

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: July 11, 2007
TITLE: 821 South Gammon Road – New Construction, Office/Retail Building in Urban Design District No. 2. 1 st Ald. Dist. (06770)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: July 11, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Lou Host-Jablonski, Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Joan Bachleitner, and Marsha Rummel.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of July 11, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of new construction located at 821 South Gammon Road. Appearing on behalf of the project were Richard Klinke, Steve Klinke, John Bieno and Nate Brand. Appearing in opposition were Kathy Bastien, Sandra Shurk, Al Suildebhain and Greg Paradise. Appearing neither in support nor opposition was Lisa Subeck. The modified plans as presented featured the following:

- The addition of a sidewalk along the northerly edge of the building to Gammon Road.
- Enhanced landscaping which includes a new tree island on the easterly row of surface parking.
- The doubling of minimum landscape points required for the surface parking facility.
- The addition of landscaping along the south elevation of the building, as well as a rain garden adjacent to a storm inlet.
- In order to relieve issues with the disjointed of the appearance three parts or components of the building; the elevations have been adjusted to create a common ceiling plane, extended a horizontal band utilizing the upper edge of the parapet wall on the one-story element of the building, in combination with incorporation of a cedar horizontal accent band above upper portions of the second story windows of the remaining two building components of the building, including a revised parapet element on the southerly component of the building featuring a roof screen.
- The various building elevations display typical locations for wall signage with further details to be provided as part of a separate future approval.

Following the presentation various members of the public spoke in favor and against the project. Representatives of the adjoining multi-family development spoke to issues with the development of retail/commercial center adjoining their residentially improved properties and inherent conflicts between the two land uses, including the potential for an increase in crime and vandalism already within the neighborhood. Nate Brand, part owner of the adjacent Country Meadows apartments, spoke to issues with zoning of the property for commercial uses, its location at a dangerous intersection, as well as problems with ingress and egress and traffic flows. Kathy Bastien, property manager for Country Meadows spoke in opposition, citing issues already within the area with street gangs, as well as potential conflicts with the location of residential buildings in close proximity to the proposed surface parking area, including residential patio areas. Sandra Shurk, assistant manager of the Country Meadows apartments also voiced concerns relevant to traffic, development of a commercial/strip building, as well as issues with parking lot signage, lighting and odor from

the proposed dumpster. Al Suidebhain, a resident in an adjacent building raised concerns with the proximity of a dumpster to his residential building, as well as the need to downsize the building to fit the number of parking spaces proposed. Attorney Greg Paradise spoke as representative of the owners of Country Meadows noting the parking lot's close proximity to the residential property and the potential to foster unsupervised activities, in addition to the land use plan's support for residential development of the property and the Comprehensive Plan for the City of Madison in support for transit-oriented uses where the apparent development of a surface parking lot may conflict. Lisa Subeck spoke in favor of the project in providing an opportunity for jobs, as well as walkable accessible services within the area as supported by the ongoing initiative for the Southwest Neighborhood Plan. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Applicant is encouraged to provide further consideration of residential on the second floor level.
- Concern stated relevant to traffic safety, access and potential for crime in the area are more relevant to the land use considerations by the Plan Commission.
- Like project, the last thing to think about is more residential on Gammon and Schroeder. Residential would create more trash and problems with neighbors, this is a good project.
- Consider adjusting parking stalls on east side to 16-feet in depth with a 2-foot overhang to increase the amount of greenspace buffer along the easterly property line, in addition to providing alternatives for the relocation of the dumpster to be more friendly to neighbors.
- Project as proposed is supportive of transit orientation consistent with the provisions of the Comprehensive Plan.
- The application of cedar siding in combination with brick should be modified to eliminate materials being in the same plane with the provision of an off-set.
- Project is doing everything the City has been asking, building is oriented to the street, minimum parking provided.
- Relevant to the lighting provide fixtures of full cut-outs and reduce light levels below the drive-up canopy, in addition to relocating the dumpster.
- Provide consideration for a corner entry off the southwesterly corner of the building would be a major improvement.
- Reduce the brightness of the wall mounted fixtures, especially the possibility of spilling on to the neighbors to the north.
- Need a door at the corner of the building.
- Door may preclude adjacent area's use as an outdoor area.
- Architecture at the corner should be changed to be more pedestrian/orientated retail, not just a door on the corner. The corner should have a stronger treatment (curb element).

ACTION:

On a motion by Barrett, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0-1) with Slayton abstaining. The motion required address of the building's corner architectural issues as specified above, and alternative dumpster location. The motion provided for the development of a stronger treatment of the southwesterly corner of the building, including considerations for a door and/or other amenities to provide for its enhancement architecturally, as well as overall function.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5.5, 6, 6, 6.5, 6.5 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 821 South Gammon Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	Abstain							
	6	6	5	5	-	6	5	6
		6		5	-	-	7	6.5
		6	-	5	-	-	7	6.5
	6	7	6	6	-	6	7	7
	6	7	6	5	-	6	7	6
	7	8	7	6	-	7	6	7
	7	5.5	-	-	-	-	-	5.5

General Comments:

- The project looks pretty nice and well adapted to the site. There needs to be more elaboration as to how it fits in the Comprehensive Plan.
- Address corner architecture. Commercial mixed use is exciting here, like “transit oriented development.”
- Project much improved; look at surface parking space dimensions.
- This seems like an appropriate use and design for this location. However, the corner is weak, and this is the part of the building that is most important. Relocate dumpster.