

Date: December 7, 2020

To: LORC and staff

From: David Mollenhoff

Subject: Examples that demonstrate the importance of using district-specific standards

For many months now you have asked our Alliance group to give you EXAMPLES that demonstrate the necessity of using district-specific standards. Attached are two examples for just two of our historic districts:

1. The Third Lake Ridge Historic District

This example provides at least 24 examples where the standards of the generic ordinance fail to cover standards that are essential to protect the *unique historic character* of this district. The comparison is based upon the standards developed by the BUILD II committee. The Common Council resolution adopting BUILD II directed staff “to prepare the necessary ordinance amendments” but this was never done.

2. The Marquette Bungalow Historic District

This example provides 25 examples where the standards of the generic ordinance fail to cover standards in the *existing* ordinance that are essential to protect the *unique historic character* of that district.

I should point out that the 25 examples for the Bungalow District are based on analyzing just two sections of the ordinance, new construction and alterations, and did not cover additions and alterations. If we analyzed the other two components of this ordinance, I think we would add at least 10 more exceptions for a total of 35 just for the Bungalow district.

Now the question is: How many more district-specific exceptions are there if we provide the same type of analysis for the other three districts? My guess is that there would be at least another 75, or over 125 district-specific exceptions that somehow have to be incorporated in the ordinance.

Here’s a question that LORC should consider: How can all of these exceptions be incorporated in the generic ordinance without destroying its clarity, coherence, and user-friendliness?

One last point is in order: The purpose of this ordinance should be to preserve the *historic character* of all existing and future historic districts. This can be done only if all of the qualities that constitute historic character are identified and then consistently used for all standards for all districts. We have distilled all of these qualities into 10 “preservation principles.” They appear in 41.11(2) of the Alliance ordinance draft that we submitted to you in March 10, 2020. We would urge you to use them because they provide clear, consistent, and coherent criteria for achieving what we all want to preserve: the *unique historic character* of all existing and future districts.

Attachments:

- The Third Lake Ridge Example: Why District-Specific Standards are Needed
- 12 examples where proposed generic standards fail to cover district-specific standards in the existing ordinance for the Marquette Bungalow District for new construction
- 13 examples where proposed generic standards fail to cover district-specific standards in the existing ordinance for alterations

THE THIRD LAKE RIDGE EXAMPLE: WHY DISTRICT-SPECIFIC STANDARDS ARE NEEDED

The attached chart compares the city staff's proposed uniform standards for new construction in historic districts (7-30-19) to the BUILD II standards for new commercial construction on Williamson Street (part of the Third Lake Ridge Historic District). BUILD II provides district-specific standards that vary by block and by use. The chart compares these general vs. district-specific standards with respect to 2 key parameters: building size and placement.

BUILD II (formally known as *Design Guidelines & Criteria for Preservation: Williamson Street, 600-1100 Blocks*), was created under Common Council directive through a process that sought broad public input. Because of this broad public input, and because the Council directed that BUILD II recommendations be implemented by ordinance, BUILD II standards provide a useful comparison to the uniform general standards now proposed by city staff.

- The BUILD II land use plan was adopted by the Common Council in 2005. The plan was created, in part, by a Dane County Better Urban Infill Development (“BUILD”) grant, matched by funds from the City of Madison, the Marquette Neighborhood Association, and the Greater Williamson Street Business Association. The BUILD program’s purpose is:
 - “... to **plan and implement infill development** through planning grants. Infill development is defined as the economic use of vacant land, or restoration or rehabilitation of existing structures or infrastructure, in already urbanized areas where water, sewer, and other public services are in place, **that maintains the continuity of the original community fabric**. BUILD grants help pay for planning consultants who assist communities with preparation of infill plans.” (emphasis added)
- An advisory committee oversaw the creation of the BUILD II plan. This 12-person advisory committee was made up of 2 Marquette Neighborhood Association representatives, 2 Common Wealth Development representatives, one Greater Williamson Street Business Association representative, one Landmark representative, 5 property owners in the targeted area, 2 residents in the area, and the District Alder. The advisory committee held approximately 30 public meetings, including 5 public forums. Based on this process, the BUILD II advisory committee recommended updated standards for the Third Lake Ridge historic district. The committee recommended specific updated standards for new construction, additions and alterations in that part of the historic district covered by BUILD II. Those standards were included in the BUILD II plan adopted by the Common Council.
- The Common Council resolution adopting BUILD II (RES-05-00074) resolved that: “Planning Unit staff is hereby directed to prepare the necessary ordinance amendments to update the Third Lake Ridge Historic District Ordinance.” To date, that has not been done.

The attached comparison makes abundantly clear that the district-specific BUILD II standards would give clear, detailed guidance to property owners, developers, contractors, architects and Landmarks Commissioners. By contrast, the uniform standards now proposed by staff are so vague that they are nearly meaningless.

Current staff proposal vs. BUILD II standards for new construction on Williamson Street

| July 30 staff proposal | BUILD II standards |
|---|--|
| <p>Visual Size When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade.</p> <p>Architectural Expression When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the building’s modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.</p> | <p>Height In general, maximum 2½ stories above grade. Exceptions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A flat-roofed building on the north side of the 800 or 900 blocks may extend 3 stories above grade. 2. North 600 and 700 blocks, back half (along the bike path) 5 stories/54 feet. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 2 bonus stories, up to a maximum of 85 feet/7 stories, for preservation, affordable housing, structured parking 3. North 600 block, front half along Williamson, western approximate 2/3 maximum of 4 stories, eastern approximate 1/3 3 stories (preservation of the Capitol view) 4. North 700 block, front half along Williamson, western approximate 3/4 maximum of 5 stories/54 feet, eastern approximate 1/4 ½ stories <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 3 stories at mid-block along the Livingston side street, with 1 bonus story for preservation, affordable housing, structured parking 5. North 700 block, back half (along the bike path) 5 stories 6. South 600 block 4 stories 7. South 700 block (Elks Club property), 4 stories. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 1 bonus story available for a project that incorporates significant publicly accessible green space along Lake Monona. 8. North 800-1100 blocks back half (along the bike path) 3 stories. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 1 bonus story for preservation, affordable housing, structured parking - Bonus story in 800 and 900 blocks (which are closer to Williamson than the 1000 and 1100 blocks) must be stepped back at least 45 feet from the property line for residential structures and 30 feet for mixed use, flat roofed structures. The fourth story must be stepped back from the street such that it cannot be seen at sidewalk level from the opposite side of the street 9. Corner features on corner buildings can be higher if the features are comparable in scale to historically representative corner features on Williamson Street. <p>Street Façades</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Maximum of 60 feet in width <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A residential street façade more than 25 feet wide shall be divided into visually distinct masses that are no more than 25 feet wide and that are visually separated from each other by at least 5 feet. - Commercial mixed-use articulation and breaks buildings must be sufficient to maintain the rhythm of masses and spaces of existing commercial and mixed-use buildings in the visually related area <p>Residential facades</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Articulated with dormers, bays, porches, recesses, or other architectural features to visually reduce the apparent mass of the new building and to blend with the details of older existing residential buildings within the visually related area. 2. One or more porches and at least one entry door on the main street facade. 3. The main front entrance shall be scaled large enough to be a focal point on the facade. 4. Finished first floor elevation of the street façade shall be at least 18 and not more than 48 inches above grade (does not apply to north 700 block). <p>Commercial/Mixed-use facades</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. First floor storefronts shall be broken into bays similar in width to those on existing pre-1945 |

| | |
|---|--|
| | <p>storefronts (does not apply to north 700 block).</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Storefronts shall have the general historic pattern of large storefront windows, low kick panels, transom windows, side pilasters and cornices. 3. Finished first floor elevation shall be as close to grade as possible, and shall meet ADA requirements for entrances. 4. For corner buildings, angled corner entrances are encouraged. 5. For buildings with multiple commercial tenants, a sign band should be included in the design to maintain consistency in the building design. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Internal sign illumination, if any, shall be appropriately subdued and shall illuminate only characters or letters – not background. 6. Parapet caps or cornices should be incorporated to terminate the top of façade 7. The first floor window sill height shall be 18” to 36” above grade. 8. Primary entranceways should be easily identifiable as a focal point of the building. Recessed entrances are encouraged. |
| <p>Street Setback When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures.</p> <p>Building Placement. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site.</p> | <p>Street Setbacks</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The street façade of a residential structure, other than a mixed-use structure, shall be located at least 15 feet from the public right-of-way that it faces. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A shorter setback of not less than 6 feet is allowed if the setback is not less than the average setback of other residential structures on the block face. - A one-story unenclosed porch, including stairs, may encroach up to 6 feet into the setback but may not be located less than 6 feet from the public right-of-way. 2. Commercial or mixed-use structure shall be located 2 feet from the public right-of-way that it faces, except that a setback of up to 8 feet may be allowed to accommodate outdoor retail space. <p>Side yard setbacks</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Non-corner lots less than 44 feet wide shall have at least 4 feet on each side, with the sum of the side lot setbacks at least 10 feet. 2. Non-corner over 44 feet wide shall have at least 6 feet on each side, with the sum of the side lot setbacks at least 16 feet. 3. Side lots for corner properties is 8 feet for the side facing the street for residential and 2 feet for commercial and mixed-use. <p>Rear yard setbacks</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Minimum 35 feet <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 16 feet fine if the structure has underground or structured parking - 10 feet for the back half of the 600 block and for the 700 block |

12 examples where proposed generic ordinance standards fail to cover district-specific standards in the existing ordinance for the Marquette Bungalow District for new construction dvm, 12-07-20

| Excerpt from today’s Chapter 41.25 showing the standards for new construction in the MBHD | Excerpt from the 10-27 revision of the generic ordinance covering standards for new construction | 12 examples where standards in the proposed generic ordinance fail to protect the historic character of the MBHD because they do not include standards in the <u>existing</u> ordinance. |
|---|---|--|
| <p>[Note: There’s a problem in interpreting standards for new construction for the MBHD: Its new construction standards are both brief and general, so they do not explicitly cover all of the topics in the new generic ordinance. However, because the MBHD standards for new construction include two words, “match” and “virtually duplicate,” and because the brief and general language includes a long list of topics that address historic character, the brief and general standards should be applied to nearly all categories in the new generic ordinance. We will follow this dictum in our analysis below and we will do it by repeating the brief and general MBHD standards and then highlighting in yellow the pertinent words.]</p> <p>(4) <u>Standards for the Review of New Construction and Fences.</u></p> <p>(b) <u>New Principal Structures.</u> New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.</p> | <p>This draft suffers from two flaws in the general section:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It uses a lower, less restrictive standard, namely, “visual compatibility” rather than “match” and “virtually duplicate.” 2. The language fails to provide an enforceable standard because it says the LC “shall consider” a variety of listed “factors.” This means that the LC may use extremely broad discretion ranging from <u>none</u> to <u>some</u> of the stipulated factors. Only when the LC is directed to consider all factors in a given list can the language become an enforceable standard. <p>(1) <u>General</u></p> <p>(a) <u>Primary Structures</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <u>Requirements.</u> The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. <u>Building Placement.</u> When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site. b. <u>Street Setback.</u> When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures. c. <u>Visual Size.</u> When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade d. <u>Building Form.</u> When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as building type and use, roof | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive “match” and “duplicate” requirement in the existing ordinance. 2) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive “match” and “duplicate” requirement in the existing ordinance. 3) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive “match” and “duplicate” requirement in the existing ordinance. 4) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive “match” and “duplicate” requirement in the existing ordinance. 5) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive “match” and “duplicate” requirement in the existing ordinance. |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| <p>(c) <u>Fences</u>. Chain link, metal mesh and other rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split-rails, are prohibited in the front yard. Fences in the front yard shall not exceed three (3) feet in height.</p> <p>(b) <u>New Principal Structures</u>. New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.</p> | <p>shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression.</p> <p>e. <u>Architectural Expression</u>. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the building’s modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u> (none)</p> <p>(2) <u>Building Site</u></p> <p>(a) <u>General</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. New parking areas, access ramps, trash or mechanical equipment enclosures shall be designed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible, retain the historic relationship between the buildings and the building and the landscape, and are visually compatible with other historic resources in the district.</p> <p>b. Chain link, metal mesh, and composite fences are permitted on elevations not visible from the street.</p> <p>c. Bamboo, reed, vinyl, and rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split-rails, are prohibited.</p> <p>d. Fences in the front yard shall not exceed three (3) feet in height.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p>(3) <u>Exterior Walls</u></p> <p>(a) <u>General</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Materials used for new structures shall be similar in design, scale and architectural appearance to materials that date to the period of significance on historic resources within 200 feet, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as a historic building.</p> <p>The following building materials are prohibited: pebble dash, wide clapboards over six (6) inches in exposure, composite clapboards and vertical panels with faux wood grain texture, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes, and metal and vinyl siding.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> | <p>(6) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive “match” and “duplicate” requirement in the existing ordinance.</p> <p>The generic ordinance covers the standards in the existing ordinance</p> <p>(7) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive language of the existing ordinance.</p> |
|---|---|--|

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| <p>(b) <u>New Principal Structures</u>. New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.</p> <p>(b) <u>New Principal Structures</u>. New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.</p> <p>The general standards for new construction in the MBHD are silent on skylights. (However, in the alterations section, the ordinance asserts that skylights must “be located 10 feet back from the front edge of the main roof.”)</p> <p>(b) <u>New Principal Structures</u>. New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.</p> | <p>(4) <u>Roofs</u></p> <p><u>(a) Form</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Roof form and pitch shall be similar to the form and pitch of the roofs on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.</p> <p>3. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. In a district with a mix of building types, the proposed new structure would need a similar roof form to some of the historic resources within 200 feet.</p> <p><u>(b) Materials</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. The following roof treatments are prohibited: thick wood shakes; corrugated or ribbed metal roofing panels; metal shingles; architectural asphalt shingles that have heavy faux shadowing; and any shingles with scalloped or staggered bottom edges.</p> <p>b. Any roofing material shall be permitted on flat or slightly pitched roofs not visible from the street.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p><u>(c) Skylights</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. If visible from the street, skylight shall be located at least twelve (12) feet back from the front edge of the main roof.</p> <p>b. Skylights shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and framing painted to match the roof material.</p> <p>c. Tubular, arched, domed, or pyramidal shaped skylights are prohibited on elevations visible from the street.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p><u>(d) Chimneys</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>A chimney’s form and materials shall be similar to other chimneys on historic resources within the district.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> | <p>(8) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive language of the existing ordinance.</p> <p>(9) The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive language of the existing ordinance. The generic ordinance stipulates what is prohibited, not that materials should match what is used in the district.</p> <p>The existing and new generic ordinance are in general agreement except for the setback distance.</p> <p>(10) Assuming that a chimney is an “architectural detail, the existing MBHD ordinance is more restrictive (“match” and “virtually duplicate”) as opposed to “similar.”</p> |
|---|--|--|

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| <p>The general standards for new construction in the MBHD are silent on rooftop decks, terraces, and green roofs because the bungalows are relatively small structures and because these features are largely incompatible with the bungalow design.</p> <p>(b) <u>New Principal Structures</u> . New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.</p> <p>The MBHD ordinance is silent on the nature of divided lights, but very explicit on this point in the alterations section</p> <p>The language on sliding glass doors does not apply to the MBHD.</p> <p>The MBHD ordinance is silent on awnings.</p> | <p><u>(e) Rooftop Features</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Rooftop decks or terraces and green roofs or other roof landscaping, railings, or furnishings shall be installed so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the street.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p>(5) <u>Windows and Doors</u></p> <p>(a) <u>General</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Door and window styles should both match the style of the new structure and be compatible with those on historic resources within 200 feet.</p> <p>b. The following materials are prohibited: vinyl; aluminum; glass block, reflective glass; dark glass; plexiglass; doors with a fake wood grain, mill finish or clear anodized aluminum, and other metallic finishes; and faux (decorative/non-functional) hardware.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p><u>(b) Windows and Storm Windows</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Multi-light windows shall have true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntin grids on the exterior and interior the same color as the window sash.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p><u>(c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Sliding glass doors shall not be installed on the ground floor elevation along any street frontage.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p><u>(d) Shutters</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Shutters shall only be allowed if they are found on historic resources in the district</p> <p>b. Shutters shall be of a size that they appear operable for the associated window.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p><u>(e) Awnings.</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Awnings will be of a configuration and form consistent with the awnings in the district</p> <p>b. Awning materials shall have the appearance of the materials found on historic resources with awnings</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> | <p>The standards of the existing ordinance are silent on window <u>style</u> in new construction, but are very explicit about style under alterations.</p> <p>(11) The standards for new construction in the MBHD require that “the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows” be followed, but this quality is omitted from the new generic ordinance. Therefore, the generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive language of the existing ordinance.</p> <p>[Question: Were shutters used on the bungalows? If so, I doubt that they were operable. Revise as necessary.]</p> |
|--|--|--|

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| <p>The MBHD ordinance is silent on the design of overhead garage doors in new construction, but explicit about them in accessory buildings.</p> <p>(b) <u>New Principal Structures</u>. New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.</p> | <p>(f) <u>Garage Doors</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Overhead doors shall not have false hinges or hardware applied.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. More contemporary door styles may be considered if they are simple in style and design</p> <p>(6) <u>Porches, Balconies and Decks</u></p> <p>(a) <u>Porch Elements</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Entrances and porches shall be of a size and configuration consistent with the historic resources in the district.</p> <p>b. The primary entrance for the structure shall be located on the front elevation, or, structures on a corner lot may have a corner entrance.</p> <p>c. Uncovered porches over fifty (50) square feet are considered decks and shall be placed so that they are not visible from the street to which the building is oriented.</p> <p>d. Composite, vinyl, and decorative metal balusters and railings are prohibited, unless not visible from the street.</p> <p>e. Second exit stairways shall be provided on the interior of the structure.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> <p>(b) <u>Balconies and Decks</u></p> <p><u>1. Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Projecting, partially projecting/inset, and inset balconies are prohibited on elevations visible from the street, unless there is precedent on the historic resources in the district.</p> <p><u>2. Guidelines</u></p> | <p>Sections 6(a)(1)(a-c) are in general agreement with the new generic ordinance.</p> <p>(12) The new generic ordinance prohibits “decorative metal balusters and railings” visible from the street. However, a quick tour of the district using Google Earth shows that one of the relatively common original features of the bungalows was the use of decorative iron work in the front. Therefore, this section of the generic ordinance prohibits one of the qualities that define the historic character of the district. This means that the restrictive language in the current generic ordinance must be deleted or the MBHD should be made an exception to this standard.</p> |
|---|---|--|

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>The MBHD ordinance is silent on building systems.</p> | <p>(7) <u>Building Systems</u> <u>(a) Mechanical Systems</u> <u>1. Requirements</u> a. Mechanical equipment shall be screened if it is visible from the street. b. Static vents, electric vents, wind turbines, and attic fans visible from the street are prohibited. c. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent building materials. <u>2. Guidelines</u> a. Split system mechanical units and other mechanical equipment should be installed on elevations, roofs, and at grade so they are not visible from the street. b. Grilles (mechanical air intake, exhaust, etc.), vents (plumbing stack, mechanical air intake or exhaust, etc.), electrical and communications equipment (transformers, cabinets, mobile service boosters, security cameras, etc.), and utility meters (water, gas, electric, etc.) should not be placed in the front yard or on the front elevation. <u>b. Solar</u> <u>1. Requirements</u> a. Roof-mounted solar arrays on sloped roofs shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and arranged in a pattern or grid parallel to the roof's ridge and eaves. b. Roof-mounted solar arrays on flat roofs shall be installed so as to be minimally visible from the street. <u>2. Guidelines</u> <u>c. Lighting and Electrical Systems</u> <u>1. Requirements</u> a. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building. b. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible. c. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the street is prohibited. d. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the street and do not damage or obscure historic features. <u>2. Guideline</u> a. More contemporary lighting styles may be considered if they are simple in style and design.</p> | <p>Wind turbines were common when the bungalows were built and a few remain. This means that if any wind turbines survive, they should be made an exception for the bungalow district. (confirm)</p> |
|--|---|--|

13 examples where proposed generic ordinance standards fail to cover district-specific standards in the existing ordinance for the Marquette Bungalow District for alterations dvm, 12-07-20

| Excerpt from today's Chapter 41.25 showing the standards for <u>alterations</u> in the MBHD | Excerpt from the 10-27 revision of the generic ordinance covering standards for <u>alterations</u> | 13 examples where standards in the proposed generic ordinance fail to protect the historic character of the MBHD because they do not include standards in the <u>existing</u> ordinance. |
|--|---|--|
| <p>[Note: The sequence of some sections of the MBHD ordinance have been changed so they align with the sequence in the generic ordinance.]</p> <p>(5) <u>Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs</u>. All exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.</p> <p>The MBHD ordinance is silent on accessibility.</p> | <p>41.xx STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS</p> <p>(1) <u>General</u></p> <p>(a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.</p> <p>(b) <u>Materials and Features</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.</p> <p>b. The removal of historic features on elevations visible from the street is prohibited.</p> <p>c. The introduction of conjectural features without historic precedent on the building shall be avoided.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. Materials, features, decorative ornament and other details should retained and preserved.</p> <p>b. Areas and features to be altered should blend seamlessly with adjacent areas of the building and features.</p> <p>(c) <u>Replacement</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Existing features shall be replaced in-kind if they are too deteriorated to repair.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. Replacement should replicate the overall form and detailing using any available physical evidence or historic documentation as a model to reproduce the feature.</p> <p>b. Compatible substitute materials should be similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.</p> <p>d. Accessibility</p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Whenever possible, access to historic buildings should be through a primary building entrance.</p> <p>b. Barrier-free access requirements shall be complied with in such a manner that the historic building's character-defining exterior features</p> | |

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| <p>(a) <u>Re-Siding</u>. [Portions of this section dealing with wood have been deleted] Brick, stucco, and half-timber detailing shall match the original in appearance. Original wood shingle siding should be repaired or replaced to match the original in appearance, whenever possible; however, covering wood shingles with double-four vinyl or aluminum may be approved.</p> <p>(k) <u>Tuckpointing and Brick Repair</u>. Mortar and other materials used in brick repair shall match the original in color, hardness and appearance. Brick shall not be painted.</p> | <p>and features of the site and setting are preserved or impacted as little as possible.</p> <p>c. Utilize solutions to meet accessibility requirements that minimize the impact of any necessary alteration on the historic building, its site, and setting, such as compatible ramps, paths, and lifts.</p> <p>2. <u>Guideline</u></p> <p>a. A gradual slope or grade to the sidewalk may be added to access the entrance rather than installing a ramp that would be more intrusive to the historic character of the building and the district.</p> <p>(2). Building Site</p> <p>(a. <u>General</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Chain link and rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split rails, are prohibited in the front yard.</p> <p>b. For retaining walls visible from the street, poured concrete walls with a smooth rubbed finish, flagstone and stone ashlar are permitted. Railroad ties, landscape timbers, boulders, and concrete blocks are prohibited.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. Protective fencing, bollards, and stanchions that are as unobtrusive as possible may be installed on a building site, when necessary for security.</p> <p>(3) Exterior Walls</p> <p>(a) <u>Masonry</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Masonry not previously covered shall not be covered with stucco, exterior insulation and finish systems (EIFS), paint, or other covering.</p> <p>b. Removing a chimney visible from the street or altering its appearance is prohibited.</p> <p>c. Refer to Section (3)(d) related to chimneys as roof elements.</p> <p>d. Replacement brick units shall be of a similar dimension, color, and permeability as the historic bricks</p> <p>e. Composite patching, epoxy repair, mechanical repair, or a Dutchman repair of large masonry units shall follow established conservation methods, with the alteration to match the historic appearance as closely as possible.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. Maintaining elastomeric caulking between masonry and other building materials will assist with keeping a building weather tight.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●(1)The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive match and duplicate requirement in the existing ordinance for the replacement of brick, stucco, and half-timber construction. ●(2)The generic ordinance fails to meet the more restrictive match and duplicate requirement in the existing ordinance for matching mortar color. |
|---|--|---|

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>(a) <u>Re-Siding</u>. Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or non-original siding on structures originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited to, window trim, wood cornices and other ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. All trim must continue to project out beyond the plane of the siding.</p> | <p>(b) <u>Wood</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <u>Requirements</u> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Replacement siding shall imitate the original siding within 1 inch of historic exposure/reveal. b. Re-siding with asbestos-style shingles, wide clapboards over six (6) inches in exposure, and vertical panels with faux wood grain texture, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles and shakes, and vinyl siding are prohibited. c. Where more than one layer of siding exists on the structure, all layers except the first must be removed prior to re-siding. d. All trim must project beyond the face of the siding to the same extent it did with the historic siding. e. Wrapping of trim and ornament is prohibited. 2. <u>Guidelines</u> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Re-siding with siding that replicates the historic siding in profile exposure and detail is preferred. b. In the event of partial replacement, transitions from historic wood siding to replacement siding should occur at corners or transitions in the building mass where feasible. c. When transitions occur along a flat wall plane, each course of siding should be “toothed in” or offset at least 16” from the course above or below. d. The color of the replacement siding should match the siding not being replaced. e. Compatible substitute materials should be similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities. <p>(c) <u>Metals</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <u>Requirements</u> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Replacement of part or all of a decorative metal feature should be in-kind or with a compatible substitute material, replicating the original appearance. 2. <u>Guidelines</u> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Compatible substitute materials need to take into account the reactive nature of existing metal to ensure that the replacement is both visually and chemically compatible with the existing building materials <p>(4) <u>Roofs</u></p> <p>(a) <u>General</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <u>Requirements</u> | <p>The generic ordinance captures the restrictive requirements of the existing ordinance.</p> <p>●(3)Take a Google Earth trip around the two bungalow blocks and you will see that one of the distinguishing qualities of the MBHD is the use of narrow traditional siding and wide clapboards over 5 inches in exposure. However, the generic ordinance forbids the replacement of all wide siding. This means that one of the qualities that contributes to the historic character of this district is illegal according to the generic ordinance. Therefore, the generic ordinance must be changed or homes in the MBHD need to be made exceptions.</p> <p>[To put guidelines in the ordinance means that any change to a guideline will require an ordinance change. The better practice is to <u>not</u> put guidelines in the ordinance. LORC should give careful thought to this policy question because at some point new illustrated design manuals will be available and this is the appropriate place for all guidelines.]</p> <p>●This section (c)(a) says that homeowners “should” replace a decorative metal feature by replicating the original appearance, but section (6)(b)(1)(g) prohibits decorative metal balusters. This is a clear contradiction and should be resolved.</p> |
|--|---|--|

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>(b) <u>Roof Materials</u>. Reroofing shall be done with asphalt shingles, fiberglass shingles or other rectangular composition shingle similar in appearance to 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Sawn wood shingles may also be approved. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, Dutch lap, French method and interlock shingles are incompatible with the historic character of the district and are prohibited. Vents shall be located as inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Alterations to a roof shall include a roof style that is compatible with the existing roof. b. The form of the roof visible from the street shall not be altered except to restore it to the historic documentable appearance. c. The removal of decorative and functional features visible from the street is prohibited, except to restore the building to its historic appearance. <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The form of the roof (gable, hipped, gambrel, flat, or mansard) is significant, as are its decorative and functional features (such as cupolas, cresting, parapets, monitors, chimneys, dormers, ridge tiles, and snow guards), roofing material (such as slate, wood, clay tile, metal, roll roofing, or asphalt shingles), and size, and patterning and inform what is a compatible roof alteration. b. New dormers are additions (refer to Section 41.xx). <p>(b) <u>Materials</u>.</p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. A roof feature may be replaced in kind if it is too deteriorated to repair. b. Compatible substitute materials should be similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities. c. Dutch lap, French method, and interlocking asphalt shingles are allowed on structures constructed after 1920 and within the period of significance. d. The following roof treatments are prohibited: thick wood shakes; corrugated or ribbed metal roofing panels; metal shingles; architectural asphalt shingles that have heavy faux shadowing; and any shingles with scalloped or staggered bottom edges. <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Compatible substitute materials may include three-tab asphalt shingles; architectural asphalt shingles with a straight bottom edge and light faux shadowing; flat standing seam metal and flat interlocking metal panels on flat roofs. b. Replacement should replicate the overall form and detailing using any available physical evidence or historic documentation as a model to reproduce the feature. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●(4)The existing ordinance asserts that the “use of Dutch lap, French method and interlock shingles are incompatible with the historic character of the district and are prohibited.” However, the generic ordinance says that these three types of shingles are expressly “allowed on structures (built) after 1920 and within the period of significance.” And since all of the bungalows were built between 1924 and 1930 and since the period of significance of the MBHD is 1923 to 1930, the generic ordinance encourages the installation of shingles that are expressly prohibited by the MBHD ordinance. This is another clear contradiction that must be resolved. Either the ordinance language can be changed for the MBHD must become an exception. |
|--|---|--|

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| <p>(c) <u>Skylights</u>. Skylights on street-facing roof slopes are prohibited. Skylights may be permitted on side roof slopes provided the front edge of the skylight is at least ten (10) feet back from the front edge of the main roof. Skylights on any roof area not visible from the street may be permitted. The design should be as simple as possible, of the flat type (not bubble) and painted to blend with the color of the roof.</p> <p>(e) <u>Chimneys</u>. The exterior appearance of chimneys visible from the street shall be maintained in good repair. The removal of the exterior portions of such chimneys is prohibited. Chimneys not visible from the street may be removed. New chimneys shall be constructed of brick to match as closely as possible the brick on the structure, or if there is no brick on the structure, chimneys may be made of brick similar in dimensions and color to brick on other in the neighborhood. New chimneys not visible from the street may also be constructed of metal or other non-historic material.</p> <p>(f) <u>Windows and Doors</u>.</p> <p>1. <u>General Standards</u>. [A portion of this section was moved to 5(a)(d). Picture windows are prohibited. Trim on new or remodeled windows shall match the original window trim on the structure.</p> <p>2. <u>Street Facades</u>. Windows and doors on the front or street facade of the structure and on side faces within ten (10) feet of the front facade of the structure shall retain their original or existing appearance, including true muntins</p> | <p>(c) <u>Skylights</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Skylights shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and have the frame painted to match the roof material.</p> <p>b. Skylights not visible from the street shall be permitted.</p> <p>c. Skylights visible from the street are allowed where the front edge of the skylight is at least twelve (12) feet back from the front edge of the roof.</p> <p>d. Tubular, arched, domed, or pyramidal shaped skylights are prohibited.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>(d) <u>Chimneys</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Removing a chimney visible from the street or altering its appearance, is prohibited.</p> <p>b. Refer to Section (2)(a) and (b) related to chimneys as wall elements.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. Adding or replacing caps above the chimney opening is not considered an alteration.</p> <p>(e) <u>Vents</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Low-profile continuous ridge vents are permitted when the vents extend to the front edge of the fascia and are clad with the same material as the roof.</p> <p>b. Rectangular or continuous soffit vents are permitted if they are finished or painted the same color as the adjacent soffit.</p> <p>c. Round soffit vents, static vents, electric vents, wind turbines, and attic fans visible from the street are prohibited</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>(5). <u>Windows and Doors</u></p> | <p>●(5)The MBHD ordinance and the generic ordinance differ on how far back from the front edge of the roof a skylight can be. The former says 10 feet and the latter says 12 feet. This means that the generic ordinance is more restrictive than the MBHD ordinance standard.</p> <p>[Some tubular skylights including several Velux models have a flat, low roof profile just like the ones that are expressly approved by the generic ordinance, so why prohibit them?]</p> <p>●(6)The generic ordinance is silent on what can be done about chimney’s not visible from the street, whereas the MBHD ordinance says that such chimney can be built with brick, metal, or other non-historic material. This is a case where the MBHD ordinance is more lenient than the generic ordinance.</p> <p>Section 2 refers to the building site, not chimneys as wall elements. This referent needs to be corrected.</p> |
|---|---|--|

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| <p>where they exist. Replacement windows and doors may be approved if they match the original appearance.</p> <p>3. <u>Non-Street Side Facades</u>. Retention of the original appearance of windows and doors on the sides of the structure is encouraged. However, if replacement or new windows are proposed, the muntin design of the original windows on the structure may either be replicated with true-divided lights or with exterior or interior applied grids or with grids applied between the panes of glass. New windows shall either be casement windows or double-hung windows. Sash on new windows over four (4) feet square shall be divided by muntins or mullions. Bay windows may be approved if they have sides perpendicular to the wall and if they do not extend beyond the eaves of the roof.</p> <p>4. <u>Rear Facade</u>. Replacement, remodeling or installation of new doors and windows on the rear facade will not be restricted except as discussed under "General Standards" above.</p> | <p>(a) <u>Openings</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Historic/original openings in walls above the foundation level visible from the street shall not be filled.</p> <p>b. A limited number of openings in walls above the foundation not visible from the street may be filled in a manner that retains the original opening pattern and size, and is similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the surrounding wall.</p> <p>c. New window openings may be added to elevations not visible from the street.</p> <p>d. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. Appropriate approaches to filling windows or doors may include inseting masonry by at least one inch from the face of the wall, adding solid panels, installing closed shutters, and retaining original window trim.</p> <p>b. New openings should have a similar height to width ratio, operation (e.g., double hung, casement, awning, or hopper), components (including sash, muntins, glazing, pane configuration, sills, mullions, casings, brick molds, or trim), and finish as historic windows of the structure.</p> <p>(b) <u>Sill and Head Height</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. The treatment of the window or door opening shall retain the original opening pattern and size.</p> <p>b. Infilling at the head or jambs is prohibited.</p> <p>c. The new or reconfigured openings shall have similar appearance to the historic windows or doors of the structure.</p> <p>d. The sills of historic window openings on elevations not visible from the street may be raised to serve bathrooms and kitchens.</p> | <p>●(7)The MBHD standards are much more restrictive than the generic ordinance in that they require the windows on the street façade to retain their original or existing appearance, but for 10 feet along the sides of the home as well. In addition, the MBHD ordinance requires retention of “true muntins where they exist.”</p> <p>●(8)The MBHD ordinance is also much more restrictive on what a homeowner can do with windows along the sides of the house as noted in “Non-Street Side Facades.”</p> |
|--|--|---|

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| <p>1. <u>General Standards.</u> The original appearance of leaded glass and other non-rectangular decorative windows (e.g., curved top windows) on any facade of the structure shall be retained. Replacement of such windows shall duplicate the original in size, configuration and appearance.</p> <p>(l) <u>Storm Windows and Doors.</u> Storm windows and doors shall be enameled, painted or otherwise coated with a colored surface; raw aluminum is prohibited. Storm door designs of wood and glass to match the original design on the structure or on similar structures in the district is encouraged. Storm doors of simple design with no stylistic references (e.g., colonial cross-bars) may also be used. Storm doors with metal grilles may be approved provided that they blend with the style of the structure.</p> | <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u> a. The reconfigured openings and the windows in them should be compatible with the overall design of the building.</p> <p>(d) <u>Windows [Where is “c?”]</u> 1. <u>Requirements</u> a. Original decorative windows shall be repaired and retained. b. Only when original windows are too deteriorated to repair may they be replaced with new windows that replicate all design details. c. Replacement shall replicate the dimensions of the window components and any decorative detailing using any available physical evidence or historic documentation as a model to reproduce the feature. d. Compatible substitute materials shall be similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities. e. Replacement multi-light windows shall use true divided lights or simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass. f. A historic single-glazed sash may be modified to accommodate insulated glass when it will not jeopardize the soundness of the sash or significantly alter appearance of the window. g. Replacement stained glass and decorative glass windows shall replicate the original windows. h. Incompatible, non-historic windows may be replaced with new windows compatible with the historic character of the building. i. Storm windows shall have a matching or a one-over-one pane configuration that will not obscure the characteristics of the historic windows. j. Storm window frames and trim shall be painted or otherwise coated to match the color of the window. k. Storm windows with mill finish or anodized aluminum are prohibited. l. Windows that are compatible with the historic character of the building may be reinstated in openings that have been filled in with new windows. m. Except in structures constructed outside of the period of significance, vinyl, fiberglass, vinyl or fiberglass clad wood, aluminum, glass block, picture, bay, and bow windows are prohibited.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u> a. The window material and how the window operates (e.g., double hung, casement, awning, or hopper)</p> | <p>●(9)The MBHD standards are very clear about duplicating all features of leaded glass and non-rectangular decorative windows. Although the language overlaps, the MBHD language would be an improvement over the more abstract language of the generic ordinance</p> <p>The generic ordinance is in sync with the MBHD ordinance.</p> |
|--|--|---|

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| <p>(l) <u>Storm Windows and Doors</u>. Storm windows and doors shall be enameled, painted or otherwise coated with a colored surface; raw aluminum is prohibited. Storm door designs of wood and glass to match the original design on the structure or on similar structures in the district is encouraged. Storm doors of simple design with no stylistic references (e.g., colonial cross-bars) may also be used. Storm doors with metal grilles may be approved provided that they blend with the style of the structure.</p> | <p>are significant, as are its components (including sash, muntins, sash horns, glazing, pane configuration, sills, mullions, casings, brick molds, or trim) and related features, such as shutters should inform compatible window alterations.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> b. Sash locks, window guards, removable storm windows, and other reversible treatments may be installed to meet safety, security, or energy conservation requirements. c. Storm windows improve energy efficiency and are especially beneficial when installed over wood windows because they also protect them from accelerated deterioration. Interior storm windows can provide energy efficiency while not altering the exterior appearance of the windows on the building. d. Patterned glass may be used for privacy in bathrooms or added to the interior of window glass to provide the appearance of patterned glass. <p>(g) <u>Pedestrian Doors</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <u>Requirements</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Historic entrance doors or those dating from the period of significance may be replaced with a door that blends with the character of the structure when the original is beyond repair. b. Doors shall not have a textured fake wood grain. c. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view, wood or aluminum, in the same color as the entrance door or trim, and shall be compatible with the entrance door and the overall design of the building. 2. <u>Guidelines</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Aluminum clad wood, aluminum, and insulated hollow metal entrance doors are an acceptable alternative material if they are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the original doors. b. All doors should be painted, finished with a material that resembles a painted finish, or opaquely stained. c. Storm doors with metal grilles may be approved if they blend with the style of the structure. <p>(h) <u>Garage Doors</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <u>Requirements</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Garage doors shall be similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district. b. Overhead doors shall not have false hinges or | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●(10) Many storm doors from the 1920s featured a relatively small window in the upper third of the door. If this is the design referenced in the MBHD standard, then the preferred door design is <u>not</u> the full light styles demanded by the generic ordinance. |
|---|---|---|

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| <p>(g) <u>Porches</u>. Porches and stairway railings shall match the original railings in appearance wherever possible. Wrought iron railings with vertical balusters at least one-half (½) inch in width, wood railings with vertical square balusters spaced no more than three (3) inches apart, and solid wall railings covered in siding to match the structure will be approved. Other designs may be permitted if they blend with the character of the structure and the district.</p> | <p>hardware applied.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>(6) <u>Porches, Balconies and Decks</u></p> <p>(a) <u>Replacement</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. An entire entrance or porch that is too deteriorated to repair shall be replaced using any available physical evidence or historic documentation as a model to reproduce the porch features.</p> <p>b. A historic entrance or porch shall be retained in all instances, including change of use or space function.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. If using the same kind of material is not feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered. Compatible substitute materials shall be similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.</p> <p>(b) <u>Porch Elements</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Where physical evidence of the overall form and detailing are not evident, porch ceilings shall have the appearance of narrow beaded boards, unless another historic material is approved by the Landmarks Commission.</p> <p>b. Porch pilasters, columns, or posts shall be in proportion to the other porch elements and the rest of the structure and trimmed with decorative molding at the top and bottom of the posts.</p> <p>c. Solid panel and porch balustrades and stair wing walls shall be covered in masonry or siding to match the structure.</p> <p>d. Open porch balustrades and stair railings shall have top and bottom rails with the bottom rails raised no higher than four (4) inches above the floor.</p> <p>e. Balusters shall be located between (not in front of or behind) the top and bottom rails and shall be vertical and square</p> <p>f. Handrails on stairs shall be of a design and material to match the porch balustrade.</p> <p>g. Composite, vinyl, and decorative metal balusters are prohibited, except on structures constructed outside of the period of significance.</p> | <p>●(11)As noted in our analysis of new construction, the generic ordinance prohibits decorative iron work. The generic ordinance also prohibits decorative iron work as an alteration except on structures outside the period of significance. This is a problem because many bungalows feature distinctive iron work on their front porches and stairs. This means that if a MBHD homeowner wants to replace an original but now rusted or deteriorated iron railing, the generic ordinance would prohibit this. Clearly, the alteration section of the MBHD should allow this distinctive feature to be replaced with copies of the original.</p> |
|---|---|--|

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| <p>The MBHD ordinance is silent on how to handle the replacement of decorative iron work that is common on front porches and stairs. This is a problem because many MBHD homes feature fancy iron work that will eventually need replacement.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> duplicate the historic porch appearance. b. Spaces beneath decks and stairs shall be screened by framed panels of crisscross design narrow vertical boards, or other openwork design to allow ventilation. c. All parts of the deck shall be painted or opaquely stained. <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>(7) <u>Building Systems</u></p> <p>(a) <u>Mechanical Systems</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Mechanical and service equipment shall be installed so that it is as unobtrusive as possible and does not damage or obscure character-defining historic features. b. Air conditioning compressors, except window units, and other mechanical equipment shall be located so that they are inconspicuous when viewed from the street. c. Grilles, vents, equipment, meters, and other equipment attached to the building shall be finished or painted to match the building. d. Installing mechanical equipment on the roof that is overly large or highly visible from the street is prohibited <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Air conditioning compressors and other mechanical equipment should be substantially set back from the front wall of the structure. Screening, including landscaping, can help obscure the view from the street. b. Mechanical equipment on the roof may be installed, when necessary, so that it is minimally visible from the street to preserve the building's historic character and setting. c. Grilles (mechanical air intake, exhaust, etc.), vents (plumbing stack, mechanical air intake or exhaust, etc.), electrical and communications equipment (transformers, cabinets, mobile service boosters, security cameras, etc.), and utility meters (water, gas, electric, etc.) should not be placed in the front yard or on the front elevation. <p>(b) <u>Solar</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Roof-mounted solar arrays on sloped roofs shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and arranged in a pattern or grid parallel to the roof's ridge and eaves. | |
|---|---|--|

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>(h) <u>Second Exits</u>. Second exit platforms and stairways shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No second exit platforms or stairways shall be permitted on the front facade of a structure. When possible, second exit stairways shall be provided on the interior of the When this is not possible, they shall be added onto the rear section of the structure. Railings and design shall follow the railing and deck standards listed under "Porches" above.</p> <p>(j) <u>Foundations</u>. The original or existing finish on the foundation shall be retained. Brick or stone shall not be covered with a cementitious or other surface. Foundation insulation shall be applied only to the interior.</p> <p>Basement windows may be removed provided that the space is filled with a material to match as closely as possible the appearance of the surrounding foundation and provided that the new material is inset at least one inch from the plane of the wall.</p> | <p>b. Roof-mounted solar arrays on flat roofs shall be installed so as to be minimally visible from the street.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. Locating solar panels on the site (ground-mounted), on structures constructed outside of the period of significance, additions, or new structures is encouraged.</p> <p>(c) <u>Lighting and Electrical Systems</u></p> <p>1. <u>Requirements</u></p> <p>a. Decorative light fixtures shall replicate the original in style and placement.</p> <p>b. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.</p> <p>c. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the street is prohibited.</p> <p>d. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the street and do not damage or obscure historic features.</p> <p>2. <u>Guidelines</u></p> <p>a. More contemporary lighting styles may be considered if they are simple in style and</p> | <p>The generic ordinance only deals with second exit platforms as additions as opposed to alterations. But couldn't a reasonable person argue that a second exit platform is an alteration? If so, the alteration section should cover this relatively common request.</p> <p>●(13)The generic ordinance is silent on foundations, but the MBHD ordinance bristles with standards. The more restrictive MBHD standards focus on the need to retain the original or existing finish and the prohibition on placing insulation on the foundation exterior. However, the MBHD ordinance expressly allows homeowners to close up basement windows if they inset the exterior surface by one inch from the plane of the wall.</p> |
|--|---|--|