

Regarding: 1335 Rutledge Street – Third Lake Ridge Historic District – Installation of replacement windows. 6th Ald. District
Contact: Frances Gantner
(Legistar #28664)

Date: February 11, 2013
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

General Information:

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of windows at 1335 Rutledge Street. The Applicants attended the Landmarks Commission meeting of January 7. At that meeting, the item was referred to a future meeting to allow the Applicants time to assess the condition of each window proposed for replacement.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance sections:**33.19(11)(i) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.**

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g).
2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Staff Comments and Recommendations:

The Applicant submitted additional materials to convey the condition of the windows as requested. According to the submission materials, 35 windows are proposed for replacement and 5 of those have already been replaced. One window proposed for replacement is a fixed upper sash with leaded glass and a fixed lower sash with clear glass.

Staff believes that windows are character defining features and that every attempt should be made to repair wood sash before replacing them. The Applicant was in the process of obtaining a permit when it was noted that the property is located in a historic district and had not been granted a Certificate of Appropriateness. According to the Applicant, the replacement windows have already been purchased.

Staff believes that replacement of wood windows does not meet the Ordinance (33.19(11)(g)3.). While window replacements have been approved for other properties, the Landmarks Commission is charged with reviewing the unique conditions of each property. The Landmarks Commission typically requests that property owners repair the original windows and install weather-stripping and storm windows before requesting replacement.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the 5 windows that have already been replaced are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the 30 original windows are not met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission not approve the request. It is possible that the Commission may find that a Certificate of Appropriateness should be granted for window replacement due to the compatible appearance of the proposed replacement window. If this is the case, Staff recommends the following condition of approval:

1. The decorative leaded glass sash shall be repaired and weather-stripped with a protective exterior storm panel installed.