

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

April 14, 2025

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 2110 Bascom Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and exterior alterations

Legistar File ID # [87629](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: April 9, 2025

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Samantha Novinska, JG Development

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition to the principal structure and alterations to the existing structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is located within the University Heights local historic district

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
 - (c) Replacement
 1. Existing features shall be replaced in-kind if they are too deteriorated to repair.
- (5). Windows and Doors
 - (a) Openings

1. A limited number of openings in walls above the foundation not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be filled in a manner that retains the original opening pattern and size, and is similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the surrounding wall.
 2. New window openings may be added to elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
- (b) Sill and Head Height
1. Infilling at the head or jambs is prohibited.
 2. The new or reconfigured openings shall have similar appearance to the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 3. The sills of historic window openings on elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be raised to serve bathrooms and kitchens.
- (c) Windows
1. Original decorative windows shall be repaired and retained.
 2. Only when original windows are too deteriorated or hazardous to repair may they be replaced with new windows that replicate all design details.
 3. Replacement multi-light windows shall use true divided lights or simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
- (d) Balconies and Decks
1. Rear yard decks and balconies shall have simple railings in keeping with the character of the structure.
 2. All parts of the deck shall be painted or opaquely stained.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
- (a) General
2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
 3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
- (b) Materials and Features
1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
- (c) Accessibility
2. Barrier-free access requirements shall be complied with in such a manner that the historic building's character-defining exterior features and features of the site and setting are preserved or impacted as little as possible.
- (2) Building Site
- (a) General
1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
- (a) General

1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.
- (b) Wood
 1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
 - (b) Materials
 1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
 2. Any roofing materials shall be permitted on flat or slightly sloped roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - (e) Vents
 1. Roof vents shall be minimally visible and as unobtrusive as possible.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
 2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 - (b) Windows and Storm Windows
 1. Simulated divided lights are permitted with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
 - (d) Garage Doors
 1. Garage doors shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to repair exterior stucco, alter several historic window openings to match the window configuration on the addition, introduce a balconet on the side of the historic structure, and create a rear addition that will house a larger garage and provide space for an elevator to provide accessibility.

The building was constructed in 1924, designed by James R and Edward Law in the English Revival style. It features a stucco first level, wood shingle siding on the second level, and multi-light windows. The addition is proposed to be on the rear of the building with shingle siding that will be compatible with the appearance of the historic siding. The windows and garage door on the addition are compatible with the size, configuration, and operation of those on the historic building. The proposal includes the replacement of historic windows and reconfiguring those openings to match the dimension of those on the addition. The standards require that historic openings remain or have their sills raised. The dimensions of the window openings should remain the same. The historic windows can be replaced if they test positive for lead or are too deteriorated to repair, but otherwise the character and rhythm of the historic resource rather than the addition is the design that needs to prevail.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. The alteration of the form of the historic window openings is not in keeping with the original design and character of the building. The modification of a window opening to become a balconet will be minimally visible and is in keeping with the architectural character of the building.
 - 2. The windows proposed for reconfiguration will be visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - 3. The proposed balconet is not a conjectural detail and is of a simple design that is architecturally compatible with the structure.
 - (c) Replacement
 - 1. The windows proposed for replacement are to match the design of the addition, not because of deterioration.
- (5). Windows and Doors
 - (a) Openings
 - 1. The windows proposed for modification are not proposed to be filled-in in a way that meets the requirements of this standard. The sizes will be different.
 - 3. The new openings are proposed to match the openings on the addition and deviate from the size and rhythm of those on the historic building.
 - (b) Sill and Head Height
 - 1. Infilling at the head or jambs is prohibited and some of the reconfigured window openings have entirely different head and jamb locations from those on the historic building.
 - 2. The new or reconfigured openings shall have similar appearance to the historic windows or doors of the structure, but the reconfigured windows replicate the new windows on the addition rather than the historic.
 - 3. The sills of historic window openings on elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be raised to serve bathrooms and kitchens, but the proposal is to reconfigure and in one instance raise the location entirely of the new window opening.
 - (c) Windows
 - 2. Only when original windows are too deteriorated or hazardous to repair may they be replaced with new windows that replicate all design details, but that is not what this proposal is for.
 - 3. Replacement multi-light windows shall use true divided lights or simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (d) Balconies and Decks
 - 1. The side balconet will be minimally if at all visible from the developed public right-of-way and is of a simple design, however staff will need to review the final specifications for the balconet railing.
 - 2. All parts of the deck shall be painted or opaquely stained.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 - 2. A new addition appears to be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
 - 3. The addition is visually separated from the principal building through its materials, wall and roof planes.
 - 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition are similar to those of the historic building, but the proposed modification of the window openings on the historic resource make for a break in that rhythm.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. A new addition is proposed for the rear of the structure.
 - (c) Accessibility
 - 2. The addition will allow for integration of an elevation to provide barrier-free access.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 - 1. The rear addition is compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 - 1. The proposed siding will replicate the materials found on the historic building.
 - (b) Wood
 - 1. The wood-alternative products do not have a textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 - 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof appear to be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
 - (b) Materials
 - 1. Visible roof materials appear to be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
 - 2. Any roofing materials shall be permitted on flat or slightly sloped roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way, which makes the metal roofing over the garage entrance compatible and approvable.
 - (e) Vents
 - 1. Roof vents shall be minimally visible and as unobtrusive as possible. There is currently no information on the style of venting proposed.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 - 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them appear to be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
 - 2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure, and largely do accomplish this.
 - (b) Windows and Storm Windows
 - 1. Simulated divided lights are permitted with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass. Staff will need final specifications to verify this.
 - (d) Garage Doors
 - 1. Garage doors appear to be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Retain historic window openings rather than reconfiguring as proposed. If the windows need to be replaced, they must follow the standards for replacement.
2. Submit final specifications for windows, balconet railing, stucco, roof venting, and any new exterior lighting to staff for approval.