

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: March 22, 2006
TITLE: 2801-3101 North Sherman Avenue and 1725-1865 Northport Drive – Comprehensive Design Review of Signage. 12 th Ald. Dist.	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: March 22, 2006	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lisa Geer, Lou Host-Jablonski, Cathleen Feland, Jack Williams, Robert March and Ald. Noel Radomski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 22, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review of signage for the “Northside Town Center” (formerly Sherman Plaza) located at 2801-3101 North Sherman Avenue and 1725-1865 Northport Drive. Appearing on behalf of the project were Donald Bruns, Dave Bruns, Jeff Solner and Ald. Paul Van Rooy (representing the adjoining aldermanic district). A letter in support of the request from Ald. Brian Benford was distributed to the Commission. Prior to the presentation, staff noted to the Commission that consideration of enlargements and modifications to the two ground signs currently located at the former Sherman Plaza were the subject of a previous “comprehensive design review” granted by the Commission to provide for their current size. The current proposal features the following:

- On the property’s Northport Drive frontage a 23-foot high and 10-foot wide tenant ground sign featuring the “Sherman Plaza” identifying graphic is to be replaced with a three tiered wide/section ground sign at a combined width of 26-feet at a center height of 18-feet. The graphic as proposed identifies the former Sherman Plaza as the “Northside Town Center” at the center/highest portion of the sign, with a Pierce’s Market graphic underlying, along with individual tenants’ signage on its winged extensions.
- An existing 23’ high by 10’ wide ground sign located along the property’s North Sherman Avenue frontage is proposed at the same dimensions and features Pierce’s Market as its main graphic, with smaller accessory tenant signage listed below.
- A third smaller ground sign is proposed at the center’s southerly driveway entry off of North Sherman Avenue identifying “Northside Town Center”.

Prior to discussion by the Commission on the signage package, staff noted that the third ground sign would not be permitted under the provisions of the Street Graphics Control Ordinance with the Commission having no authority to approve it as currently designed. Staff noted that the ground sign could be modified under the provisions of the Street Graphics Control Ordinance to be considered as a parking lot regulation sign which is limited to 9 square feet in size according to the code; where the Commission could grant a variance to approve the size of the graphic as proposed as part of its consideration of the signage package. Staff noted that one of the wall graphics would not be allowed under the provisions of the ordinance based on its location on a tower element disconnected from the relevant tenant space for “Pierce’s Market”. Staff felt that the wall graphic for

the “Northside Town Center” would be appropriate since the tower element on which it is proposed was a common element to the overall architectural façade of the shopping center.

Following the presentation the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- The proposed Northport Drive ground sign is too large with the extensions on the main portion of the sign looking too cluttered.
- Generally speaking signage is well done and fits with architectural elements of the center.
- Relative to the Northport sign, the center top feature for the Northside Town Center should repeat the peak element treatment as proposed for the North Sherman Avenue ground sign. In addition, support the parking regulation sign.
- Eliminate wing walls on the Northport Drive sign and incorporate tenant signage below by making the overall sign taller.
- Consider taking off the Town Center graphic on the Northport Drive side of the center to get more tenant signage and make both signs alike within their overall appearance and top treatment.
- The Northport sign should be consistent at the top and be branded the same as proposed with Sherman Avenue.

ACTION:

On a motion by Host-Jablonski, seconded by Geer, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion to approve provided for the following:

- The top treatment on both the Northport Drive and Sherman Avenue ground signs should be as proposed with the Sherman Avenue sign and match.
- Change parking regulation sign to refer to the parking with the size of the sign approved as proposed.
- The Northport Drive ground sign shall come back for further consideration with elimination of the winged extensions. Consideration of increased height if necessary and the same top treatment as the Sherman Avenue sign or the applicant is to return for consideration of a new proposal.
- The Sherman Avenue wall sign proposed on the tower element identifying the Northside Town Center is approved on either face of the tower element.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6, 6 and 8.