

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 1, 2009
TITLE: 1308 West Dayton Street – PUD(SIP), Union South. 8 th Ald. Dist. (12241)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 1, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Mark Smith, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm, Dawn Weber, Marshal Rummel, Ron Luskin and Todd Barnett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 1, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(SIP) located at 1308 West Dayton Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Gary Brown, Walter Johnson, Angela Pakes Ahlman and Shayna Hetzel, all representing the University of Wisconsin-Madison.

A detailed review of the plans emphasized:

- The provision of 232 bike parking stalls along with 32 moped stalls including planning for a potential bike station on the south elevation with details yet to evolve.
- The building features an extensive green roof at the guest room level.
- The color material pallet includes “Norman” brick which is longer brick than typical, stone and rusticated stone along with metal panels in two colors.

Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- Look at alignment at Campus Drive off loading dock access and the pedestrian mall.
- Do something with pedestrian refuge island at Campus Drive and beyond including creating a focal point that addresses vision clearance issues.
- The landscape plan needs to address the prairie theme of the building; create designed raised planter beds.
- The building pulls together nicely with mix of materials on the facade changes from face to face and skin improvements.
- Concern with mechanical element on the upper level of the building. It’s a big block without windows where the metal panel color on the upper elevation treatment is too close to that other lower elevations. Need to provide contrast. Look at distribution interpretation of the metal panels for its appearance.
- Look at horizontal ribbing on the mechanical element to include high windows or other types of opening treatment.
- Make the cantilever element on the east-west and south elevations of the building more thin if possible.

- Try to do Gold LEED Certification.
- In the outdoor plaza/band area, concern with the riser height. Make sure variation doesn't result in uncomfortable walking.
- Don't use Honey Locust substitute for Kentucky Coffee Tree or alternative.
- Look at plants that emphasize horizontality, the planting plan should be representative of urban garden, not a healing garden. Consider less variety for a more minimalist approach in plantings.
- Dayton Street upper and lower end elevations needs more attention. Hierarchy of elements needs more attention such as what goes through, what gets cut off, provide more articulation.
- Consider lighter color for a top element on Orchard Street.
- Look at extended canopy with stepping and layers to make thinner.
- Develop more precast planters to provide an opportunity for more landscaping around building, along Dayton and internal plaza areas.
- Consider green roofs on other areas to deal with stormwater in the long-term where green roofs can double the life of the roof.
- Within the amphitheater plaza area, look at alternative colors of concrete to discern different levels better.
- The lower end elevation's blankness on Dayton Street needs work. Doesn't present a face to the street.
- Want to see how Randolph, Campus Drive intersects as well as how the right-of-way details work in conjunction with the proposed project.
- Use differential treatment of paving on Orchard Plaza to communicate bike/pedestrian lanes.
- Integrate the concept of the building more into the site; step down more and provide information on the ground floors.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0-1) with Luskin abstaining. The motion for initial approval required the address of the above stated comments, especially the landscape plan issues.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6.5, 7, 7, 8, 8 and 8.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1308 West Dayton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings								8.5
	7	8	4			6	8	7
	6	7	4/5			6	6	6
	5	8					7	8
	7	7	6			6.5	7	6.5
	8	8	5			7	7	7
								8

General Comments:

- Striking modern/prairie design with layers of open spaces – both public and intimate levels. Efforts at gold LEEDS and recycling are excellent consider expanding green roofs and investing in gray water system.
- The architecture nicely embraces the horizontality of the Midwest, the landscape needs to follow suit. The landscape is a disappointment after seeing the architecture.
- Landscape treatment may be too “gardenesque” for urban setting.
- Extend elegant concept of stepped outdoor terraces into the landscape to fully integrate the building with the site.
- Nicely resolved solution to an extremely difficult set of issues.
- Large block element? South edge treatment at railroad tracks. Great project. Study south-west-south racing exterior wall (facing mopeds) needs to invite pedestrians, be inviting.