



Project Name & Address: 1424 Rutledge
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an exterior alteration in a historic district
Legistar File ID # [51826](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: May 30, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Linda Puls
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for front porch repairs and window replacements in the.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) NA
 - (b) NA
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- 41.25 MARQUETTE BUNGALOWS HISTORIC DISTRICT**
- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.
 - (f) Windows and Doors.
 1. General Standards. The original appearance of leaded glass and other non-rectangular decorative windows (e.g., curved top windows) on any facade of the structure shall be retained. Replacement of such windows shall duplicate the original in size, configuration and appearance. Picture windows are prohibited. Trim on new or remodeled windows shall match the original window trim on the structure.

2. Street Facades. Windows and doors on the front or street facade of the structure and on side faces within ten (10) feet of the front facade of the structure shall retain their original or existing appearance, including true muntins where they exist. Replacement windows and doors may be approved if they match the original appearance.
 3. Non-Street Side Facades. Retention of the original appearance of windows and doors on the sides of the structure is encouraged. However, if replacement or new windows are proposed, the muntin design of the original windows on the structure may either be replicated with true-divided lights or with exterior or interior applied grids or with grids applied between the panes of glass. New windows shall either be casement windows or double-hung windows. Sash on new windows over four (4) feet square shall be divided by muntins or mullions. Bay windows may be approved if they have sides perpendicular to the wall and if they do not extend beyond the eaves of the roof.
 4. Rear Facade. Replacement, remodeling or installation of new doors and windows on the rear facade will not be restricted except as discussed under "General Standards" above.
- (g) Porches. Porches and stairway railings shall match the original railings in appearance wherever possible. Wrought iron railings with vertical balusters at least one-half (½) inch in width, wood railings with vertical square balusters spaced no more than three (3) inches apart, and solid wall railings covered in siding to match the structure will be approved. Other designs may be permitted if they blend with the character of the structure and the district. Porches may be enclosed with windows or screens provided that new windows be casements or double-hung units similar in proportion to other windows on the structure. Steps may be constructed of wood, concrete or brick. If wood is used, steps shall have risers and be enclosed on the sides by lattice or a wing wall. Rear yard decks shall have a railing as described above, shall have the underside screened by lattice or evergreen shrubs, and all parts of the deck, except the flooring and steps, shall be painted or opaque-stained in a color to blend with the colors on the structure.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed alterations include repairs to the front porch and the replacement of windows.

41.18 (1)(c) instructs the Commission refer to 41.25. The standards that relate to the exterior alterations include 41.25 (5)(f) relating to windows and (g) relating to porches. A brief discussion of those standards follows:

- (f) According to the submission materials, the front porch repairs will be made in-kind so the existing tongue and groove flooring will be replaced with tongue and groove flooring to match the existing in dimension and appearance. In addition, the existing wood board on top of the knee wall will be replaced with a new wood board that matches the existing in dimension and edge profile.
- (g) According to the submission materials, the applicant is proposing the replacement of 8 original wood sash windows. The proposed replacement units are Marvin clad exterior units with 7/8" muntin grilles used in the top sash to replicate the three existing vertical lights.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. The alterations made to structures in historic districts should be carefully evaluated to ensure retention of historic significance and character in the district. The proposed work is being requested as a means to protect and promote

the historic resource. The removal of historic fabric (windows in particular) is unfortunate, but allowed by the ordinance.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations (front porch repairs and window replacements) are met and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted.