



Project Address: 1139 Williamson Street
Application Type: Demolition Permit and Conditional Use
Legistar File ID # [48152](#)
Prepared By: Timothy M. Parks, Planning Division
Report includes comments from other City agencies, as noted.

Summary

Applicant & Property Owner: Michael & Elaine Chan, 1139 Williamson, LLC; 130 Driftwood Lane; Trumbull, Connecticut.

Contact Person: Todd Barnett, Barnett Architecture, LLC; 118 N. Breese Terrace; Madison.

Requested Action: Approval of a demolition permit and conditional use to demolish a single-family residence and construct a two-family two-unit residence at 1139 Williamson Street.

Proposal Summary: The applicants are seeking approval to demolish a single-family residence and construct a building containing two (2) three-bedroom flats. The project is scheduled to commence this October, with completion of the project anticipated in April 2018.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Two-family two-unit dwellings are conditional uses in the TR-V2 (Traditional Residential–Varied 2 District). Section 28.183 provides the process and standards for the approval of conditional use permits. Section 28.185 provides the process and standards for the approval of demolition and removal permits.

Review Required By: Plan Commission.

Summary Recommendations: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find the standards met and **approve** a demolition permit and conditional use to demolish a single-family residence and construct a two-family two-unit residence at 1139 Williamson Street subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions from reviewing agencies beginning on page 5 of this report.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is a 5,016 square-foot (0.12-acre) parcel located on the southeasterly side of Williamson Street, approximately 175 feet west of S. Few Street; Third Lake Ridge Historic District; Aldermanic District 6 (Rummel); Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The site is developed with a one-story building constructed between 1925 and 1927 as a commercial building. The building was later converted into a one-bedroom, 630 square-foot single-family residence according to City records. The site is zoned TR-V2 (Traditional Residential–Varied 2 District).

Surrounding Land Uses and Zoning:

North: Spirit gas station and two-story mixed-use buildings, zoned TSS (Traditional Shopping Street District) and PD; single-family residences, zoned TR-V2 (Traditional Residential–Varied 2 District);

South: Single-, two- and multi-family dwellings, zoned TR-C4 (Traditional Residential–Consistent 4 District);

West: Two-dwellings, zoned TR-V2; El Sabor de Puebla restaurant, zoned TSS;

East: Single- and two-family buildings, zoned TR-V2 and TSS.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan identifies the subject site and adjacent properties for High-Density Residential development.

The subject site is also located within the boundaries of the 1994 Marquette-Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Plan. The south side of the 1100-block of Williamson Street is identified as part of “Williamson Street Residential Area D”. This area is located between the existing and planned Williamson Street commercial nodes to the west and east centered at S. Paterson Street and S. Baldwin Street, respectively, and is characterized by mostly two-story single-family, two-family and three-family residential structures and an occasional commercial use. Construction of new residential structures is recommended to be medium-high density, include units of three bedrooms or more for families, and include an income mix of units. The plan recommends that, in some cases, substandard housing could be replaced with aesthetically pleasing developments and higher quality, energy efficient units. New construction and exterior remodeling on Williamson Street should reflect the aesthetic, overall character, and scale of existing buildings, and any parking provided should be placed in the rear or underground out of street view.

The 2004 Williamson Street Design Guidelines and Criteria for Preservation – 600-1100 Blocks include numerous design guidelines and criteria applicable to the site. A full analysis of the design recommendations applicable to this project follows.

Zoning Summary: The subject property is zoned TR-V2 (Traditional Residential–Varied 2 District):

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	4,000 sq. ft.	5,016 sq. ft.
Lot Width	40'	38' (Existing)
Minimum Front Yard	20' 12.86' front setback average (Section 28.031(1))	18'
Maximum Front Yard Setback	30' or up to 20% greater than block average	18'
Side Yard Setback	Two-story: 6' 3.8' per Section 28.048(2)(a)	3' 9" East 10' 2" West
Rear Yard Setback	Lesser of 25% lot depth or 25'	Adequate
Usable Open Space	500 sq. ft. per unit (1,000 sq. ft.)	1,028 sq. ft.
Maximum Lot Coverage	70%	Less than 70% (See conditions)
Building Height	2 stories/ 35'	2 stories (See conditions)
Building Form	Commercial Block Building	Will comply (See conditions)
Automobile Parking	1	2
Bicycle Parking	N/A	0
Other Critical Zoning Items		
Yes:	Landmarks Commission (Third Lake Ridge), Utility Easements	
No:	Urban Design, Wellhead Protection, Floodplain, Waterfront Development, Barrier Free	
<i>Prepared by: Jenny Kirchgatter, Asst. Zoning Administrator</i>		

Environmental Corridor Status: The property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: The site is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicants are seeking approval of a demolition permit and conditional use to demolish a single-family residence and construct a two-family two unit dwelling on an approximately 5,000 square-foot parcel located at 1139 Williamson Street, approximately 175 feet west of S. Few Street in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

The building to be demolished is a one-story building constructed between 1925 and 1927 as a commercial building according to City records. The building was later converted into a one-bedroom single-family residence, with the existing gabled roof added sometime in the 1980s. The residence has 630 square feet of floor area and a partial basement, as is characterized by its placement adjacent to the Williamson Street sidewalk compared to the other mostly residential structures in this block, which are set back further from the street beyond roughly 15- to 20-foot front yards. The unique placement of the building on the subject site owes to its original construction as a commercial building. Photos of the interior and exterior of the residence and an assessment of its condition are included with the application materials.

The proposed two-family residence will be set back 18 feet from the front property line adjacent to Williamson Street on the 38-foot wide and 132-foot deep parcel, and will be placed closer to the easterly side property line to allow a 10-foot wide driveway in the westerly side yard that will lead to three auto parking stalls and a trash enclosure in the rear yard of the proposed residence. The proposed building will be a modern interpretation of a historic stacked two-flat building, with an exterior clad in horizontal fiber cement siding, and a combination of flat and gabled roof forms. Each of the proposed units will contain three bedrooms, two bathrooms and 1,375 square feet of living space, as shown on the attached floorplans. The new building will have a full, unfinished basement.

Analysis and Conclusion

In addition to requiring Plan Commission approval to allow demolition of the existing single-family residence using the standards in Section 28.185 of the Zoning Code, the subject site is zoned TR-V2, which identifies two-family two-unit (flats) dwellings and two-family twin home dwellings (duplexes) as conditional uses requiring Plan Commission approval following the standards in Section 28.183.

The Planning Division believes that the Plan Commission can find the standards met to allow the demolition and new construction proposed. The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District, which requires that the Landmarks Commission grant Certificates of Appropriateness for both the demolition and new construction per MGO Chapter 41. The Landmarks Commission granted both approvals at its June 5, 2017 meeting, expressing little or no concern for the demolition of the existing small building, and support for the construction of the new two-family residence subject to the project team and the Amy Scanlon, the City's Preservation Planner, working out final details of the new structure, as noted in the attached Landmarks Commission reports.

While the information provided by the applicants indicates that the existing building is in average or better condition, the Planning Division believes that demolition of the existing residence may be supported due to its diminutive size and unique placement adjacent to the sidewalk. Construction of the proposed two-family dwelling will be more economically productive and at least as consistent with the historic character of the block

and larger historic district than any attempt to expand or repurpose the existing building. Staff does not believe that the proposed two-family residence will have a negative impact on the uses, values and enjoyment of surrounding properties, and that the project reflects many of the recommendations for new development along this section of Williamson Street contained in adopted plans.

The 1994 Marquette-Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Plan identifies the south side of the 1100-block of Williamson Street as part of "Williamson Street Residential Area D," which is located between the existing and planned Williamson Street commercial nodes to the west and east centered at S. Paterson Street and S. Baldwin Street, respectively, and is characterized by mostly two-story single-family, two-family and three-family residential structures and an occasional commercial use. Construction of new residential structures is recommended to be medium-high density and include units with three bedrooms or more to support families. The plan recommends that, in some cases, substandard housing could be replaced with aesthetically pleasing developments and higher quality, energy efficient units. New construction and exterior remodeling on Williamson Street should reflect the aesthetic, overall character, and scale of existing buildings, and any parking provided should be placed in the rear or underground out of street view. The redevelopment of "underutilized properties" is identified in the plan as an opportunity to increase the housing stock in the neighborhood, including along Williamson Street.

The proposed two-family residence is also consistent with most of the numerous design guidelines and criteria applicable to the site in the 2004 Williamson Street Design Guidelines and Criteria for Preservation – 600-1100 Blocks. In particular, the architecture of the new building follows the recommendation that new buildings be products of their time, but be inspired by the basic forms and details of their historic surroundings as reflected in the overall scale of construction and sensitive use of massing, articulation, materials, and structural forms. The new residence is also consistent with the guideline that new construction generally be limited in height to two and a half-stories along most of Williamson Street, including the subject site.

The guidelines also recommend that the front yard setback of new residential buildings not be less than fifteen feet, except that one-story unenclosed front porches may encroach up to six feet into the minimum setback. Variation in the above requirements may be allowed in that a new building's setback should be related to the setback pattern established by the adjacent buildings and the existing context. If setbacks in a block are varied, new residential construction can be located at a setback that is the average of the setback distances of the five adjacent residential buildings on either side, but no closer to the property line than six feet regardless of the setback of adjacent buildings. As noted in earlier sections of this report, the proposed two-family residence will be set back 18 feet from the front property line at Williamson Street. Sheet 7 of the plan set includes a survey of the front setbacks of all of the buildings and front porches on the south side of the 1100-block of Williamson Street, which generally suggests that the front yards in the block increase in depth from west to east, with setbacks less than 15 feet generally west of the subject site, and setbacks exceeding 20 feet in most cases to the east.

The TR-V2 zoning district requires a 20-foot front yard setback for new construction. However, Section 28.031(1) of the Zoning Code allows the front yard setback to be averaged where at least 50% of the front footage of any block is built up with principal structures such that the minimum front yard setback for new structures shall be the average setback of the existing principal structures on the block face or the normal setback requirement in the district, whichever is less, with not less than a 10-foot front yard setback allowed. The proposed 18-foot front setback proposed exceeds the front yard setback average of the block, which is 12.86 feet according to the Zoning Administrator. However, the placement of the building was a concern expressed to the Landmarks Commission by Ms. Scanlon, who generally felt that a setback for the new building more consistent with the 20-foot setback required by zoning would create "a rhythm of masses and spaces compatible with other patterns in

the historic district and within the immediate context of the subject site,” particularly three of the four houses to the east between the site and S. Few Street, which are set back 20 or more feet. The Landmarks Commission discussed the setback of the new building during its June 5 hearing, but no firm position was taken on that issue or many of the others identified in the Landmarks staff report.

Therefore, the Planning Division believes that it would be appropriate for the Plan Commission to consider the front setback as it considers whether the new building reflects the normal and orderly development standards for demolition permits and conditional uses. While the 18-foot front setback proposed is allowable by virtue of setback averaging, Planning and Zoning staff feel that a 20-foot setback per the TR-V2 district requirements would create a greater environment of sustained aesthetic desirability that reflects both the historic and planned pattern of development in the 1100-block, given that any other new buildings or additions to existing ones are more likely to be set back deeper on nearby lots, not less. The 20-foot setback would be consistent with the setbacks of buildings on either side of the subject site, as well as two additional homes to the east between the site and S. Few Street, and there appears to be space at the rear of the proposed building to accommodate the two additional feet of setback sought in the front yard.

In conclusion, the Planning Division believes that the standards for approval can be met and recommends approval of the proposed two-family two-unit dwelling subject to a 20-foot front yard setback being provided.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendations (Contact Timothy M. Parks, 261-9632)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find the standards met and **approve** a demolition permit and conditional use to demolish a single-family residence and construct a two-family two-unit residence at 1139 Williamson Street subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

Recommended Conditions of Approval: Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division

1. That the proposed building be set back 20 feet from the front property line.

City Engineering Division (Contact Tim Troester, 267-1995)

2. Prior to approval, the owner or owner's representative shall obtain a permit to plug each existing sanitary sewer lateral that serves a building that is proposed for demolition. For each lateral to be plugged the owner shall complete a sewer lateral plugging application and pay the applicable permit fees.
3. The applicant shall replace all sidewalk and curb and gutter that abuts the property that is damaged by the construction, or any sidewalk and curb and gutter, which the City Engineer determines needs to be replaced because it is not at a desirable grade, regardless of whether the condition existed prior to beginning construction.
4. All work in the public right of way shall be performed by a City-licensed contractor.
5. All damage to the pavement on Williamson Street adjacent to this development shall be restored in accordance with the City's Pavement Patching Criteria.

City Engineering Division – Mapping Section (Contact Jeff Quamme, 266-4097)

6. The address of the first floor apartment is 1139 Williamson Street, APT 101; the address of the second floor apartment is 1139 Williamson Street, APT 201. The site plan shall reflect a proper street address of the property as reflected by official City of Madison Assessor's and Engineering Division records.

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, 266-6527)

This agency reviewed the request and has recommended no conditions of approval.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

7. The Madison Fire Department recommends the installation of a residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA 13D.
8. Please consider allowing Madison Fire Department to conduct training sequences prior to demolition. Contact Capt. Jerry Buechner of the MFD Training Division to discuss this possibility at (608) 516-9195.

Water Utility (Contact Adam Wiederhoeft, 266-9121)

9. A private well may have served this parcel prior to the municipal water service connection. Any remaining unused/unpermitted private wells existing on this parcel must be properly abandoned according to Wisconsin Administrative Code NR 812 and MGO Section 13.21 prior to the demolition of the property. Please contact water utility staff at (608) 266-4654 for additional information regarding well abandonment procedures and potential well abandonment reimbursement programs.
10. The Madison Water Utility shall be notified to remove the water meter at least two working days prior to demolition. Contact the Water Utility Meter Department at (608) 266-4765 to schedule the meter removal appointment.

Parks Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, 261-9688)

11. Park Impact Fees will be due as part of the permitted use approval for this project. Park Impact Fees (comprised of the Park Infrastructure Impact Fee, per MGO Sec. 20.08(2)), and Park-Land Impact Fees, per MGO Sec. 16.23(8)(f) and 20.08(6) will be required for all new residential development associated with this project. This development is within the West Park-Infrastructure Impact Fee district. Please reference ID# 17137 when contacting Parks Division staff about this project.

12. Existing street trees shall be protected. Please include the following note on the site plan: Contractor shall install tree protection fencing in the area between the curb and sidewalk and extend it at least 5 feet from both sides of the tree along the length of the terrace. No excavation is permitted within 5 feet of the outside edge of a tree trunk. If excavation within 5 feet of any tree is necessary, contractor shall contact City Forestry (266-4816) prior to excavation to assess the impact to the tree and root system. Tree pruning shall be coordinated with City Forestry. Tree protection specifications can be found in Section 107.13 of City of Madison Standard Specifications for Public Works Construction. Any tree removals that are required for construction after the development plan is approved will require at least a 72-hour waiting period before a tree removal permit can be issued by Forestry, to notify the Alder of the change in the tree plan.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, 266-4429)

13. Section 28.185(7)(a)5 requires that if a demolition or removal permit is approved, it shall not be issued until the reuse and recycling plan is approved by the Recycling Coordinator, Bryan Johnson (608-266-4682). Section 28.185(10) requires that every person who is required to submit a reuse and recycling plan pursuant to Section 28.185(7)(a)5 shall submit documents showing compliance with the plan within sixty (60) days of completion of demolition. A demolition or removal permit is valid for one (1) year from the date of the Plan Commission.
14. Verify the lot coverage and provide a calculation with the final plans. The lot coverage maximum is 70%. Lot coverage is defined as the total area of all buildings, measured at grade, all accessory structures including pools, patios, etc., and all paved areas as a percentage of the total area of the lot, with the following exceptions: sidewalks or paved paths no wider than five (5) feet, pervious pavement, green roofs and decks.
15. Show the height of the proposed two-family building on the elevations. The maximum height is 35 feet. Height is the average of the height of all building facades. For each facade, height is measured from the midpoint of the existing grade to the highest point on the roof of the building or structure. No individual facade shall be more than 15% higher than the maximum height of the zoning district.
16. Provide the area and a detail of the proposed green roof.
17. Per Section 28.186(4)(b) of the Zoning Code, the property owner or operator is required to bring the property into compliance with all elements of the approved site plans by the date established by the Zoning Administrator as part of the site and building plan approval. Work with Zoning staff to establish a final site compliance date for this project/ site.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency reviewed the request and has recommended no conditions of approval.