



# City of Madison

City of Madison  
Madison, WI 53703  
www.cityofmadison.com

## Meeting Minutes - Approved DOWNTOWN COORDINATING COMMITTEE

---

Thursday, August 16, 2018

5:30 PM

210 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.  
Room 108 (City-County Building)

---

### CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

**Present:** 8 - Michael E. Verveer; Ledell Zellers; Gregory O. Frank; Adam J. Plotkin; Ted Crabb; David Ahrens; Lori J. Henn and Al Martin  
**Excused:** 1 - Sandra J. Torkildson

### APPROVAL OF July 19, 2018 MINUTES

A motion was made by Zellers, seconded by Frank, to Approve the July 19, 2018 Minutes. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

None

### DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

None

1. [50087](#) Report of Mall Maintenance and Special Events 2018

Chad Hughes, Parks Mall Maintenance Staff, highlighted Mall Maintenance Staff's work with Traffic Engineering to map out the electrical breakers to be able to turn off electrical outlets without turning off the street lights. Hughes added that two additional staff will be attending the salt-wise training this year to continue to improve salt operations.

Crabb asked about the some of the parked cars and trucks on State Street. Rebecca Cnare, Planning staff, said that some additional business owners and delivery driver education is on a long list of things that she and Tiffany Kenney have been wanting to explore, but haven't made progress in light of other emerging issues.

**At the request of the chair, the Committee agreed to take agenda Item #3 out of order.**

3. [51965](#) Policy Discussion about transforming existing sidewalk cafes using encroachment agreements and/or leases, to a regular sidewalk cafe licenses

Meghan Blake-Horst, Street Vending Coordinator gave a brief introduction on her work to change existing leases and encroachment agreements to regular sidewalk cafes. There are three main agreements that she is negotiating this year; Argus, Topsy Cow and Genna's. State Street Brats and another cafe outside of the downtown are outliers that have more complicating factors that will take longer to sort out.

Zellers asked if the café footprint will be different than what they are currently using. Blake-Horst said that the new licensed cafes will be approximately the same as they are today under the leases/ encroachment agreements. Zellers said that was different than what she expected when they approved the policy to allow restaurant owners to convert some of the existing planters into café/planter areas. Cnare said that she believed that the policy change did not affect existing cafes/agreements, and only provided a way to move forward. She added that staff had discussed how to retroactively change back some of the planters if there was a change in use, or a construction project, but that it was a complicated issue to take back space, and staff didn't include that part of the proposal in their final recommendation. Zellers wanted to discuss this further with more information.

**A motion was made by Zellers, seconded by Ahrens, to Refer to a future DOWNTOWN COORDINATING COMMITTEE meeting when they could have additional information. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

2. [52535](#)

Creating Section 28.022 - 00338 and Section 28.022 - 00339 of the Madison General Ordinances to change the zoning of properties generally located at 118-126 State Street, 4th Aldermanic District, from DC (Downtown Core) District to PD(GDP-SIP) (Planned Development (General Development Plan, Specific Implementation Plan)) District.

**Planning Staff gave a brief overview and reminder of the Committee's purpose and duties to help guide them in a recommendation that fits with their mission.**

**Eric Nordeen, Matt Prescott and Jeff Vercauteren presented the proposed Hotel project, and noted other examples of Provenance Hotels across the nation.**

Zellers said that the Downtown Plan height map specifically refers to stories and not floor to floor height equivalencies; noting that 6 stories is the upper limit on what the plan recommends. Nordeen said that in the zoning code, which also includes the height map, six stories are equivalent to 88 feet in height.

Henn said that the 100 block of State Street has had its challenges, and asked if the hotel operator was aware of these issues. Nordeen said that Provenance Hotels operates other hotels with equally challenging environments, and often has a catalytic effect on the areas around it. Vercauteren added that the 24/7 staffed valet service will help bring eyes on the street.

Martin said that much of the information on how the building interacts with the public realm is not shown on the drawings presented this evening. He said that vague promises and suggestions of a widened sidewalk, valet service and sidewalk café are not detailed out in the drawings. It is impossible to judge how the project will interact with the sidewalk and public space, as described by the mission of the DCC without these details. Vercauteren said that some of those details were discussed at the Informational presentation to the Transportation Commission.

Zellers noted the Tangible Retail Strategy Report, and its recommendation that small retail spaces are needed to help maintain a healthy balance of retail uses on State Street. The removal of several small spaces for one large restaurant use seems counter-productive to that recommendation. Frank said that he appreciates Zellers comments, but believes that the hotel will have a positive influence on adjacent retail uses, especially those who are struggling. Nordeen said that the hotel will enliven the adjacent retail.

Zellers said that she walks on Carrol Street many times a day, and is concerned about the deliveries increasing on an already crowded sidewalk. Nordeen said that the plans show that a box truck can back up completely into the building, and that the team has been arranging to use many of the same vendors as the hotel across the street, and estimates that there will be approximately 6-9 deliveries per day.

Zellers asked about bike and car parking operations. Nordeen said that they will have a bike valet that is open to the public, free of charge. Nordeen said that they have been in talks with several nearby garages and have committed that the letters-of-intent with parking garages for approximately 80 parking spaces will be in place before final approval.

Mike Herring, Madison, spoke in support and said that he is a former planner who thinks that this is a transformational project and that the 24/7 activity will greatly improve the area.

Fred Mohs, Madison, spoke in opposition and said that a lot of time and energy went into the highly detailed Downtown plan which was a shared vision of a future downtown. No project has breached the height map until this request, and if approved, it will completely change the economics of State Street and put the rest of State Street in danger.

Tim Harrington, Madison, spoke in support and said that as a downtown resident he is disappointed in the decay of upper State Street, and believes that this hotel will become iconic.

Franny Ingebretsen, Madison, spoke in opposition and said that the Downtown height map was meant to be a proactive tool for development. She added that the Downtown height map specifically uses stories and that the development team continually misrepresents the height limits when converting it to feet.

Sam Chehade, Madison, spoke in support and said that as an adjacent business owner, this design is not as intrusive as some seem to think. He added that this project is necessary for the safety of State Street, and that the valet and other activity will greatly reduce the criminal elements at the top of State Street. Frank asked if he feels it will have a positive impact on businesses. Chehade said that he has spoken with other business owners and that they all feel like this will help their businesses. Verveer asked if Chehade was worried about parking and traffic issues. Chehade said that he is not worried about added traffic and he hopes this development will put pressure on the properties across the street to improve themselves. He added that he mostly takes deliveries off of State Street.

Verveer asked the development team for more information about their preliminary meeting with the Transportation Commission. Nordeen said they propose that guests arriving by private car will use the Carroll entrance, and guests arriving by taxi/Uber will likely use the Dayton entrance. They propose to modify the street and parking configuration on Carroll Street to remove the perpendicular parking for three parallel 10-minute valet loading areas, and one ADA parking space. They would like to widen the sidewalk to enhance the pedestrian experience on Carroll Street. Verveer said that he saw a drawing

that showed double parked loading areas, and wanted assurance that that was not being proposed. Nordeen said that there will only be three parallel loading spaces directly adjacent to the curb.

Henn asked the developers about the height of the existing building that is proposed for demolition. Nordeen said it is approximately 75 feet.

Martin said that these ideas that are being talked about are not shown on the provided drawings, and will very clearly affect the right-of-way and interaction with the public realm, making it impossible to review your proposal. Frank said that this is difficult, as it is the first development proposal that this committee has seen and he doesn't want to make up the rules as they go. Verveer said that Martin has a valid point and agreed that the sidewalk width, valet podium location, sidewalk café and other details are things that are within this body's mission, and the decisions made by Transportation Committee will greatly affect the pedestrian experience.

Verveer asked if a new traffic light at Carroll has ever been discussed. Vercauteren said that hasn't been an issue with Transportation, and believes that the light at Wisconsin Avenue gives a good break for pedestrians.

Verveer said that he thinks the design has progressed really nicely, but that he is concerned about setting a precedent for taller heights. He said that the developer has been saying that the height map has been pierced three times, but he wanted to point out that both the Uncommon (Lark) and Marriott A/C hotel were approved through a mechanism of allowable bonus stories. He believes that the Pressman is the only project that has gotten approval for a height taller than the height map.

Verveer added that there are two facades that really aren't being shown, and that are largely blank due to building code issues. He asked if the developer has made any progress in securing development rights from adjacent properties in order to get windows on those facades as well. Nordeen said that they have been in discussions, and that they have always wanted to add windows, and while they do not have current agreements, he said the door isn't closed on that idea.

Zellers asked about the valet service, and wanted the developers to commit to only having a maximum of three cars in the loading zone at a time. Nordeen said that valet operations will be optimized to limit the amount of cars in the loading area, and that there is a loading zone on Dayton that they could use if there was an especially busy time. Vercauteren added that the building will have a Dayton address for Ubers and GPS systems so that they don't try to enter on State Street.

Ahrens said that what isn't shown is what Martin wants to see, wider sidewalk, queuing spaces for valet cars, and other public improvements. This is what this committee is supposed to be concentrating on. Nordeen said that drawings are currently being prepared for the Transportation Commission. Vercauteren said that typically projects do not get reviewed by this committee or the Transportation Commission, and that any referrals will put back their scheduled review by Plan Commission Sept 17.

Zellers said that there is a lot of good here, but that she still has a concern about height, and retail activity on State Street. Henn said that the retail spaces being removed are former bars that didn't even do very well. Ahrens agreed and said that the street hasn't been truly activated for a long time, and that over his tenure on the DCC, their focus has been on the troubles at the top of State Street, and believes that this hotel project is exactly what is needed. He added that he appreciates that there is no TIF funding request for this project.

Plotkin said that he has to look at this project differently as a DCC member, with its goals and mission, than if he was on the Plan Commission. It is a great idea with questionable execution, and he supports this motion even though he isn't sure if he would support it at the Plan Commission.

Verveer said that he is supporting this motion as the proposal has a lot of positive aspects related to the DCC's charge. That being said, he is glad that this isn't a Plan Commission or Common Council vote, as he still needs more detail and added that the project could greatly benefit from easements that would allow more windows. He added that he feels better knowing the adjacent retail business on State Street are in support.

A motion was made by Ahrens, seconded by Frank, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the PLAN COMMISSION, with the understanding that the development team will return to a future DCC meeting for input and discussion on the details of the project as related to the mission of the Downtown Coordinating Committee, specifically regarding their role as stewards of the public space in the downtown area, regarding operation, design, safety, maintenance and use of the high-quality urban space for pedestrians in an environment that promotes healthy businesses. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Ayes:** 6 - Michael E. Verveer; Gregory O. Frank; Adam J. Plotkin; David Ahrens; Lori J. Henn and Al Martin

**Noes:** 1 - Ledell Zellers

**Excused:** 1 - Sandra J. Torkildson

**Non Voting:** 1 - Ted Crabb

4. [33826](#) Committee Member & Staff Updates

Update on State Street Art Project:

Planning staff informed the Committee that the artists chosen to execute the "Both/And" art proposal at the Confluence say that due to added engineering costs and steel tariffs, the project is over budget. They have proposed a slightly altered design with five main plates, and a rear spine plate, as well as a three plate plus spine plate version. If the City were to proceed, staff needs to find additional funding from other sources, or will lose the \$160,000 in TIF funds that run out at the end of this year. Staff does not believe that the four plate version is similar enough to the original proposal, and will work to negotiate with the artist on a final budget.

Verveer said that staff has reached out to him to sponsor a new funding resolution to be introduced in September under suspension of the rules in order to keep this project on track, and other art projects will likely have to be pushed back to make this happen.

Crabb said that this art proposal was by far the best proposal, and while he is disappointed with the budget once again being the issue, he supports the efforts of staff to keep pushing forward with a slightly altered design. The Committee members agreed and asked staff to keep going and find funding to have this project installed.

**ADJOURNMENT**

**A motion was made by Ahrens, seconded by Verveer, to Adjourn at 8:15 p.m.  
The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

Upcoming Meeting: September 20, 2018