

## AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> January 21, 2009
TITLE: 160 Westgate Mall – New Construction/Addition/Remodeling of Retail in Excess of 40,000 Square Feet; Hy-Vee Grocery Store/Westgate Mall. 20 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (12582)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
DATED: January 21, 2009	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Bruce Woods; Chair, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, Ald. Marsha Rummel, Ron Luskin, Dawn Weber, Mark Smith, Richard Wagner, Jay Ferm, and John Harrington.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of January 21, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of new construction and remodeling of retail in excess of 40,000 square feet for a Hy-Vee grocery store at 160 Westgate Mall. Appearing on behalf of the applicants were Pete Hosch, Henry A. Gempeler, John Brehm, John Lichtenheld, Jason Bost, David Schreiber, Bob Johnson, Marge Axelson, Matt Paske, John Schulte, and Bill Dunlop. The applicants described changes to the site circulation, including moving the entrance from Odana Road to the west and providing an access drive between the Hy-Vee building and the TJ Maxx building. They also described improvements proposed to Segoe Road and Odana Road as part of this project, noting that they are supported by the Traffic Engineering Division. The Hy-Vee building has been moved approximately 15-feet to the southeast. Revisions to the building elevations were also summarized, noting that all windows are real and that EIFS is used only on the parapet and upper level detailing. The proposed design for the south wall of the TJ Maxx building was also shown.

The Commission asked about whether the project met the requirements of the City's large format retail establishment ordinance. Hosch stated that the proposal does not meet all of them due to the economics of the project. Gempeler stated that the ordinance provides flexibility in applying the requirements to redevelopment sites.

The Commission discussion focused on the following issues:

- The relationships among facade elements – particularly on the front façade – such as the patterns of window mullion and scoring patterns in the precast stone.
- Alternatives for enhancing the site at the northwest corner of the building to make it more pedestrian friendly and provide a better outdoor cafe space.
- The need for more tree islands in the parking lot.
- Enhancements to the Segoe Road entrance.
- The importance of this project for the shopping center.

Ald. Thuy Pham-Remmele urged the Commission to approve the project because it is good for the shopping center and the community.

Chris Schmidt, and Denis Lamb (both representing the Midvale Heights Westmorland Joint Steering Committee) clarified that their neighborhoods recently received the revised plans and had not taken a formal position of them.

Registering in support were Gary Baldarota, Jim Rodman, John Schneider, Chris Schneider, Mary Lou Reerwand, Jeff Daniels, Terry Gulesarian, Mel Perttunen, and Scott Carlson. Registering as neither in support nor opposition were Judy Skog (representing the Midvale Heights Westmorland Joint Steering Committee) and Paul Haskew.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Luskin, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of new construction and remodeling of retail in excess of 40,000 square feet for a Hy-Vee grocery store at 160 Westgate Mall, subject to the following conditions as approved by staff:

1. Revising the architectural details of the front facade as discussed by the Commission.
2. Replacing some of the parking stalls at the northwest corner of the building with tree islands, and studying the use of a traffic table at the intersection of the two drive isles at this location.
3. Reducing the curb radii on the Odana Road driveway.
4. Adding an additional north-south row of tree islands in the parking lot.
5. Securing approval from the City to install landscaping in the park as shown.
6. Specifying the style of bicycle rack to be used.
7. Studying the installation of lighting along the south wall of the TJ Maxx building.
8. Studying treatments to make the Segoe Road access a more attractive entrance.
9. Signage must be approved by the Urban Design Commission.

The motion passed on a vote of (8-1-1) with Ferm voting no and Woods abstaining.

Prior to the prevailing motion, Ferm moved, seconded by Rummel, to grant initial approval with the plans to be revised to reflect the building, site and landscape details that were discussed at this meeting. That motion failed on a vote of (2-7-1) (Rummel, Weber, Barnett, Slayton, Harrington, Luskin and Wagner voted no, and Woods abstained).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6.5, 7 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 160 Westgate Mall**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	5	6	6	6	6	5	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	6.5	6	6	7	-	7	8	6.5
	6	6	5	-	-	6	7	6
	8	5	6	-	-	8	5	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	6	5	5	-	-	6	6	6

General Comments:

- It's all about the traffic and safety. Great idea to move building south and add drive lane and parking to north of building.
- Overall much improved but architecture not there yet.
- Revitalizing an aging mall with a grocery store is very exciting. Positive impact already considering all the people who attended the last three meetings.
- Key improvements OK!
- Site plan and traffic issues well considered and well resolved. Architectural issues not adequately considered.