

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 6, 2023

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1130 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and an addition

Legistar File ID # [76203](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: February 28, 2023

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Brian and Jessica Spiegel

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing one-story rear addition and construction of a new two-story rear addition.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 1. New additions on the front of the principal structure are prohibited, except for restoring or reconstructing missing historic features that can be documented.
 2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
 3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
 - (b) Materials and Features

1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
 2. New additions that destroy significant historic materials or character-defining features are prohibited.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.
 - (b) Wood
 1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
 - (b) Materials
 1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
 2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 - (b) Windows and Storm Windows
 1. Simulated divided lights are permitted with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
 2. Storm windows shall minimally obscure the window beneath and have a non-reflective coating.
 - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
 1. Doors shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
 2. New door openings shall have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.
 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view and have a non-reflective coating.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (a) Porch Elements
 1. The style of porch posts, balusters and rails shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic porch but, in most cases, not duplicate the historic features.
 2. Spaces beneath porches and stairs shall be enclosed with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards, masonry, or other openwork design.
 3. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.
- (7) Building Systems
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
 2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
 3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to demolish an existing single-story rear addition and construct a new two-story addition to the rear of the historic house on the property. The existing structure was constructed in 1889 and it is a front-gabled vernacular Victorian home.

The overall design appears to meet the historic district standards and the addition, while slightly taller than the existing structure and creating a substantial additional footprint, is substantially stepped back from the front of the existing structure and fits in the context of the taller historic resources in the vicinity. The addition will not overwhelm the character of the historic resource at the front of the property. There are some details about materials that still need to be finalized.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 1. The new addition is located on the rear of the existing structure, with a projecting element visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 2. The new addition is taller than the existing historic resource, but the taller addition is set back 24.5-feet from the front of the structure. The addition is not substantially taller than the existing structure and the substantial step back allows for this taller addition to read as secondary to the historic resource with detailing that makes it compatible with the character of the existing structure.
 3. The addition is visually separated from the historic portion of the building with a vertical trim-board where the wall-planes meet and the different in roof heights.
 4. The windows on the new addition are largely of a similar proportion to the historic with some slightly smaller windows on the west elevation. There is an irregular rhythm of windows on the existing structure and the proposed windows on the addition do not detract from the arrangement of openings on the existing. The largest departure in rhythm of window openings is on the back of the addition, which will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 5. There is no information on potential mechanical equipment locations related to the addition.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. The proposal is to remove a later-period single-story addition and construct a new addition at the rear of the historic structure.
 2. No historic features of character-defining features will be obscured or destroyed.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 1. The new addition will be of a comparable height to other historic residential structures in the immediate vicinity.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 1. The application simply states that the exterior walls will have a similar material to the existing. Currently the historic resource is clad in vinyl siding, likely over the historic siding. The addition will need to replicate the appearance of the historic siding of the building rather than the nonhistoric later alterations to the exterior.
 - (b) Wood
 1. The new siding will need to replicate the appearance of wood clapboard without a faux woodgrain texture.

- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 - 1. The form and pitch of the roof on the addition is similar and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch of the existing gable roof.
 - (b) Materials
 - 1. The application states that the roofing materials will be similar to the existing. The new roofing materials need to meet the historic district standards.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 - 1. The overall design and style of the doors and windows as represented in the drawings appears to be compatible with the overall design of the historic building. There is one window with only two vertical light on the East elevation rather than the four lights of all other windows. Window specifications will help to confirm the design and style of the proposed windows.
 - 2. The new openings are largely of a similar size to the historic window and door openings. However, without window and door specifications, staff cannot confirm if the operation and finish of the windows and doors will be similar to the historic.
 - (b) Windows and Storm Windows
 - 1. The new windows will need to have either simulated divided light with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass. This can be confirmed with window specifications.
 - 2. It is unclear if the new window openings will also have storm windows.
 - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
 - 1. The drawings in the submittal appear to show a compatible style of door for the addition, but final specifications will confirm this requirement.
 - 2. The door openings appear to have a similar height to width ratio to the historic, but it is unclear if the and finish will be similar to the historic doors of the structure.
 - 3. It is unclear if the two exterior door openings on the addition will have storm doors. Door specifications will clarify this requirement for a full-light storm door.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (a) Porch Elements
 - 1. The application materials specify that the porch shall have a similar design and materials as the current front porch on the historic house. If these are all to be wood that is painted, like the current front porch, then this meets the standards. If there will be alternative materials, then those specifications will need to be reviewed by staff. The overall design is simple and period appropriate.
 - 2. The drawings appear to show vertical screening below the two new porches on the addition.
 - 3. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.
- (7) Building Systems
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 - 1. There is no information on any exterior lighting to be installed on the proposed addition. If there is any lighting proposed, this will need to be approved as either part of this Certificate of Appropriateness (CoA) or a future CoA.
 - 2. If there are any security light fixtures or security cameras, they shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
 - 3. There is no information on any proposed exterior-mounted conduit. If that will be a part of the project scope, it will need approval either as part of this CoA or an additional CoA.
 - 4. Any roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features. If such elements are planned as part of this project, it will need a CoA.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Final siding specifications be approved administratively by staff. Siding will need to replicate the appearance of the historic wood siding, not the current nonhistoric vinyl siding.
2. Final window specifications be approved by staff. Windows shall have either simulated or true divided lights, and all components will replicate the appearance of wood windows, with no wrapping of the of the window opening.
3. Final door, porch, and roofing materials specifications be approved administratively by staff.
4. Any exterior lighting or mechanicals proposed as part of this project scope will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.