

From: Ron Shutvet <rshutvet@gmail.com>

Sent: Wednesday, November 29, 2023 11:45 AM

To: Lake Monona Waterfront Committee <LMWCommittee@cityofmadison.com>; Knepp, Eric <EKnepp@cityofmadison.com>; Sturm, Michael <MSturm@cityofmadison.com>

Subject: LMW Master Plan Comments 11-28-2023 by Ron Shutvet

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I have attached a PDF of my comments for the Lake Monona Waterfront Ad-Hoc Committee to this email. It is my hope that you seriously consider these comments and postpone your approval of the draft master plan until you hold another public meeting for public review and comment on the master plan. Then it would be appropriate to review any new public comments and make appropriate revisions one more time before you send the plan on to the Common Council.

Ron Shutvet

LMW Master Plan Comments submitted 11-28-2023 by Ron Shutvet

- All maps and plans should have a North arrow on the plan.
- All maps and plans should be rendered with North at the top if at all possible for easier interpretation of the illustration.
- Need larger more detailed plans of all of the proposed shoreline elements with profile views drawn to scale that show the various elements and the materials used in their construction.
- All existing blasted limestone rip-rap along the causeway and Law Park should be partially removed or used as fill and pushed deeper into the lake then covered with a sufficient layer of natural glacial cobbles and boulders to give the rip-rapped areas a more natural appearance.

Please do not look at glacial boulders as a hard manmade lake edge treatment. Often glacially formed natural lakes have huge quantities of cobbles and boulders naturally piled up at the shoreline along portions of the lake edge. At the tip of Turville Point there is a large section of shoreline that consists of glacial cobbles and boulders that were pushed up into piles over 4 feet high in places. These piles of boulders along the shoreline were placed there by thousands of years of lake ice heaves during very cold winters. These piles of stone and soil along the lake edge are called 'ice ramps' by geologists. Most of the cobble and boulder lake edges along much of the shoreline of Olin-Turville Park are a natural shoreline. Thousands of years of wind and wave action have cut away some of the original shoreline of the glacial hills in Olin-Turville Park. Winter ice heaves have slowly pushed the remaining cobbles and boulders towards the shore each winter to create the existing cobble and boulder coated shoreline. These cobble and boulder coated shorelines are totally natural and happen wherever wave action slowly eats away a glacial moraine that contains large quantities of cobbles and boulders.

- I highly recommend the placement of several larger glacial boulders in groups at selected locations along the shoreline. These larger stones could be utilized as natural seating at select areas along the shoreline. Natural glacial boulders will always look better than large cut stones or concrete seating areas because they will always retain their natural appearance even if they settle a little bit. Large cut stones or concrete utilized as stepping stones and seating along the shoreline will move around and settle some with time and look like they need re-leveling of the stones. Ice heaves in the winter can move massive concrete steps and seating at the shoreline out of place in a few years.

The UW Memorial Union has had to completely reconstruct the cut stone shoreline edge over the years due to settlement and displacement of the cut stones at the lake edge. Where the concrete has been used to secure a level pedestrian route along the lakeshore near the UW Hooper sailboat storage areas, large glacial boulders were placed in great

quantities between the concrete wall and the lake to protect the wall from direct wave action and undercutting of the retaining wall footings.

- The use of steel sheet piling that is visible after construction should be avoided as this hard edge effect is unattractive and makes it difficult for wildlife to access or get out of the water.
- The use of manmade floating weed beds should be avoided. Lake Monona has plenty of weed beds. In fact, there are so many weed beds in Lake Monona that the county cannot keep up with cutting and collecting the excessive vegetation and removing it from the lake each summer. In most areas where these artificial weed beds are being proposed, they will often be subjected to high waves when the lake is not covered with ice. Then unless these artificial weed beds are removed in the winter, ice heaves will likely damage or even destroy these shoreline features. Then too, the steel cables and anchor weights needed to hold these structures in place will present themselves as potentially annoying or even hazardous obstacles to fishermen and anyone boating on the lake.
- The large amphitheater stair/seating area will be difficult to keep ice free and safe for use in the winter unless large quantities of salt and or sand are repetitively applied. Gradual settling or sideways movement of this stair/seating area can cause this massive stair/seating area to start cracking and breaking apart. Placing this stair/seating area on piles would be expensive and still not guarantee a crack free structure as nature tests its integrity over time.
- The proposed boat vendor area with paddle craft livery in Law Park lacks a breakwater. High wave events can damage the pier and boats moored there. Winter ice heaves can damage the shoreline in this area and any building or pier constructed on the shoreline here.
- I question the feasibility of Overlook Plaza and contained swimming pool. Repeated cycles of winter lake ice heaves could damage this pier area. The swimming pool could become a health hazard and people could even drown here. I have never heard of a public swimming pool that doesn't have lifeguards. Sure natural beaches would work without lifeguards, but this area would be way more dangerous than a beach. The lake gets quite deep quickly at this location as you move away from the shoreline. Will the swimming pool have sides and a bottom or will it just be an area of the lake surrounded by a pier? Inexperienced swimmers especially children should probably not be swimming here. Some park visitors will probably want to swim in both the pool and the lake here. Lake swimmers and canoe or kayakers could be pushed under the pier and sustain injury there during high wave events. The overlook plaza appears to be flanked on both sides by engineered wetland areas. It appears park users who decide to jump into the lake to swim at this location will end up having to swim and wade through the artificial wetlands to get back on shore.
- Need to provide a more detailed plan of the ped/bike underpass including a cross section view complete with proposed grade elevations for the railroad tracks, roadway, and

ped/bike paths in this area. Avoid the use of sheet piling or a concrete retaining wall along the shoreline in this area. Back in 2017, I submitted to both the city and Dane County concepts for a ped/bike underpass in this area. The LMW Ad-hoc committee and Madison Engineering should study these concepts before finalizing plans for the proposed underpass. Here is a link to those underpass concepts as well as other suggestions I made for improving the John Nolen Drive Corridor:

<https://aecstudy.countyofdane.com/documents/John-Nolen-Drive-Corridor-Master-Plan-Collaborative-07282017-from-Ron-Shutvet.pdf>

The underpass concepts start at page 10 in the appendix of this document. Some of the proposed design elements in this document are no longer feasible as the document is now 6 years old and some of the properties have already been developed in other ways since then.

Olin Park Area

- The natural glacial hill that existed just east of the railroad corridor and near the shoreline of Lake Monona in the northern portion of Olin Park needs to be restored as a noise buffer for the park. There will be people who will say that they won't be able to see the lake and Madison's isthmus as well as they approach the causeway from the south in vehicles on John Nolen Drive. However, long before John Nolen Drive was constructed the passengers riding on the north bound trains that traveled on this rail corridor couldn't see the isthmus and lake very well either until the trains passed the glacial hill that the railroad corridor had cut through and started crossing the causeway. The northern portion of Olin Park needs protection from the traffic noise on John Nolen Drive. As an added noise reducing feature, the speed limit over the causeway should be permanently reduced to 25 MPH along the entire causeway. This will greatly improve the ped/bike experience over the causeway. It is time we start placing the quality of the ped/bike experience along this popular ped/bike trail above the desire for people travel as fast as possible through this scenic area in their vehicles. If forced to slowdown, these travelers will be able to enjoy the views much better while traversing the causeway.

The glacial hill that used to be at this location and was utilized as part of a trail system that was developed over thousands of years by the indigenous people who moved into this area once the glaciers receded about 10,000 years ago. Restoring this hill will help tell the glacial and Native American history of this area.

- The proposed engineered wetland area needs to be scaled back to only about half the size shown in the plans. This part of the park needs to retain as much usable open space as possible as it has the best views of the lake as you move northward through the park. Native bur oak and white oak trees need to be planted in this entire area of the park to provide a natural open oak savanna appearance not a wetland experience. With a restored

hill along John Nolen Drive in this area people will be enticed to pause from their walk or biking experience and sit under the oak trees (once they grow to an appreciable size) and enjoy the views of the lake and downtown Madison from this area.

- More details are needed on proposed future transportation and parking infrastructure at Olin Park. How will overflow parking be handled? Already, the existing parking in this area is strained to the max with existing activities in Olin-Turville Park during the summer months. I am not sure that the 90 degree intersection proposed near 330 E Lakeside will be an improvement. The existing entrance road for Olin Park was constructed with that intersection on a curve to keep vehicles from encountering the dead end and turn around circle just west of Wingra Creek. The existing main Olin Park entrance road was rerouted to its present location to minimize conflicts with the boat launch and boat trailer parking areas as Lakeside Street used to continue cross the creek and directly east through the older portion of Olin Park.
- The existing wetland area bounded by Wingra Creek, Lakeside Street, and the park entrance road needs to be incorporated into the master plan. This wetland could be restored and boardwalks added to provide a self-guided nature trail through this wetland area. The surface water drainage system in the park area to the north should be directed towards this existing wetland not towards Lake Monona.
- Seriously reconsider the proposed canopy walk! This park feature will probably be enjoyed by some park visitors but hated by many others. It is too close to the lakeshore and detracts from the fact that there is already a natural glacial hill in this area that provides a great view of Lake Monona and Madison's isthmus. No one will enjoy the experience of being underneath this canopy walk. It will be an eyesore for people experiencing the park from ground level.
- A proposed nature center and any other new buildings should be postponed into the future after the city has officially begun acquiring the remaining residential properties to the east of this park. A nature center at this site needs to be more than a little rectangular building sitting way off the lake and having no view of the lake. The city needs to spend more time master planning this area of Olin Park. Potential uses for a new building or buildings in this area include a combination glacial history and Native American history discovery center; a nature center; boat rental and beach facilities; beer garden on the lake; and more.
- The current master planning process should be considered an interim master plan as the existing building needs to be demolished and a new larger building should be constructed further from the glacial hill to provide a much larger lakeshore experience in this park.
- Thoughts of a new swimming beach should be directed to the shoreline along the existing residential properties as the lakeshore in this area has a nice sand bottom that gradually deepens as you get further into the lake. Plan elements that require the construction of additional buildings and engineering infrastructure in Olin Park need to be postponed until

Madison fully commits to acquiring all of the residential properties east of 330 East Lakeside Street. That is the time to start the design phase for a new building or set of buildings that are set back more from the lake and provide a better lakeshore experience than what is currently possible with the land that the city now controls.

- The draft master plan needs to be presented to the public for comment and a final revision before it is approved by the LMW Ad-hoc Committee.. The public has been left out of the design process ever since the last public presentation of the draft plan on July 24. The draft plan has changed significantly since then and needs to have the public process restored and additional public comments reviewed by the committee before they vote to approve a draft plan and send it to the Common Council.