



**Project Name & Address:** 644 N Frances, Delta Upsilon Fraternity House  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations on a landmark site  
**Legistar File ID #** [51827](#)  
**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** May 30, 2018

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Laura Davis, Isthmus Architecture  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations including brick and stone repair and restoration on a landmark site.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The landmark site is located at 644 N Frances fronting Lake Mendota.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) NA
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## Analysis and Conclusion

41.18 (1)(a) instructs the Commission refer to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. A brief discussion of the applicable standards for the masonry restoration and related alterations follows:

1. The property is being used as it was originally and the proposed work is attempting to preserve the defining characteristics of the building.
2. The removal of the original historic materials in specific areas where the materials are deteriorated, will allow the character of the building to be retained and preserved. The deteriorated historic materials are being removed and replaced with appropriate replacement materials.
3. Conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings are not being added.
4. Not applicable.
5. The distinctive features, finishes, and examples of craftsmanship that characterize this landmark property will be preserved. In areas where materials have deteriorated, the materials will be replaced in-kind to match the existing material in every aspect.
6. The severity of deterioration requires replacement of brick and cast stone and the reconstruction of some gable walls and the chimney tops. The reconstructed features will match the old features in design, color, texture, materials, and other visual qualities.
7. The submission materials do not indicate the use of chemical or physical treatments.
8. Not applicable.
9. The proposed exterior alterations will restore the exterior materials that characterize the property. The new work will be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. Not applicable.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. The alterations made to landmark structures should be carefully evaluated to ensure retention of historic

significance and character. The proposed restoration of the exterior masonry and related materials will preserve that significance and character.

## **Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior masonry restoration and related exterior alterations are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request.