

AGENDA # 9.

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 19, 2005
TITLE: 802 Williamson Street – PUD, Building Material Changes	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 19, 2005	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner (Chair), Bruce Woods, Lou Host-Jablonski, Lisa Geer, Ald. Noel Radomski, Todd Barnett, Cathleen Feland, Robert March and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 19, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a change in building materials for a previously-approved PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 802 Williamson Street. John Sutton, project architect, stated that he apparently misunderstood the Commission’s previous action on this matter. He clarified the areas where he is proposing to use EIFS, noting that they will be away from public areas on the lower levels. He stated that the contractor believes that the cement board will crack in this application. The panel system being proposed incorporates a heavier mat overlapped by a lighter mat and is more durable than typical systems. Ald. Judy Olson submitted an email in support of the change.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Host-Jablonski, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a change in building materials for a previously approved PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 802 Williamson Street. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-2) with Barrett and Barnett voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6, 6, 7 and 7, with 3 abstentions from the rating process.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 802 Williamson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	-
	7	7	7	-	-	7	7	7
	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7

General Comments:

- Material substitution.
- EIFS material approval only.
- EIFS does not belong in the historic 6th district.
- Very, very disappointing. Pedestrian.
- Oh well, more EIFS.
- Enhanced strength EIFS cladding does not have the crisp detailing of the original approved design, but is overall approvable.
- This limited use of EIFS acceptable.