



Project Name & Address: 1311 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Legistar File ID # [60542](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: May 26, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Valerie Kozel

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new front porch and replacement of five windows.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new front porch and replace five ground-floor windows. This building was constructed in 1887 and historically had a single-story porch that spanned the front of the building. While a mirror image of this house is next door, neither of them retain their historic front porches. Looking within 200 feet, the applicant is proposing to replicate a porch on 1315 Spaight. While that building was constructed in 1884 and very closely resembles the house at 1311 Jenifer, the current porch appears to date from the early 20th Century with Craftsman influences, including brick pedestals topped with tapered square columns. This is a modification that would have occurred within the period of significance of Third Lake Ridge and speaks to the evolution of buildings in the historic district. As there is a precedent for this type of porch on a similar building within the visually compatible area, their proposed new porch appears to meet the Third Lake Ridge standards for new construction on a street façade.

For the windows, it is unclear in the application how they are deteriorated beyond repair. It is unclear if these are the original windows, but they appear historic, likely dating to the 1910s at the latest. While the windows need repair, it is unclear why they need replacement. The commission's adopted procedure of review for window requests is that the applicant provide evidence of why the existing windows are physically beyond repair or not economically feasible to repair. This application does not provide that evidence. Staff would recommend that the applicant explore rehabilitating the existing windows. The rear windows have previously been repaired on the house and these five windows should also be repaired. If the sash pockets cannot be recovered, there are spring balances for use on historic windows. If the Landmarks Commission approves these windows for replacement, the proposed custom-made Marvin wood window sashes would replicate the existing and be an acceptable replacement.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A

- (c) The proposed work would need to meet the Third Lake Ridge Historic District standards.
- (d) Previous precedence and guidance from the City Attorney's Office is that retention of historic windows is in keeping with the standards of the preservation ordinance. Replacing historic windows when they could be repaired frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance by not conserving the historic building fabric.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. The height of the porch is in keeping with the single-story front porches found on historic resources within 200 feet.
 - 2. The landscape treatment will be visually compatible with other historic resources that have front porches.
 - 3. The porch design will replicate the rhythm of mass and spaces found on other historic resources with single-story front porches.
 - (b) The porch design will return the proportion of solids and voids on the street façade to a more historic condition. The proposed change of the windows would not alter the proportion of solids and voids on the street façade.
 - (c) In this instance, the historic fabric of the historic front porch is gone. The applicant is proposing to replicate the form of an existing porch on a similar building within 200 feet. Two of the windows proposed for replacement are on the street façade and should be retained by being repaired per this standard.
 - (d) No proposed changes to the roof of the structure, but the roof form of the new front porch will replicate the form and height of porches on other historic resources within 200 feet.
 - (e) No proposed changes to door and window sizes.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal with the following conditions:

- 1. Approval of the porch design as proposed
- 2. Rehabilitation of the 5 historic windows