story porch is in place. Over time it has had several alterations. The proposal is to return it to a paneled railing appearance based upon 1970s photos. As part of the front porch rehab, the proposal is to introduce a window into a previously enclosed doorway, returning the front of the building to a more historic appearance.

Staff has been working with the applicant on the design to try and find solutions that would address the desire to add units to the building and also meet the historic district standards. While there is precedent on historic resources within 200 feet for the larger gable dormers, the shed-roof dormers proposed to run between the gable dormers does not appear to meet the standards and there is no historic precedent for this type of alteration.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. The proposed alterations are largely in keeping with the original design and character of the building with the exception of the shed dormers.
 - 2. No historic features are proposed to be removed.
 - 3. There are no proposed conjectural architectural features. The modification of the front porch will return it to a documented appearance.
 - (c) Replacement
 - 1. The front porch is deteriorated and has several design changes over time. The porch will be returned to its documented historic appearance.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (b) Wood
 - 1. The proposal is to remove the existing vinyl siding and see if the historic siding underneath is repairable. If not, then the proposal is to replicate the historic appearance based upon existing materials and historic photos.
 - 2. The proposal will remove the nonhistoric vinyl siding, which is in keeping with the requirements of this standard.
 - 3. If the historic siding is replaced, then all trim must project beyond the face of the siding to the same extent it did with the historic siding.
 - 4. Wrapping of trim and ornament is prohibited.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) Openings
 - 1. Two windows are proposed to be partially infilled to accommodate kitchens.
 - 2. New window openings on the East elevation will be minimally visible from the street and will replicate the appearance of an existing window on one of the projecting bays. A window is proposed to be introduced on the front in the location of an infilled doorway.
 - 3. The new openings are compatible with the overall design of the building.
 - (b) Sill and Head Height
 - 1. The proposal is not to infill the two kitchen windows at the head or jambs.
 - 2. The new or reconfigured openings have similar appearance to the historic windows of the structure.
 - 3. Windows on two levels located on the backside of projecting bays are proposed to be raised to accommodate the height of kitchen counters.

- (c) Windows
 - 7. A new window is proposed to be reinstated in a previously filled in doorway on the second floor of the front of the building.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (a) Replacement
 - 1. The proposed work on the porch will return it to a previously documented appearance.
 - (b) Porch Elements
 - 2. The graspable railing must be painted to match the associated railing.
 - 3. The spaces beneath the front porch are proposed to be enclosed with lattice.
 - 4. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.
- (7) Building Systems
 - (a) Mechanical Systems
 - 1. The submittal has no information on any new mechanicals. If there are new mechanicals as part of this project scope, it will need a Certificate of Appropriateness to ensure it is an unobtrusive as possible.
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 - 1. There is no information on any proposed exterior lighting. It will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.
 - 2. Any new exterior security lighting will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.
 - 3. Any exterior mounted conduit that would be visible from the street must be obscured by line-hide.
 - 4. There is no information on any new roof appurtenances. If they are to be a part of this project scope, it will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 - 1. The new stair and balcony addition is on the rear of the structure. The dormer additions are primarily addressed in the dormer standard in this section.
 - 2. The rear addition will feature a rear-facing gable to add space to the third floor, rear balconies, and an enclosed stair that will not project above the existing structure and will not be visible from the street. These modifications are in keeping with the character of the building. The new gable dormers are in keeping with the style of larger dormers found on other historic resources within 200 feet and are in keeping with the character of the building. The shed-roofed dormers located between the gable dormers do not have precedent and are not in keeping with the character of the building.
 - 3. The rear enclosed stair will be visually separated from the rest of the structure and the modification of the roof form on the rear will not change the overall roof appearance.
 - 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition are similar to those of the historic building.
 - 5. The dormer additions are stepped back from the front of the building.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. The addition work is on a non-character defining elevation and no historic features are impacted.
 - 2. No significant historic materials will be destroyed as part of this work.
 - (c) Accessibility
 - 1. The accessible entrance is proposed at the rear of the building, but it will be located so as to be used from the accessible parking stall onsite.
 - 2. The ramp into the building on the back of the structure does not impact the historic building's architectural character.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 - 1. The exterior additions are largely in keeping with the character of historic resources within 200 feet. The exception to this are the shed dormers proposed to span between the enlarged gable dormers.

2. The rear parking lot already exists, but the new work will bring the parking area up to current standards..
- (3) Exterior Walls
- (a) General
 1. The materials for the exterior walls will need to either be wood or a visually compatible alternative material. That material will need to be reviewed and approved by staff to ensure it meets the standards.
 - (b) Wood
 1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
- (a) General
 1. The rear-facing gable will have an identical pitch to the historic roof. The new gable dormers have a similar form and pitch to the historic gable dormers and are similar to dormers on historic resources. The shed-roof dormers are not similar to the roof forms on this historic building.
 - (b) Materials
 1. The roofing material will need to meet historic district standards. The application packet does not contain specifications for the proposed roofing.
 2. The only flat roofed areas are the balconies, which are addressed under the balcony standards.
 - (f) Dormers
 1. The new dormers are visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 2. The new dormers are located more than 20 feet from the front edge of the roof, in keeping with the requirements of this standard.
 3. The new dormers do not extend beyond the face of the structure and do not extend above the existing roof line.
 4. The shed dormers are not compatible with the historic roof form or character of the structure. The larger gable dormers are in keeping with the character of the structure and are in keeping with dormers on other historic resources in the vicinity. There is no information on the type of cladding.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) General
 1. The new window openings are compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
 2. The new openings appear to have similar dimensions, but there are no specifications for the windows, so it is unclear if their components are similar to historic windows.
 - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
 1. There are no specifications for the new exterior doors for the rear addition.
 2. The door opening appears to be of similar dimensions, but there are no specifications for type of door.
 3. It is unclear if there will be a storm door on the rear addition.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
- (b) Balconies and Decks
 1. The rear decks/balconies will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way to which the building is oriented.
 2. As the spaces beneath the rear balconies/decks are not visible from the street, they can remain open and unscreened.
 3. All parts of the deck or balcony, except the flooring and steps, shall be painted or opaquely stained. There are no specifications for the rear balconies/decks.
 4. The new rear decks are not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
- (7) Building Systems
- (a) Mechanical Systems
 1. There is no information on any new mechanical systems as part of this project. Any new mechanicals will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.
 2. Mechanicals should not be installed on the roof of this structure.

3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be placed in a location on an elevation not visible from the developed public right-of-way or on the roof. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way are prohibited, unless technically infeasible. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent materials.
- (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
1. There is no information on any proposed new lighting.
 2. Any new security lighting will need a Certificate of Appropriateness to ensure it is as unobtrusive as possible.
 3. Any exterior mounted conduit should be obscured behind line-hide.
 4. There is no information non any new roof appurtenances.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Submit updated plans that remove the shed-roof dormers from the design.
2. Final siding and trim specifications be approved administratively by staff. Siding and trim will need to replicate the appearance of the historic wood siding, not the current nonhistoric vinyl siding.
3. Final window specifications be approved by staff. All components will replicate the appearance of wood windows, with no wrapping of the of the window opening.
4. Final door, railing, porch, deck, and roofing materials specifications be approved administratively by staff.
5. Any exterior lighting or mechanicals proposed as part of this project scope will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.