

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: February 15, 2012
TITLE: 636 West Wilson Street; 633 & 639 West Doty Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for West End Apartments, Five-Story Building With 60 Residential Units. 4 th Ald. Dist. (24852)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: February 15, 2012	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Melissa Huggins, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Melissa Huggins and Henry Lufler.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 15, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 636 West Wilson Street and 633 & 639 West Doty Street. Appearing and speaking on behalf of the project were Lance McGrath, Paul Cuta, Marc Shellpfeffer and Patrick Hannon. McGrath gave an overview of the project and noted the change in name to 640 West. The site is currently an empty gravel lot which requires no demolition. The building is four levels of residential with two levels of parking, the first level being at grade effectively making this a 5-story building, which is compatible with the Downtown Plan, for a total of 69 units. Seventy-two parking stalls for automobiles and 90 bicycle stalls are proposed. They are working with Focus on Energy to make this as energy efficient as possible. They've been working with the Bassett Neighborhood and have received positive feedback. Cuta talked about this being an energy site where the urban fabric meets the rail corridor/bike path. The site bridges two streets which gives the building a 360° view. The first item tackled was access to the site, initially on Doty Street and eventually on Wilson Street. The entry plaza at the southeast corner is the main entry to the building, it allows a fire truck to pull up and it provides a loading zone for the building. The expansive concrete is broken up with a series of planters with different finishes in the concrete to make that more interesting and lively. Materials from the plaza will be tied into the building walls and accents. A bio-filtration area catches all the roof stormwater and much of the water from the site, which overflows to West Doty Street. Cuta touched on the creation of interesting architecture in relation to the site. As you approach on West Wilson to the main entry, an orange colored metal "L" shaped skin catches your attention and holds the scale to the bike path, giving that elevation layers. Comments from the previous meeting talked about opening up the entry so it is more identifiable; the orange becomes the component that identifies public or key spaces in the building. The darker masonry materials going up the building reveals more of the standing seam metal and shimmer that plays with the light and texture created by the shadows. This creates a rhythm along the bike path. At the north end of the building there is a separate entrance dedicated to bicycle storage with the possibility of a bicycle workshop. The garages will be similar to Nolen Shores, allowing light to spill out of the garage space as a glow while not having to see all the storage inside the garages. Signage proposed would be identification from Proudfit Street with backlit cut aluminum letters in a vertical read. The entry has two sign areas reading "640 West" and some building numbering on the cast concrete wall. Both signs on the building would be backlit for a glow effect. All the apartments have

exterior space, differing in size and elevation given the step down of the building and breaking down the scale on the residential fabric side of the building.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- I'm going to challenge you to rethink the arborvitae. Maybe you can combine some other grasses; the arborvitae may have this mass that doesn't enhance the building and the building isn't really going to be buffered by it. Play with grasses that will have more movement.
- Concrete 4'x4' squares would be more appropriate than stone steppers for this project, placed somewhat arbitrary, maybe with partial hedges. A stepper is too residential for the power of this building.
- I like the project. I would suggest, because of your strong geometric form, I would make the path more geometric. Canopy trees would help that hedge line and play with those linear bays of plant material.
- The building is so strong. It has its spirit, it's industrial in terms of materials, it's almost refining the angles of your landscape to reflect more of that industrial quality of the site and "toughen it up" a little bit. The motion implied in the architecture and followed up with the landscaping is wonderful.
- Is there any way to make the concrete pad smaller?
 - It's required for the hose movement so we need to provide a 20-foot wide condition that is hardscape that can handle a fire truck. The paving will be a mixture of colors and won't be just a broom finish concrete. The idea is to create a better texture in the plaza area.
 - The placement of the railroad corridor also dictates where the concrete pad is placed.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by O'Kroley, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0). The motion required address of the above landscape comments.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7.5, 8, 9 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 636 West Wilson/633 & 639 West Doty Streets

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	-
	6	8	6	-	-	6	8	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	9
	8	8	6.5	7	7	7	8	7.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	9

General Comments:

- Outstanding character and motion to this building, true to the site. As you define landscape in the same dialog as the architecture, consider angle of accent bands ———> City. Grid or industrial grid? Treating loading/drop-off differently accentuates path to entry and not through site. Consider use of lighting/metal on the grand plane to continue the reflecting of the iron spot/metal.
- Great project.
- Excellent.
- Nice addition to this area.
- Orchid!