



Department of Planning & Community & Economic Development

Planning Division

Heather Stouder, Director

126 S. Hamilton Street
P.O. Box 2985
Madison, Wisconsin 53701-2985
Phone: (608) 266-4635
www.cityofmadison.com

TO: Urban Design Commission

FROM: Timothy M. Parks, Planner

DATE: June 26, 2017

SUBJECT: ID [46483](#) (UDC) and [45036](#) (Plan Commission) – Consideration of Zoning Map Amendment ID 28.022–00260 and 28.022–0021, amending a PD (Planned Development District) General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan to allow construction of a mixed-use building with 12,287 square feet of commercial space, five live-work spaces totaling 7,337 square feet and 152 apartments with underground parking at 1004-1032 S. Park Street; Urban Design Dist. 7; Ald. Dist. 13.

The applicant, Terrence Wall, is requesting approval of a major amendment to the (PD) General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan for 1004-1032 S. Park Street to revise plans approved in June and September 2015 for the construction of a mixed-use building at the intersection of S. Park Street and Fish Hatchery Road. A similar request was before the Urban Design Commission on November 9, 2016, which was referred (see ID [43556](#) for the earlier plans and Commission comments).

The mixed-use building approved in 2015 called for 6,000 square feet of first floor commercial space located at the intersection of S. Park Street and Fish Hatchery Road, 5,000 square feet of first floor live-work space in units located south along the project's S. Park Street frontage, and 164 apartments in a predominantly five-story building with two levels of structured parking containing 174 auto spaces. The proposed building will include 12,287 square feet of commercial space, five live-work spaces, and 152 apartments with one level of underground parking for 156 autos. The building placement is similar between the two versions of the project. However, a second floor landscaped courtyard for building residents in the 2015 plan moves to the first floor in the current version, and the driveway serving the project from S. Park Street has been eliminated. Sole access to the underground parking will be provided by from the east-west private drive shared between the site and adjacent Wingra Clinic via a ramp that will parallel the southerly, rear wall of the building. Since the November 2016 version reviewed by the Urban Design Commission, the applicant has moved the driveway access to align with the intersection of the east-west and north-south internal drives in the planned development to address an earlier staff concern about the location of that access point and to provide a more direct access for cars and bicycles using the underground parking.

Similar to previous iterations of the plans, the current plans have been massed to give the appearance of three distinct structures, which include a four- to six-story northern wing, a four-story building that parallels the southern property line, and a three-story live-work building along S. Park Street. The northern portion is massed to give the appearance of a five-story building nearest to the intersection of S. Park Street and Fish Hatchery Road, with a partial sixth story nested in a glass "prow" that will rise above the intersection. Most of the northern wing of the building is in fact a full four stories. Sleeping lofts have been included in the fourth floor units located on the exterior of the northern wing to provide additional height for the building when viewed from S. Park Street and Fish Hatchery Road. A 2,645

square-foot leasable commercial space is shown on the partial sixth floor above the flatiron corner; the top floor of the building will also include a resident rooftop patio overlooking S. Park Street. However, the northern wing will be four stories when viewed from the courtyard. The northern, triangularly shaped wing of the building and the four-story building wing along the southern property will be connected by an enclosed walkway at the second through fourth floors.

The Planning Division now believes that the Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission can find that the standards and criteria for approval of the amended General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan for the mixed-use building are met. The applicant has made an earnest effort to address earlier staff concerns with the November 2016 plans for the site, which called for a four-story, mostly residential northern wing of the mixed-use building. The Planning Division could not conclude that version of the plan was consistent with the applicable provisions of Urban Design District 7 or that it reflected the character of development envisioned for the site in various adopted plans, including the 2002 Park Street Revitalization: Possibilities to Reality report, 2005 South Madison Neighborhood Plan, and 2006 Wingra Market Study and Conceptual Redevelopment Plan Summary Report.

However, the use of lofted fourth floor apartments to give most of the northern wing the appearance of a five-story building from the street and the prominent glass prow proposed at the flatiron corner the project restore most of the stature that the building had when it received final approval from the Urban Design Commission in September 2015. Planning staff believes that the current plans resolve most of the staff concerns expressed regarding the November 2016 plans, and are more consistent with the myriad recommendations in the above-referenced plans, which generally anticipate a high-density redevelopment of the former Bancroft Dairy site that includes a “landmark gateway” mid-rise flatiron structure at the S. Park Street/Fish Hatchery Road intersection.

During its consideration of the General Development Plan in 2011, the Urban Design Commission emphasized the need to maximize the future development of the subject 1.64-acre property, including the construction of a flatiron building on the northern tip of the site adjacent to the S. Park Street-Fish Hatchery Road intersection. The UDC also encouraged the future building(s) to include a strong presence along S. Park Street with active entrances from the public sidewalk, and encouraged the developer to explore opportunities to share parking with the Wingra Clinic project to the south. The emphasis on the flatiron treatment of the S. Park-Fish Hatchery intersection continued during the review of the Specific Implementation Plan for the five-story building approved in 2015, with multiple versions of the project reviewed by the Urban Design Commission before final approval was granted in September 2015.

As the Urban Design Commission considers the current plans for 1004-1032 S. Park Street, the Planning Division recommends that the Commission consider the following aspects of the proposed mixed-use building as it weighs granting approval of the project:

- The UDC should affirm that the building material palette is appropriate for the prominent site the building will occupy. As proposed, the building will feature a combination of brick veneer and composite panel. Along S. Park Street, the renderings suggest that two brick tones will be used, with a contrasting darker-colored composite panel along the top-most floors and in prominent vertical sections. Along Fish Hatchery Road, the darker of the two brick colors and the contrasting composite panel are proposed. The northern wing of the building will feature more brick compared to the four-story southern wing, where the composite panel is featured, including facing Fish Hatchery Road.

While Planning staff feels that the proposed composite panel is an appropriate accent material and for use on the upper stories of the northern wing, staff questions the amount proposed on the lower floors of that wing and on the southern building wing, especially the elevations visible from S. Park Street and Fish Hatchery Road. In particular, staff recommends that the UDC advise on the articulation of the sections of the northern wing facing both streets adjacent to the glass prow at the corner, where the composition seems heavy adjacent to the proposed signature glass element. In general, staff believes that all three facades visible from the public realm (including the southern façade visible along Fish Hatchery Road) should be clad in high-quality building materials that give the building wings distinct but cohesive bases, middles and tops.

- The metal fins above the first floor that are proposed to emanate from the glass prow at the flatiron corner should be significantly reduced. As rendered, these fins appear to extend beyond the zoning lot and into the rights of way of both S. Park Street and Fish Hatchery Road. While this architectural treatment may have some merit, staff believes that the fins should not extend into the right of way.
- The UDC should advise on the placement of the building along the western property line along Fish Hatchery Road. Whereas the plans approved in 2015 included a modest setback along that property line to allow for some perimeter landscaping between the building and sidewalk, the proposed building will be placed at the property line, with little room for landscaping and no effective buffer between the first floor residential units and sidewalk. The current plans also do not reflect the six-foot right of way dedication for Fish Hatchery Road that was required by the City Engineer concurrent with the 2015 Planned Development and one-lot Certified Survey Map to create the development site.
- More information should be provided on how access will be provided into the first floor commercial spaces along S. Park Street south of the prow. The current plans show steps leading from the sidewalk up to the street-facing doors into the commercial spaces. While a similar street-facing condition was shown on the plans approved in 2015, the 2015 floorplans also included a clear accessible route into the commercial spaces from the S. Park sidewalk through an interior first floor arcade. How access will be provided into these spaces on the current plans will be vital to their long-term viability and should be addressed prior to final approval.
- While the applicant has addressed earlier concerns by the Planning Division and Traffic Engineering Division about the location of the sole driveway proposed to serve the underground parking, staff still has reservations about the function of the new driveway with regard to the steepness of the ramp and the sight distance as vehicles reach the top of the ramp to exit. In particular, staff is concerned that the side bike path shown on the plans is too steep, and has limited vision and tight corners, which the Traffic Engineer recommends be altered or eliminated. In lieu of the proposed bike ramp, the applicant should consider creating a bike-focused lobby for the building that might better accommodate bicyclists, which could include an exterior door with an automatic opener and oversized elevator that could be equally conducive to bicyclists who will use the lower level bike parking facilities or choose to store their bikes in their dwelling unit (if allowed by the developer).