## City of Madison, Wisconsin

**REPORTED BACK:** 

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PRESENTED: January 25, 2006

TITLE: 4302 East Washington Avenue – **REFERRED:** 

Demolition and New Construction, Starbucks with Drive-Up Window in Urban Design District No. 5 – 17<sup>th</sup> Ald

Dist.

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary ADOPTED: POF:

DATED: January 25, 2006 **ID NUMBER:** 

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Lisa Geer, Robert March, Michael Barrett, and Jack Williams.

Members Excused: Bruce Woods and Cathleen Feland.

## **SUMMARY**:

At its meeting of January 25, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED CONSIDERATION** of the demolition and construction of a "Starbuck's" restaurant with a drive-up window located at 4302 East Washington Avenue in Urban Design District No. 5. Appearing on behalf of the project were Joel Lome and Michael Achim, both representing Starbucks. Appearing in opposition to the project was Paul E. Ludwiczak. The project as presented provides for the demolition of an existing retail commercial building on the site currently housing a picture frame shop in order to construct a "Starbuck's" with drive-up window on the site. The proposed building is oriented to its Continental Lane frontage off-set by queuing for the proposed drive-up window. An existing cross-access easement incorporating a private access road across the front of the site parallel to its East Washington Avenue frontage provides access to an adjoining hotel to the north. Across the access drive perpendicular to the property's East Washington Avenue frontage are proposed surface parking stalls. The building features an all brick masonry façade in a range of three earth colors with warm tones. Pedestrian entries to the building are provided on its end or east elevation, as well as a main entry off of its north elevation. The proposed drive-up window is located on the south elevation with an egress door incorporated on the west end elevation. A canopy element has been incorporated on both the north main entry elevation, as well as over the south elevation's drive-up window. Wall signage is generally limited to the north and east elevations providing for a "Starbuck's Coffee" graphic, and a drive-thru graphic with a logo provided on the north elevation. Ground signage details were presented featuring a pole sign on the northerly boundary of the site adjacent to the hotel development, a menu board and directional signage consistent with the Street Graphics Control Ordinance. It was noted by the Commission that details of this signage were not contained within the application packet. Following the presentation the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Concern with noise from the drive-thru operation's speakers, traffic impacts onto Continental Lane and kids hanging out.
- Concern with pedestrian-friendly issues; currently unfriendly, still needs sufficient address.

- Provide details as to the ongoing discussions relative to a shared parking arrangement with the adjacent hotel.
- Issue with reorienting building to get its broad face oriented to East Washington Avenue, in addition to providing for additional landscaping, and the relocation of the drive-up window.
- The optional surface parking stalls along East Washington Avenue are above code required levels; consider their elimination to increase the amount of landscaping and less impervious area.
- Stormwater/drainage issues are unaddressed due to the lack of adequate plans within the packet.
- The plans as submitted appear to feature approximately 90%+ coverage of the lot; need to provide for some level of on-site infiltration.
- The pole sign details which were not provided in the packet need to conform to the Urban Design District requirements, specifically providing for light colored graphics on a dark background for internally illuminated signage.
- Need to provide detailed information as to lighting types (cut sheets).
- Need to see type of bike rack to be provided consistent with Zoning Code requirements.
- The Zoning Code requires that the landscape plan be prepared and stamped by a registered landscape architect. The plans as submitted do not address this requirement.
- Concern with landscaping, specifically large shrubs along the drive-thru window in regards to safety, which allows people to hide within the 6-8 foot shrubs as proposed. The shrubs should be no taller than 5-feet in height.
- The landscape plan provides for only one shade tree; the amount of paving requires more. Provide at least one more tree in the parking island with additional smaller trees distributed across the site to provide for more diversity in the plant palette; for example, perennials, in addition, add a shade tree in the island within the outdoor eating area.
- Provide more opportunity for on-site drainage and make drive aisle wider next to the drive-up window to accommodate water flow.
- Consider adding more windows on the drive-up side of the building (south and west elevations) such as high windows for daylighting treatments, as well as architectural treatment to resolve blank façades.

## **ACTION**:

On a motion by March, seconded by Host-Jablonski, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED CONSIDERATON** of a demolition and new construction located at 4302 East Washington Avenue in Urban Design District No. 5. The motion for referral required address of the above, in addition to providing alternative site plan design options and coordinating with the neighboring hotel on site access issues. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4, 4, 4, 5, 5, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4302 East Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	3	-	-	2	4	4
	5	5	3	5	-	4	5	5
	5	6	5	7	7	6	6	6
	3	5	2	5	6	2	4	4
	3.5	5.5	-	-	-	-	-	4
	4	5	2	6	-	4	5	3
	5	6	5	8	-	4	5	5
	4	7	5	6	6	4	7	6

## General Comments:

- Needs more infiltration area and shade; i.e. less parking.
- Loss of parking spaces facing East Washington will provide more green space and lessen attractiveness to after-hours parking.
- Concern about increased traffic at Continental intersection, which is already a bad intersection. Needs pedestrian linkage to hotel. Rotate building. Any way for building to touch Continental Street sidewalk?
- Conception of site plan is not fully cooked. They need to look at more alternatives.
- Add small trees along side and in island for shade and to reduce heat. Large shrubs along drive thru are a place where people can hide and may be too imposing. Windows are needed on the drive thru façade. Drainage for the site over all is a concern, the natural flow is inhibited by the retaining walls and infiltration is hampered by the lack of green space.
- Awkward traffic routing. Landscaping needs more thought.
- Look at building orientation.