

AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 16, 2009
TITLE: 1252 Williamson Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for a Mixed-Use Building with 31 Residential Units and 2,400 Square Feet of Commercial Space. 6 th Ald. Dist. (15686)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 16, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 16, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** on a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1252 Williamson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Randy Bruce, representing Scott Lewis/CMI Management, Inc.; and Ken Saiki, representing Ken Saiki Design.

Bruce and Saiki provided details as to the modifications as follows:

- The Baldwin Street elevation features the addition of a base treatment of Renaissance Stone interspersed with rusticated and smooth finishes along with the addition of vertical piers up from the base to tie into the upper balconies with the entry treatment features that include the addition of stone piers as well as an overhead entry canopy along with Renaissance Stone accents to enhance its appearance.
- The Baldwin Street elevation features the addition of two projecting bays combined with incorporation of a lower-level balcony feature tying back to the stone base treatment.
- The corner element of the building has been modified to feature the use of brick extended around from the brick treatment on the Williamson Street façade in addition to a slightly projecting window bay treatment on the upper elevations. Introduction of this feature eliminates the previous proposed cantilever feature at the corner with the elimination of other cantilevered features along the Williamson Street façade.
- Review of the landscape plan noted adjustments to street trees to reflect existing and proposed street tree plantings in the right-of-way, a redesign of the rear surface parking lot, a rain garden detail, along with enhancements of the landscape buffer at the rear of the property and foundation plantings.
- A previously proposed wing wall off of the southerly corner of the Williamson Street façade has been replaced with an extended trellis perpendicular to the street and side patio feature.

Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- Miss cantilevers on projecting bays.
- Corner treatment much better without cantilever, but like cantilever on bays along the remainder of the Williamson Street elevation.

- The modifications to the building at 1246 Williamson Street should provide for replacement of windows back into the front façade's bay feature.
- The landscaping is great, but miss the cantilever features. Their removal provides for a loss of playfulness at the street where adjustments to the metal panels don't work projecting down vertically on the Williamson Street elevation.
- Make projecting bays on the Baldwin Street elevation narrow to give more verticality.
- If the Williamson Street façade metal paneling stays as currently proposed; fenestration needs to be reworked on the upper elevation.
- Shape of rain garden; a bean just sitting there; it should relate to the round shape of the patio. In addition, the prairie drop seed plantings should emphasize the use of purple and yellow. Use of *Ostrya virginiana* has salt sensitive issues. Use Burr Oak instead of Pin Oak; faster growing.
- Talk with the Parks Department Street Trees Division to use canopy trees along Baldwin Street.
- The Baldwin Street elevation still feels detached; play with windows and other features to bring down to the walk.
- Too bad the cantilever can't be maintained on the new corner brick treatment.
- Consider using glazed block in the base.
- The trellis looks tacked on on the Williamson Street elevation.
- Like the previous arch feature as before instead of the trellis.
- The previous archway treatment vs. the trellis created a better separation between private and public.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Luskin, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion provided:

- That the rain garden needs to be redesigned with a more deliberate form. Suggestions to relate to the configuration of the adjoining patio.
- The encouragement for the Parks Street Trees Division to utilize canopy trees along the Baldwin Street elevation.
- Detail and study the design for the trellis feature vs. the archway feature off of the southern corner of the building along Williamson Street.
- Provide for the use of more yellow and purple within the prairie drop seed mix.
- Reincorporate the use of cantilevers where possible along the Williamson Street elevation.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7, 7, 7.5, 7.5, 8, 8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1252 Williamson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7.5	7.5	7.5	-	-	7.5	8	7.5
	7	7	6	-	-	-	7	7
	6	6	6	-	-	6	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8
	9	7	7	7	-	8	9	8
	6	7	7	6	-	-	8	7
	6	7	6.5	-	-	-	7	7
	8	8	7	-	-	7	8	8

General Comments:

- Well done. Fits the site well. Study the modern versus historic reference.
- Excellent infill project. This will look right at home on Willy Street. Nicely done.
- Great fit with site. Wish architecture was more playful, contemporary.
- The “cants” can! In the context of Willy Street, playful is good. Baldwin Street is more grounded, but still needs something to bring the interest down to the sidewalk.
- Interesting architecture – punchy landscape but rain garden shape seems like an after-thought.
- Contributes to improvement commercial corner in historic district. Nice architecture, improved parking lot landscaping. Still unresolved is archway/trellis entry to residential and whether corner is canted.