AGENDA #4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PRESENTED: January 11, 2006

TITLE: 676 South Whitney Way – Whitney Square **REFERRED:**

- Exterior Remodeling in Urban Design REREFERRED:

District No. 3. 19th Ald. Dist.

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary ADOPTED: POF:

DATED: January 11, 2006 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Cathleen Feland, Robert March, Ald. Noel Radomski, and Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 11, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of exterior remodeling in Urban Design District No. 3 of a "planned commercial site" located at 676 South Whitney Way. Appearing on behalf of the project was Tim Knepprath. Staff noted to the Commission that consideration of the proposed renovations for the "Whitney Square" shopping center/planned commercial site were a follow-up to several previous proposals involving the renovation and/or addition to the existing shopping center reviewed by the Commission in previous years where issues with compliance to parking and landscaping provisions amongst other issues precluded approval of the project as previously proposed. Planning staff noted that the applicants, following extensive discussions with staff and Ald. Radomski, have sought to obtain approval of the project by the Urban Design Commission involving updating of the buildings' façades, alteration to both the landscaping and design of the parking lot to meet current code requirements, as well as address of issues with screening of loading/dumpster areas abutting Odana Road. Staff noted that favorable consideration of the project by the Commission would be followed up by a minor alteration to the existing conditional use for a planned commercial site development. Knepprath provided a presentation emphasizing upgrades to the west building featuring renovation of the façades of the major tenant spaces, in addition to replacing a uniform sign band currently constructed of wood siding with EIFS and the addition of decorative stones to cover columns of the existing building's front colonnade. On the south building, the same decorative stone siding will be provided on two main tower elements, combined with the replacement of the wood sign band with EIFS on the north and south elevation, as well as the addition of an EIFS sign band on the east and west elevations. The site improvements consist of adding decorative wood dumpster and loading screening. In addition, six landscaped islands have been provided within the parking area with additional landscaping provided throughout the modified surface parking lot to address code compliancy issues. Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Need to provide more detail on the south building's rear elevation in regards to fence screening for dumpsters and loading areas.
- Need to see how signage is to be rehandled along the Odana Road elevation.
- Restudy the use of stone to accent main entries to tenant spaces.

ACTION:

On a motion by Host-Jablonski, seconded by March, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion required that the applicant provide a site plan that shows existing versus proposed conditions relevant to the reconfigured surface parking lot and landscape plan, complete building elevation details, in addition to providing full details on existing proposed site lighting, including photometrics and fixture cut sheets.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 676 South Whitney Way

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	1	1	1	-	-	1	6
	6	5	-	-	5	5	5	5
	5	5	5	5	5	-	4	5
	-	6	-	-	7	-	4	5.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	5	5	6	6	5	5
	-	5	-	-	5	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Improvement, but may look dated soon; EIFS treatment not "there" yet.
- Looks like too many other strip malls not distinctive. Need to see detailed landscaping and site lighting and solution for Odana Road signs.
- Too much beige EIFS?
- An improvement, but not much of one.
- Inadequate submittal. Need info on the important Odana Road elevation, and the parking lot improvements.
- Need to see south and east elevations.