



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Monday, January 30, 2012

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room 300 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 7 -

Marsha A. Rummel; David W.J. McLean; Stuart Levitan; Robin M. Taylor;
Michael J. Rosenblum; Christina Slattery and Erica Fox Gehrig

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Taylor, to Approve the Minutes for December 19, 2011 with a minor change and the Minutes for January 9, 2012 as written. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

Levitan stated that Adams Construction has advertising on the radio station where he has a radio show, but this should not impair judgment.

SPECIAL ITEMS OF BUSINESS

1. [25053](#) Accepting a proposal from Dawn O'Kroley for the purchase of the residential structure located at 646 East Gorham Street within James Madison Park and authorizing staff to negotiate final terms for the purchase of the residential structure and a lease of the land beneath it.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Gehrig, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

2. [25054](#) Accepting a proposal from Bob Klebba and David Waugh for the purchase of the residential structure located at 704 East Gorham Street within James Madison Park and authorizing staff to negotiate final terms for the purchase of the residential structure and a lease of the land beneath it.

The motion to return to lead with the recommendation of approval failed by the following vote: 3-3-1 (Aye: Rummel, Taylor, Slattery; No: Rosenblum, Gehrig, McLean; Abstain: Levitan)

A motion was made by Rummel, seconded by Taylor, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES. The motion failed by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 -
Marsha A. Rummel; Robin M. Taylor and Christina Slattery

Noes: 3 -
David W.J. McLean; Michael J. Rosenblum and Erica Fox Gehrig

Abstentions: 1 -
Stuart Levitan

PUBLIC HEARING

3. [24480](#) 100 Block State Street Development - Proposed Demolition of Designated Landmark at 120 West Mifflin Street (Schubert Building), Exterior Alteration to Landmark at 125 State Street (Castle & Doyle Building), and Proposed New Development Adjacent to Landmarks. 4th Ald. Dist.
Contact: George Austin, AVA Civic Enterprises

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to approve Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to the Castle and Doyle Building at 125 State Street subject to terms of staff report of January 27. The motion passed on a voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Rosenblum, to recommend to the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that the new building at 127-129 State is not so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjacent landmark and include staff comment. The motion passed on a voice vote/other. Levitan did not vote.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Taylor, to report to the Plan Commission that the Landmarks Commission finds the Vallender building has social and architectural historic value. If the existing building at 127-129 State is demolished, the Landmarks Commission requests it be replaced with a building in a historically appropriate style. The motion passed on a voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that the current iteration of the 4th story and the Fairchild elevations of the building at 121 State is visually intrusive and adversely affects the character and integrity of the adjacent landmark. Specifically, the Landmarks Commission notes the adverse affect of the minimal setbacks, proposed material color, and overall perspective when coming up State Street. The motion passed on a voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by McLean, to report to the Plan Commission that the Landmarks Commission finds the Buell Building has historic value based on the Craftsman style and historic mixed use. The motion passed on a voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by McLean, to report to the Plan Commission that the Landmarks Commission finds the historic value of the

Haswell Building has been largely lost to exterior alterations. The motion passed on a voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Rummel, to Refer the consideration of the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the Schubert Building at 120 West Mifflin and discussions about historic value of 124 West Mifflin to the next LANDMARKS COMMISSION meeting. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

NEW BUSINESS

4. [25183](#) Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2012

Landmarks found no known historic interest for 204 West Main Street.

The following were referred to a future meeting:

- 1426 Northport Drive
- 1902 Northport Drive
- 1026 Sherman Avenue
- 931 West Johnson Street
- 925 West Johnson Street

5. [07804](#) Secretary's Report

None.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Rummel, to Adjourn at 12:30 a.m. The motion passed by voice vote/other.