

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: January 6, 2010
TITLE: 1501-1507 Wright Street/3502-3534 Straubel Street PRD 17th Ald. Dist. (16321)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: January 6, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, R. Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, John Harrington, Jay Ferm, Todd Barnett, Mark Smith and Ron Luskin.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 6, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of site/façade modifications to six buildings within an existing publicly owned residential development, PRD, located 1501 and 1507 Wright Street/3502-3534 Straubel Street. Registered in neither support nor opposition was Jim Gersich. As an introduction to the item, Mark Olinger, Director – Planning and Community and Economic Development, noted that the project provides for the interior gutting and renovation of six buildings within the CDA-owned Public Housing project, combined with exterior modifications to provide for making the buildings fully accessible. Olinger noted that the renovations and six structures were fully consistent with the master plan for the Truax Park Redevelopment which supports the maintenance and conversion of the buildings for full accessibility. The buildings will be fully updated with new utilities and mechanicals including adding elevators and stairways on the backside of the building, along with removal of the existing berming along the street sides of Wright and Straubel Streets to expose lower level windows. Jim Gersich of Dimension IV Madison, then provided a detailed overview of the plan in addition to noting the location of bikeracks within the basement within the modified buildings. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- The architecture on the backside of the building seems disjointed.
- Need more information on the siftern and roof draining system.
- Need to provide more context, including existing proposed site plans.
- On page G0.2, relevant to the back elevation of the building, the proximity of the entry door to the units at the stair, a liability, looks like a secondary entry instead of a main entry. Pull stairway out with a landing and relocate doors not to conflict with adjacent units.
- Interior facing the balconies need to be lightened up.
- Roof pitch over stair towers underdeveloped? Look at or study exaggerating in order to be seen.
- Pull entry elements together from the new rear stair towers to front entry over the top of the roof.
- Pull out street side entries and make more transparent.
- Future considerations outside the current scope of the project should include the elimination of the east bay of surface parking at the corner of Wright Street at Straubel and:
 - Provide tree islands at no more than 12 stall interval and look at beefing up premier landscaping.
 - Consider eliminating dead-end in surface lot parking lots between buildings 8 and 9 and adjacent to building 10 with the addition of hammerheads.

- Make pathways and walks more sweeping.
- Have a blow-up of one or two of the buildings to see plantings more clearly.
- The mass of the rear stairways dominates; unbroken with its hat or roof too small, consider bringing soffit or eave lower to reduce mass of the stairtower.
- Multiple roof projections at the porches, not resolved.
- Need to open up wall with windows in the stairtower.
- Stairtower should reflect the levels of the floor.
- Provide eye-level renderings to show what the buildings look like from the ground.
- Show how adult vs. kid bike storage and parking is dealt with.
- Concern with removing on-street parking on Straubel Street and its effect on safety; traffic calming.
- The roof overhang for the rear stair proper doesn't have to be as high.
- Consider the use of EIFS beyond restoring the existing extent and above-grade.
- The laundry room areas turn their back to the exterior public space and need study; the kitchen should be adjacent to the balconies with window openings.
- Door at ground level on the stair tower should be at its end to move away from the balconies with consideration given for its extension as well as to provide weather protection and extend land-use.

ACTION:

On a motion by Ferm, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-1-1) with Smith voting no and Luskin abstaining.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 5, 5.5, 5, 4, and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1501-1507 Wright Street/3502-3534 Straubel Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	6	5	-	-	-	5	6	6
	6	4	5	5	-	5	6	5
	6	5	5	-	-	5	6	5.5
	5	5	-	-	-	5	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Good start.
- Study: Stair tower, use of rear addition. Architecture: Roof design.
- Walkways can be more graceful (vocabulary of new should match existing to remain).
- Informational – very welcome update.
- New architecture should build on existing (not ignore) to enhance the sense of placement to calm traffic keep parking on Straubel – redesign pedestrian/street interface to deal with darting children. Parking lot at Straubel and Wright should be landscaped to create a pleasing neighborhood gateway.