



City of Madison

Meeting Minutes - Final

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Wednesday, October 3, 2007

5:00 PM

Parks Conference Room
Room 120 MMB

1 Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 5:13 pm by Vice-Chairperson Sue Gleason

2 Roll Call

Present: Peng Her, Zachariah Brandon, Victoria S. Selkove, Susan M. Gleason, Richard A. Slone, Sandra J. Torkildson and Noel T. Radomski

Excused: Edward G. Clarke and Ralph Kauten

Staff present: Joseph Gromacki, City TIF Coordinator; Mario Mendoza, Mayor's Office Business and Legislative Liaison; Matthew B Mikolajewski, Office of Business Resources Manager; Peggy Yessa, Office of Business Resources.

3 Chair Election

Alder Brandon moved, seconded by Selkove, to have Sue Gleason continue serving as Vice-Chairperson until the EDC has its full membership, and to keep this item on each agenda. The motion passed by acclamation.

6 Presentation on Workforce Development

Vice-Chairperson Gleason announced that Ms. Pat Schram, the speaker for agenda Item 6, will be rescheduled. The EDC discussed if Ms. Schram's presentation should be to the entire EDC or just the Workforce Development Subcommittee. They requested that Ms. Schram be invited to present at the EDC meeting in December.

(this item was taken out of order)

Introduction of New Member

Mr. Peng Her was introduced as the newest member of the EDC. He owns a business on the eastside of Madison.

4 Public Comment

The following are people who registered to speak and a summary of their comments:

Mr. Mario Mendoza, Mayor's Office Business and Legislative Liaison, introduced Mr. William Clingan, nominee for new Economic and Community Development Division Director. Mr. Mendoza spoke on Mr. Clingan's impressive career as a manager at the Wisconsin Department of Workforce Development.

Mr. Clingan said that he is interested in keeping the lines of communication open, and that he has a commitment to work together.

Ms. Susan Schmitz, President of and representing Downtown Madison Incorporated

(DMI), explained DMI is not a business organization but rather a downtown organization that is opposed to the hiring of Mr. Clingan. DMI feels Mr. Clingan does not have the skills for business development. The Mayor's interview process was advisory, however many people did volunteer their time to participate and thought their opinions would be considered.

Ms. Judy Olson, 518 Clemons Street, spoke in favor of Mr. Clingan's appointment. She was involved in writing the job description and served on the interview panel. She was honored to do this. As an interviewer she knew it would be difficult to find the right person. No one person had all the skills. She knew the Mayor would make the final decision and she was serving in an advisory capacity. She feels managerial skills are the most important and the selection of Mr. Clingan was good.

Ms. Teresa Tellez-Giroi, 5325 Brady Drive, #101, supports the Mayor's choice of Mr. Clingan. She has known Bill for 15 years and worked with him in the Latino community. She feels he knows the community and takes extra steps to meet people. She worked with him on the Contacto Latino program he started. He also helped her in her run to be on the Madison School Board. He is known to take extra personal time to make Madison better for all and our children.

Ms. Shiva Bidar-Sieloff, 2704 Kendall Avenue, spoke in favor of Mr. Clingan's appointment. She was on the Police Chief selection team and knows how hard the process is. She did her homework and feels Mr. Clingan understands all sides of the community. She offered the Cornell University definition of economic development: "Economic development is typically measured in terms of jobs and income, but it also includes improvements in human development, education, health, choice and environmental sustainability. Business and economic developers in the US are increasingly recognizing the importance of quality of life, which includes, environmental, and recreational amenities, as well as social infrastructure such as child care, in attracting and retaining businesses in a community." She does not want to pit businesses against human services. Mr. Clingan can assess needs and balance them all.

Questions to Susan Schmitz:

What specific business skills noted in the job description were missing from Mr. Clingan's application?

Ms. Schmitz responded she did not have her notes with her and that DMI has been following this process a long time. DMI was expecting someone with more business skills, based on presentations to the DMI Board by Janet Pirano, the Mayor's Chief of Staff.

What was DMI looking for?

Ms. Schmitz responded they were looking for someone with economic development background.

Are there any "red flags" other than lack of economic development experience?

No, the position is too broad.

Any reservations that Mr. Clingan can step in?

This a leadership position so there is no time for learning economic development.

Question to Mr. Mendoza:

How many qualified applicants were there?

Thirteen. There were six or seven people at the oral board and three final interviews.

Mr. Juan Jose Lopez, 2532 Fairfield Place, spoke in support of Mr. Clingan's appointment. He feels Mr. Clingan: 1) cares about people; 2) has been through tough times on the School Board and worked to connect the business community with the School Board; and 3) is from Madison and cares about it and knows how Madison works and has the ability to work across all sectors. He speaks out to the communities of color to bring people together.

Mr. Donald Studesville, 524 Plaza Drive, registered in support of Mr. Clingan's appointment but did not speak.

Vice-Chairperson Gleason explained that a special EDC meeting will be scheduled before the October 29 meeting of the Board of Estimates for the EDC to act on the Bill Clingan appointment resolution.

5 Minutes of the September 5 and September 12 meetings

A motion was made by Slone, seconded by Torkildson, to Approve the Minutes of the September 5 and September 12 meetings. The motion passed by acclamation.

7 EDC 2008 Meeting Schedule

There was a motion by Her, seconded by Slone, to change the October 8 meeting to October 1, in order to avoid the Yom Kipper holiday. The motion passed by acclamation.

[07642](#)

Proposed Economic Development Commission Meeting Schedule for 2008

Attachments: 2008 Meeting ScheduleRev-1.doc

8 Dissolving TID #24

[07522](#)

Dissolving Tax Incremental District (TID) #24 (Southeast Industrial).

Attachments: TID #24 Map.pdf, Mayor TID Closure Memo.doc

The Commissioners had the following questions for Mr. Joseph Gromacki, City TIF Coordinator:

Question: If TID # 24 is dissolved can a new district be created?

Yes, district boundaries need to be drawn and projects are needed. The Common Council, Joint Review Board, and State Department of Revenue all review and need to approve a new district.

Question: Does staff see new generators for a new TID in that area?

Right now a generator does not exist. However, there is a potential generator. Industrial TIDs are different and are more speculative as the area may be developed.

Question: Does the City policy say where the windfall dollars from TID # 24 should go?

There are no models from other cities or policies in Madison or elsewhere that say where the windfall goes.

Question: Is it possible to have a policy to specify where the City's portion of the windfall goes?

It goes into the City's general fund. Council could set a policy.

Question: Does closing the TID send a mixed message to potential businesses to develop in this area?

Mr. Gromacki does not think it sends a mixed message. TID # 24 performed very well and accomplished its project plan goals.

Alder Judy Compton spoke in favor of keeping TID # 24 open. She said she is not in favor of high-rise downtown condos as TID projects. She mentioned TID #24 only created 4000 jobs not the 9,000 jobs called for in the project plan. She supports high tech businesses to locate in TID # 24 and the building of the BioAg incubator. She feels TID # 24's potential is coming to fruition and we are taking away the "carrot" for businesses to locate here if TID # 24 is closed. It would help to create a new TID before this one closes. Madison needs jobs and this is the place for them. She asked the EDC to keep TID # 24 open and use the money we already have for business attraction from it instead of opening a new TID and borrowing money.

Vice-Chairperson Gleason commented the EDC has spent a lot of time over the years looking at creating jobs and industrial TIDS.

Mr. Gromacki commented that the Comptrollers Office, auditors, the State Department of Revenue and the City Attorney all conclude the project plan goals have been met and this district is done. State law calls for excess increment to be given to the taxing jurisdictions.

Alder Compton asked the EDC to defer their recommendation until after her October meeting with the Mayor.

Alder Brandon explained his four aspects of TID; the economic development, job creation aspect; the legal aspect; the financial aspect; and the Joint Board of Review partnership aspect. The other taxing entities have a say in a TID, it is not all the City's money. Sixty-seven percent (67%) of the money goes to the other, non-city, entities. He feels the EDC can only comment on the economic development/job creation aspect of TID #24. TID # 24 is not a failure. Alder Brandon supports the creation of a new TID.

Further discussion:

Mr. Radomski said the EDC should wait and see what happens at the October 11 meeting.

Ms. Selkove said the state statute is clear about closing a TID. The Board of Estimates will look at the fiscal reasons for closing TID # 24.

Question: IF TID # 24 was kept open would more jobs be created and has all the work been completed?

Mr. Gromacki said that Engineering has identified possible projects that would total less than \$500,000 when completed. A slip ramp could be constructed for access to the bridge over Highway 12& 18, but the State Department of Transportation could pay for that.)

A motion was made by Selkove, seconded by Brandon, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES. The motion failed by the following vote:

Excused: Clarke and Kauten

Aye: Her, Brandon and Selkove

No: Gleason, Slone, Torkildson and Radomski

A motion was made by Brandon, seconded by Radomski, to Rerefer to the ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION. Discussion and voting on this matter will be at the November 7, 2007, Economic Development Commission meeting. The motion passed by acclamation.

9 Dissolving TID #28

[07523](#)

Dissolving Tax Incremental District (TID) #28 (Bassett Neighborhood).

Attachments: TID #28 2007 Map.pdf, Mayor TID Closure Memo.doc

It was noted that discussion on this closure could use the same arguments as those in closing TID # 24.

A motion was made by Brandon, seconded by Radomski, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES. The motion passed by acclamation.

10 Report and Action on Possible Amendment to 3-5 Year Strategic Implementation Plan Contract with Ticknor & Associates

[07647](#)

Possible amendment to the existing 3 - 5 Year Strategic Implementation Plan contract with Ticknor and Associates

Attachments: EDC Memo 10-3-07.doc, Ticknor Interviews 10-1-07.doc

Matthew B Mikolajewski, Office of Business Resources Manager, outlined the 5 items to discuss:

- 1. Project Team Composition*
- 2. Outreach by Consultant*
- 3. Interviews by Consultant*
- 4. Fund raising for additional work by the consultant*
- 5. Review of the comparable cities list*

Mr. Mikolajewski explained the City Attorney's advice to not have non-EDC members as the Project Team. The EDC can invite others to speak but not as Team members.

Mr. Mikolajewski reviewed his memo that outlined additional public participation and outreach opportunities specifically adding additional interviews by Mr. Ticknor and adding more listening sessions and the costs of these items.

Staff will look into the possibility of Mr. Landau doing more of the interviews since his billing rate is less than Mr. Ticknor's.

Including non-profit businesses in the listening session is important and they should not be excluded because of their client base.

The EDC is willing to take on fund raising for the additional items but realizes it might take some time and expressed concern about starting work before funds are available to pay for the work.

Ms. Selkove questioned whether there should be a specific listening session for non-profits.

There were further questions about the existence of an umbrella organization of all non-profit businesses. It was noted that there is no such organization that can speak for all non-profit businesses.

A motion was made by Slone, seconded by Brandon, to Approve the revised public participation approach as outlined and to begin fund raising accordingly. The motion passed by acclamation.

Richard Slone left the meeting at 7:22 pm. A quorum was still present.

Present: Peng Her, Zachariah Brandon, Victoria S. Selkove, Susan M. Gleason, Sandra J. Torkildson and Noel T. Radomski

Excused: Richard A. Slone, Edward G. Clarke and Ralph Kauten

Discussion continued on the list of interviews. It was questioned whether the Council members need to be interviewed as they will have opportunity to comment on the plan at various meetings. It was noted that it would be difficult to get the non-retail, non-food related small businesses involved. Perhaps Milwaukee 7 does not need to be interviewed.

Staff was asked to send the two interviews lists to all EDC members and ask them to pick the top 20 interviews. If these are sent to staff by 4 pm on Monday, October 8, the project can continue to move forward before the list is finalized.

Discussion on the selection of the comparable cities was led by Mr. Mikolajewski. It was suggested that cities close to Madison such as Middleton and Fitchburg be explored.

The purpose of reviewing this list is to look at other cities' processes and programs, and not just their demographics.

Staff was asked to find out if data already gathered by businesses that had visited Boulder, Colorado, could be used and given to the consultant. Could Staff explore communities such as Middleton, rather than Ticknor & Associates?

11 Workforce Development Subcommittee Report

There was no report.

12 Office of Business Resources Report

There was no report.

13 Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development Report

There was no report.

14 Adjournment

It was moved by Selkove, seconded by Brandon, to adjourn the meeting. The motion passed by acclamation and the meeting was adjourned at 7:40 pm.