

DATE: October 30, 2013
TO: Plan Commissioners
FROM: Jim Powell, [REDACTED] Lake View Ave.

Re: Comments on Lake View Nurses Dorm Demolition and Reuse Plan

While I'm sad that the nurses' dorm will be demolished, we are at the end of a long, imperfect attempt at saving it. Eight years ago, when I was the Northside Planning Council facilitator, I promoted the use of the space as an environmental education center tying together all the great green space we have on the north side: Cherokee Marsh, Lake View Hill, Warner Park, Troy Gardens, Mendota, and Governor's Island. Various groups were supportive but it never jelled. More recently, I sat on the ad hoc committee last year that was convened to see if reuse was possible. This was after a previous, fruitless effort by the Friends of Lake View Hill to do the same.

The proposal before you looks good except for the tiered seating that creates a gathering space. Here are some reasons why this is bad idea.

The proposal runs counter to the Lake View Hill Park Master Plan

- The Master Plan calls for a gathering space in front of the Dane County Department of Human Service building (the old Tuberculosis Sanatorium or "San"), near the fountain, with its incredible view of the city and lake.¹ The proposal before you calls for "tiered seating within the original [nurses' dorm] building footprint provid[ing] a gathering space" This location is 25 feet from the eastern park boundary, in an area surrounded by trees. Moving this from the center of the park to the edge makes no sense, and it also draws attention from the old San at the top of the hill to a support building off on the side.
- At no time during the consulting and input process was anyone asked if they would prefer a gathering space in front of the old San (overlooking the lake and city) or at the

¹ *From the Lake View Hill Park Master Plan (pages 34-35):*

Lake View Hill Park does not provide any designated gathering areas for current users. To support the master plan recommendation of programmatic use of the park for study, field trips, projects, and other environmental and historical education efforts **the master plan recommends adding a small group gathering area in conjunction with the historic fountain south of the Administration Building (Sanatorium Building).**

Dane County Land and Water Resources Department should coordinate directly with Dane County Health and Human Services Facilities Department to renovate the fountain structure and the area around the existing fountain structure. The intent is not to restore the fountain to a working condition but rather create a low-profile patio area surrounding the fountain to function as a gathering area. The site takes advantage of proximity to both parking and restrooms located in the lobby of the Administration Building as well as the incredible views across Maple Bluff to Lake Mendota and the Isthmus. A site-scale design should be prepared for this area to address pavement extents, sidewalk access, seating, fountain restoration, and site-scale stormwater management.

The master plan does not support the addition of any covered shelters within the Park.

nurses' dorm (which is at the eastern boundary of the park and has trees screening views southward). If this had been done, people clearly would prefer what the master plan already calls for: a gathering space in front of the old San with views of the lake and city. The Master Plan, adopted in 2009, lists the gathering space in front of the old sanatorium as a priority. This should be pursued and completed in 2014.

- The consultant hired to facilitate public meeting regarding the fate of the nurses dorm has a strong, repeatedly-stated desire for preserving as much of the nurses' dorm as possible; she wanted a shelter and a substantial gathering space and presence of the old nurses dorm. She has not been shy about this and has influenced the process. During meetings last fall, when I pointed out that the Master Plan prohibited covered shelters and called for a gathering space in front of the old San, the consultant was surprised. This is because she had never looked at the Master Plan, and had only looked at the initial Ken Saiki Design plans. Instead of acknowledging these restrictions, the consultant chose to pursue a path of changing the Master Plan.

A gathering space along the park boundary will cause problems

- As an adjacent property owner next to the park, I already "benefit" from park use when people travel up and down Lake View Hill late at night, often when drunk. They are taking a shortcut from Northport Drive or Warner Park, between our split rail fence and the nurses dorm (a distance of 25 feet), to the neighborhoods north of the park.
- We have dealt with trespassing, drunks and vandalism around and in the nurses' dorm for years. I have called the police numerous times, and I have even caught kids breaking windows and breaking in. There have been fires set inside the nurses' dorm. In the winter snowboarders love flying off the grotto wall just below the nurses' dorm. The proposed tiered steps and foundations walls will be perfect for snowboarders to build ramps. I can see the sledders, snowboarders and weekend partiers being drawn to the gathering space like a beacon.
- Creating a deliberate gathering space at the park edge will again attract trespassers and vandals at night. That is one reason why the gathering space in the center of the property in front of the old San is so appealing--in addition to being a very open public spot, the night lighting will help encourage appropriate use of the space.
- Additionally, County Parks has told me if there is any curfew violation, I should call Madison Police, not County Parks. By creating a gathering space in this location, I fear that County Parks will be deliberately causing a public nuisance and that the adjacent property owners (and Madison Police) will have to deal with it.
- The nurses' dorm building is 25 feet from my western property line. (If you look on the map, you will see my property surrounded on three sides by the park; the land south of mine was donated to the County by the Esch family, from whom I purchased the property.) It is inappropriate to place a gathering space adjacent to the closest residence to the park, especially when the Master Plan calls for centrally-located gathering space in

the center of the park, with commanding views of the lake and city. Our quality of life and property value concerns need to be taken into consideration.

A gathering space along the park boundary will forego a rare opportunity to add conservation to a conservancy park

- With the demolition of the nurses' dorm, County Parks has a rare chance to actually add conservancy area within its boundaries. Given the mature trees and setting near the crest of the hill, the resulting restoration would be magnificent. Why not add to the existing oak and hickory grove (just above the nurses' dorm) by planting saplings in the demolition area? This would help connect to the existing oak and hickory groves just to the east, connecting fragmented woods in the park. In other words, it would actually be conservation. Making it into a gathering space would go in the opposite direction.
- During the master planning and more recent processes, a recurring theme expressed by participants has been a focus on the healing nature of the tuberculosis sanatorium in a natural setting (a major artifact of the cultural history). Some participants have expressed a desire to restore the oak-hickory savanna to the nurses' dorm site, with a small commemorative spot, within the canopy of the trees, to express this contemplative, healing aspect of the site. The site should be small—meant for personal reflection—and have a small section of nurses' dorm to help place the experiences in the appropriate context. The gatherings space proposal moves this idea from the personal to the communal. The personal experience is perfect for this space, while the communal experience is perfect for a gathering space in front of the old San (which after all, is what the Master Plan calls for). This open space provides a panoramic view of the city and Lake Mendota, and is the view that tuberculosis patients had while living at the San.

In closing, please ask the County to explain why it wishes to move a Master Plan immediate priority of a centrally-located gathering space to a peripheral location immediately next to park neighbors opposed to it, and how it plans to address the identified nuisance problems?

Stouder, Heather

From: Sue Gleason [REDACTED]
Sent: Saturday, November 02, 2013 9:31 AM
To: Stouder, Heather; Anita Weier; Melissa-Sargent
Cc: Kwitek, Sara; Darren Marsh; Huttner, Laura; Rob Nebel
Subject: Proposal for Lake View Nurse's Dorm

Hello all,

I just noticed the Oct. 30th deadline for comments on the Lake View Nurse's Dorm. I was keyed into the Nov 18th meeting and didn't see that date so my apologies for being late.

I am writing as an individual and not in any official capacity with the neighborhood association or the county parks friends group.

We are one of the closest neighbors to the property and along with my husband, would like to register our strong support for the proposed plan. I think they did a nice job of listening to feedback at the Sept. Friends meeting and developing a plan that honors the property's history, creates a fantastic viewing area, and also blends the area nicely with the campus and the park landscape.

I do not share the concerns of others that this will invite partying or vandalism and instead think it will bring more visitors to appreciate the park. Our property is nearest to the water tower and upper parking lot and I can share that over the years we have had a few parties but very few compared to the dozens of people that hike the trails every day. We recently wondered if the new kiosk and picnic tables would invite more noisy gatherings but they have only provided a place for scouts and other volunteers to gather.

So basically, we love the proposal, think it accomplishes what most want to see for the property and based on our experience of the past 27 years, think the benefits will greatly outweigh any isolated incidents that might occur.

Thank you,

Sue Gleason and Mark Hottmann
[REDACTED] Esch Lane

ps - I will be out of town for a work conference on Nov 18th but please feel free to share these comments if it is appropriate.



Department of Planning & Community & Economic Development
Planning/Building Inspection/Economic Development/Community Development
Steven Cover, Director

CITY OF MADISON

OCT 18 2013

Bradley J. Murphy
Planning Division
215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard
P.O. Box 2985
Madison, WI 53701-2985
(608) 266-4635

REVIEW REQUEST FOR:

- PRELIMINARY PLAT
- FINAL PLAT
- LOT DIVISION/CSM
- CONDITIONAL USE
- DEMOLITION
- REZONING
- INCLUSIONARY ZONING
- OTHER

1206 Northport Drive
Demolish dormitory to create additional open space at Lake View Hill Park
Rob Nebel - Dane County Public Works/Parks Department/
Dawn O'Kroley - Dorschner|Associates, Inc.

Planning & Community & Economic Development

PLANNING DIVISION CONTACT: Heather Stouder

RETURN COMMENTS BY: 30 October 2013

PLEASE ALSO EMAIL OR FAX ANY COMMENTS TO THE APPLICANT:

Applicant E-mail: dokroley@dorschnerassociates.com Fax: 204-0078

Date Submitted: 02 October 2013 Plan Commission: 18 November 2013

Date Circulated: 07 October 2013 Common Council:

CIRCULATED TO:

- | | | |
|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> ZONING | <input type="checkbox"/> DISABILITY RIGHTS | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ALD. <u>Weier</u> DIST. <u>18</u> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> FIRE DEPARTMENT | <input type="checkbox"/> POLICE DEPT. - CHANDLER | <input type="checkbox"/> MADISON GAS & ELECTRIC |
| <input type="checkbox"/> TRAFFIC ENG | <input type="checkbox"/> CITY ASSESSOR - M. RICHARDS | <input type="checkbox"/> ALLIANT ENERGY |
| <input type="checkbox"/> PARKS DIVISION | <input type="checkbox"/> MADISON METRO - SOBOTA | <input type="checkbox"/> A T & T |
| <input type="checkbox"/> CITY ENG. - DAILEY | <input type="checkbox"/> MMSD BOARD, C/O SUPT. | <input type="checkbox"/> T D S |
| <input type="checkbox"/> CITY ENG. - PEDERSON | <input type="checkbox"/> PUBLIC HEALTH - SCHLENKE | <input type="checkbox"/> MT. VERNON TELE |
| <input type="checkbox"/> WATER UTILITY | | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> ECONOMIC DEV - OLVER | <input type="checkbox"/> NEIGHBORHOOD ORGANIZATION | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> REAL ESTATE | | |

Review the above as per time schedule set in Chapter 16.23(5)(b)2; 16.23(5)(3)3; or Chapter 28, City of Madison Ordinance; OR your agency's comments cannot be considered prior to action.

One copy for your files; one copy for file of appropriate telephone company; PLEASE RETURN one copy with joint comments.

The above is located in your district. A copy is on file in the Planning Division Office for review. If you have any questions or comments, contact our office at 266-4635.

The above is located within or near the limits of your neighborhood organization. A copy is on file in the Planning Division Office for review. If you have any questions or comments, contact our office at 266-4635.

RETURN COMMENTS TO: PLANNING DIVISION, DEPT. OF PLANNING & COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, ROOM LL100 MMB, 215 MARTIN LUTHER KING JR. BLVD.

NO COMMENTS / YOUR COMMENTS:

I agree that the former sanatorium dormitory is unsafe and should be demolished. No alternative use has been found. I also agree that parts of the building should be saved for posterity, but I do not like the proposed arrangement of the materials.

Alder Anita Weier