

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

August 27, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 932 Spaight Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in a historic district.

Legistar File ID # 52811

Prepared By: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: August 20, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Karl Christel – Christel Properties/Kay Magnin – Power of Attorney

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for previously installed K style gutters.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located at 932 Spaight Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant had K-style gutters installed instead of half rounds without seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness, and is now requesting that the K-style gutters be approved. Recently, the Landmarks Commission considered a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace half round gutters with K-style gutters in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. However, in that case, the property owner did receive an administrative approval, but did not comply with the conditions of that approval. Although the Landmarks Commission approved that request, staff believe that the analysis of the standards for that case and in this case are the same as discussed below.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) N/A
 - b) N/A
 - c) The K-style gutters have a different profile and are not the original or historic element. This standard has been interpreted by the Commission in the past to mean “material” and “element”. Maintaining the specific metal of the half round gutter does not maintain the historic appearance. Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) (see c above)
 - e) N/A

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources. The installation of K-style gutters is an unfortunate loss of the historic appearance which may frustrate the public interest in protecting the vernacular character and appearance of the historic resource.

The K-style gutters are not similar to half round gutters in design, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Recommendation

Staff believe that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of K-style gutters are not met and recommends that the Commission deny the request.