

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 19, 2010
TITLE: 222 West Gorham Street – Exterior Remodeling in the C4 District and Comprehensive Design Review of Signage for Quaker Steak & Lube. 4 th Ald. Dist. (18481)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 19, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Mark Smith, Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, Dawn O’Kroley.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 19, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of the signage package for “Quaker Steak & Lube” located at 222 West Gorham Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Brad Binkowski and Mary Beth Growney Selene. Staff informed the Commission of the façade changes and changes to the signage package for “Quaker Steak & Lube.” Binkowski presented plans to modify an existing 1-story retail building. The plans call for modernizing the post-modern building. Their goal is to construct a more sleek glass and aluminum box that will come down to the street to give the restaurant its own vestibule. The plans also call for a suspended 1971 Volkswagen in this space. The signage would use some of the checkerboard which identifies with Quaker Steak & Lube. The changes to the front façade would give the building more of a “garage door” look rather than the glass windows currently installed. Canopies are also being reintroduced to the façade. The letters for “Lube” will be red and internally illuminated to attract the UW-Madison students/Badger fans. Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- I think the awnings are too much. The awnings don’t fit the automotive theme.
- I would rather see the awnings a single color. I would like to see it nice and clean.
- I don’t like the cars. The corporate designs I like better. I don’t like the awnings at all but if you have to use them go with solid colors.

Staff reminded the Commission that they are approving a façade sign facing a municipal parking lot. The projecting sign is still 5.5 square feet over sized, and approving the façade that goes along with this because it is in the C4 District. Further comments from the Commission were as follows:

- Reexamine the division of the garage doors to make sure that comes across strongly.
- The entry having a canopy is more appropriate than the awnings.
- Not nuts about the signage on the side but would be more in favor of it by eliminating the canopies.
- Try shrinking the “eat” sign by 5%.
- Front signage is perfectly fine. Garage door image very well done.
- Would prefer some kind of painted graphic on the side of the building that wasn’t obvious advertising.

- Not very fond of the awnings.
- Agree with the elimination of the canopies.

Staff ran through the application to discuss what aspects of the project are not in compliance with code. The “eat” sign is a bit too large with the awning sign on the side probably not allowed because it faces and crosses over the property line for the adjacent municipal parking lot.

ACTION:

On a motion by O’Kroley, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0). The motion required the following:

- The “curved directional arrow/eat” blade sign be downsized to be in compliance to meet sign code.
- Elimination of the canopies.
- Staff’s review of the proportions of the Quaker Steak & Lube signage and checkerboard pattern to read properly.
- Study of the window openings to achieve the garage door look the application desires.
- A reduction in the depth of the individual letters for “The Lube” wall sign on the north elevation to 2” or less.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 222 West Gorham Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	8	-	-	7	-	7	7
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	6	-	5	5	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Well done renovation.
- Fine except I probably won't eat there.
- A bit hillbilly but OK by me. VW Bug? We're not all hippies in Madison, really.