



Agenda Item #: 5
Project Title: Buildings Proposed for Demolition
Legistar File ID #: 81161
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner
Members: Present: Edna Ely-Ledesma, Ald. Amani Latimer Burris, Jacob Morrison, and Maurice Taylor
Excused: Richard Arnesen, Molly Harris, and Katie Kaliszewski

Summary

Kurt Stege, registering in opposition and wishing to speak

Stege spoke in opposition to the demolition of three buildings on a pristine block of State Street, which has been identified as Madison's premiere street. They said that in 2022, the Madison Trust for Historic Preservation voted unanimously to oppose the demolition of these buildings. That vote was taken shortly after the Landmarks Commission had reviewed the buildings and recommended to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 428-430 State Street and 432-436 State Street have historic value based on their status as contributing structures in a potential National Register Historic District, and the building at 440-444 State Street has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment and its intact condition. They also noted Chair Kaliszewski's comments at the January 31, 2022 meeting that the building at 440-444 State Street has likely gained significance because the National Register district had been evaluated over 20 years ago, so it would now be considered contributing. She had also pointed out that the building had great integrity. They also referenced former Commissioner McLean's comments that the building at 440-444 State Street was very intact and appeared to have its original building materials and window systems. They asked the commission to reach the same conclusion that the Landmarks Commission had reached in their 2022 review of the properties, with the addition that 440-444 State Street has historic value based on its historic significance and that it could be a contributing structure to a National Register Historic District.

For the buildings at 428-430 State Street and 432-436 State Street, Ekberg said that staff recommended a finding of historic value based on their status as contributing structures to a potential National Register Historic District.

For the building at 440-444 State Street, Ekberg said that staff recommended a finding of historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment and its intact condition.

Morrison requested clarification that staff's recommendation was that 428-430 and 432-436 State Street fit demolition criterion c and 440-444 State Street fits demolition criterion b. Ekberg confirmed this was correct, noting that the recommendation was identical to the Landmarks Commission's 2022 finding for the three buildings. Morrison said he agreed with staff's recommendation.

Ekberg said that the building at 702 E Washington Avenue, originally Kayser Motors, was designed by architects Claude and Starck; however, it has undergone significant alterations over time, resulting in a loss of historic integrity. She said that staff recommended a finding of historic value as the product of an architect of note, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant due to the loss of integrity.

Morrison said that while the building was designed by Claude and Starck and was a perfectly fine building in its previous configuration, it has been so heavily remodeled that what little significance it had has been lost and does not represent much of a link to Claude and Starck. He said that he thought this fit demolition criterion a. Ely-Ledesma agreed that the architectural integrity has been lost.

Ekberg said that staff recommended a finding of no known historic value for the buildings at 6402 Femrite Drive and 4701 Ellestad Drive.

Action

A motion was made by Morrison, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 428-430 State Street and 432-436 State Street have historic value based on their status as contributing structures in a potential National Register Historic District, and the building at 440-444 State Street has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment and its intact condition, which could make it contributing to a potential National Register Historic District. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Morrison, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 702 E Washington Avenue has no known historic value due to a loss of historic integrity.

A motion was made by Morrison, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 6402 Femrite Drive has no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Ely-Ledesma, seconded by Morrison, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 4701 Ellestad Drive have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 1/31/22

TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2022

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 2/7/22

ID NUMBER: 68860

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Ald. Arvina Martin, David McLean, and Maurice Taylor.

SUMMARY:

Kurt Stege, registering in opposition and wishing to speak

Kevin Burow, registering in support and available to answer questions

Bailey provided background information on the buildings at 428-430 State Street, 432-436 State Street, and 440-444 State Street. The buildings at 428-430 State and 432-436 State are considered contributing to the potential State Street National Register Historic District.

Kaliszewski asked when the potential State Street historic district had been assessed. Bailey said that the nomination was in the 1990s, so the 50-year historic period has shifted since then. Kaliszewski said that because the potential historic district was evaluated 20 years ago, the building at 440-444 State Street has likely gained significance in that time and would now be considered contributing to the district. She pointed out that the building has great integrity.

Stege, speaking as an individual not representing an organization, said that State Street is under tremendous development pressures, and they would hate to see two more significant buildings be demolished. They suggested there should be a responsibility on the part of the developer to complete an assessment on the historic structure and submit it with their demolition request.

Burow was not present to answer questions.

Arnesen suggested the buildings at 428-430 State Street and 432-436 State Street fit demolition criterion c and the building at 440-444 State Street fits demolition criterion b. Martin agreed and said she was worried about doing harm to a contributing building. Arnesen pointed out that 432-436 State looks like it has been modified over time.

Andrzejewski said that while there might be some changes, the buildings are older and some of the only commercial buildings left, so they are really important in representing our Progressive-era history.

Kaliszewski agreed with Arnesen's assessment because the buildings at 428-430 and 432-436 State Street were identified as contributing structures in the potential National Register Historic District. She reiterated that the building at 440-444 State Street has likely gained significance to be considered contributing to the historic district since it was last evaluated in the 1990s.

McLean agreed that 440-444 State Street was very intact and appeared to have its original 1962 building materials and window systems, which is significant.

Martin asked if there were further attempts to officially recognize State Street as a historic district. Bailey said that there has been disinterest amongst property owners to move forward with such a district.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Arnesen, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 428-430 State Street and 432-436 State Street have historic value based on their status as contributing structures in a potential National Register Historic District. The building at 440-444 State Street has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment and its intact condition. The motion passed by voice vote/other.