

From: [Deborah Beduhn](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Demolition of Edgewood Ave homes
Date: Friday, October 25, 2024 5:12:12 PM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from debeduhn@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I want to preserve our historic neighborhoods, and ask that you oppose demolition of the two Edgewood Avenue houses, and I hope you uphold the decision of the Plan Commission to deny the demolition permit. Please preserve the history of Madison and continue to support affordable housing.

Deborah Beduhn
25 W. Newhaven Circle
Madison 53717

From: sue.ellingson@icloud.com
To: [All Alders](#)
Cc: [Mayor](#)
Subject: Overturn Plan Commission, 2121 Jefferson and 1007 Edgewood
Date: Sunday, October 27, 2024 8:00:53 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from sue.ellingson@icloud.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Alders,

I urge the Common Council to overturn the Plan Commission and permit the demolition of two houses, at 2121 Jefferson St and 1007 Edgewood Ave.

These houses are “contributing resources” for the Wingra Park Historic District. That only means that they were included when the district was created in 1999. Twenty-five years ago. They have not been reviewed since.

According to one summary, “A historic resource must...retain its physical integrity that is comprised of seven qualities: materials, design, workmanship, location, setting, feeling and association.” (Ann Arbor, <https://bit.ly/4hiShsN>)

I live only a few blocks away from these properties. They were originally built as simple, ordinary houses. Repairs over many years have degraded any historic value. They have not retained their physical integrity.

Here is a link to photos of the properties:
<https://madison.legistar.com/View.ashx?M=F&ID=13237612&GUID=2656810C-67BF-4D36-BAAE-E50DE3E2CC98>

A young couple has made a proposal to demolish these two rundown houses and build a new, neighborhood-appropriate house.

There is no other proposal to renovate the existing houses.

No one knows what will happen with the houses if you deny the demolition permit. We have an over-abundance of rundown student rental housing just a few blocks away, and Edgewood College right across the street. No one wants these two houses to turn into student rentals.

When I was Alder more than a decade ago I learned that Alders and the Common Council sometimes should make the right decision, even if it doesn't quite fit strict rules. We have elected you to make good judgements.

This is one of those cases. For the health, prosperity, safety, and welfare of the City of Madison and the Vilas Neighborhood, I urge you to overturn the Plan Commission decision and let the new house be built.

Sue Ellingson

1922 Vilas Ave, Madison, WI 53711
sue.ellingson@icloud.com
608-320-8206

From: wendy.fearnside@att.net
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Oct. 29 Common Council Agenda Item 8 - 85527 Demolition of 2 Historic Houses
Date: Sunday, October 27, 2024 10:00:06 PM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Uphold the Plan Commission's Denial of a Demolition Permit for 2 Historic Homes

Madison's historic districts are as varied as Mansion Hill, the Marquette Bungalows, and the Hill Farms planned community of mid-century modern ranch and contemporary homes. These concentrations of period homes add to the diversity and charm of our city. Once a historic home is gone, it cannot be replaced. And when the integrity of a historic neighborhood is chipped away at, that damage cannot be undone.

The houses proposed for demolition (2121 Jefferson St. and 1007 Edgewood Ave.) are part of the Wingra Park National Historic District, which is described as follows on the City of Madison, Department of Planning, Community and Economic Development's website:

“By 1903 the [Wingra Park] area was considered one of Madison's finest residential districts. The area contains some of Madison's finest Queen Anne, Prairie style and period revival homes. These buildings constitute one of Madison's most important and intact architectural legacies.”

They may not be the most stately or architecturally significant homes in the Vilas neighborhood, but they are an important part of the fabric of the Wingra Park National Historic District. I think they deserve to be preserved.

Wendy Fearnside
912 Van Buren St.
Madison, WI 53711

From: [Jeff](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Cc: [Jule Stroick](#)
Subject: Re: Appeal of the Plan Commission Action on the Demolition Permit for 1007 Edgewood Ave and 2121 Jefferson St
Date: Tuesday, October 29, 2024 8:23:17 AM

[You don't often get email from fordjrf@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification>]

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

>

>

> I support the action taken by the Plan Commission on its denial of the demolition permit for 1007 Edgewood Avenue and 2121 Jefferson Street. These two residential structures are within the Wingra Park National Register Historic District and are contributing to the integrity of the overall historic character of the area. I support the renovation of the two structures rather than the demolition of the existing structures and their replacement with a single residential unit.

>

> I am a homeowner who purchased our property in 1992. At the time of purchase, our existing structure had experienced many decades of deferred maintenance. The electrical was knob and tube, the plumbing was caked with decades of hard water buildup, so both systems had to be completely replaced. The water heater was 38 years old, the furnace was the old octopus style and had been adapted from using coal to natural gas. The walls and attic had no insulation. The basement had no drainage so we had to add a sump pump. But the bones were sound. We used sweat equity, family help, contractors, savings, and help from the State of Wisconsin Historic Preservation Tax Credit, to refurbish our property to make it ours. It would be preferable that the residences on Edgewood Avenue and Jefferson Street be retained as is with the refurbishments needed to keep the scale, rhythm, and historic value of the area. The way we handled our house is the norm for this neighborhood. This commitment to rehabbing historic property is part of what makes this neighborhood unique and is part of the fabric that binds us together.

>

> I support the denial of the demolition permit and hope that you will uphold the Plan Commission action.

I understand this project has now been sent back to the Plan Commission. To a skeptic, this might look like “the fix is in”. I sincerely hope that is not the case. All older properties have some things outdated or “wrong” with them. These items are almost always fixable.

Thank you for your consideration,

Jeff Ford
2015 Adams Street
Madison, WI 53711

>

>

> Thank you.

> Jule Stroick

> 2015 Adams St, Madison, WI 53711

From: [Madison Trust for Historic Preservation](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Cc: [Advocacy Committee](#); [Richard Chandler](#)
Subject: Letter re Agenda Item 8, Legistar File #85527
Date: Friday, October 25, 2024 1:48:45 PM
Attachments: [2024-10-26 MTHP Letter-Edgewood Jefferson Properties.pdf](#)

Some people who received this message don't often get email from info@madisonpreservation.org. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Common Council members,
Please find attached a letter from the Madison Trust for Historic Preservation regarding the appeal of the Plan Commission action on the demolition permit for 2121 Jefferson St. and 1007 Edgewood Ave.

Thank you,

Jennifer Gurske
Program Director
Call/Text: (608) 441-8864
www.madisonpreservation.org





October 26, 2024

Re: Agenda Item 8, Legistar File #85527
Appeal of the Plan Commission action on the demolition permit for 2121 Jefferson St.
and 1007 Edgewood Ave.
October 29 Common Council Meeting

To the Members of the Common Council:

A demolition permit has been requested for two houses in the historic Vilas Neighborhood, 1007 Edgewood Ave. and 2121 Jefferson St. The Madison Trust for Historic Preservation, an organization with more than 500 members throughout the city, opposes the demolition permit.

The Plan Commission voted unanimously to deny the demolition permit at its September 23 meeting. The Landmarks Commission found that the two houses have historic value as contributing resources to the Wingra Park National Historic District at its August 5 meeting.

The owners of the houses have now appealed the unanimous Plan Commission decision to the Common Council. We urge you to oppose the appeal and uphold the decision of the Plan Commission and the recommendation of the Landmarks Commission.

The Plan Commission decision was well-founded. The applicant has not met the standards for approval of a demolition permit set forth in Sec. 28.185(9)(c) of the Ordinances, and the applicant's appeal letter has several misstatements.

These houses are listed as contributing houses to a historic district. They are located next to each other, at 1007 Edgewood Ave. and 2121 Jefferson St. (a corner lot with one side on Edgewood Avenue). They were built in 1905 and 1909 and are among ten houses from the same era located along Edgewood Avenue across from Edgewood College. They are situated at the top of a hill in the middle of that stretch of Edgewood Avenue. The owners have proposed demolishing the two houses and replacing them with one large single-family house.

The applicant says the two houses should not be listed as contributing houses to the historic district because there have been some modifications to them. This is flatly wrong, according to the City Preservation Planner. In her report, she points out that there are many houses that have been rehabilitated and that still qualify as contributing houses to a historic district. She says these houses are still able to convey their historic associations and retain their historic integrity. The limited interior modifications mentioned by the applicant do not change the status of these houses as contributing resources to a historic district.

(Continued)

Under Standard 4 of Sec. 28.185(9)(c), the Plan Commission is required to consider the recommendations of the Preservation Planner and Landmarks Commission, and they clearly recommended against demolition.

Standard 6 says the Plan Commission should consider the condition of the buildings and look at any Building Inspection and Fire Department reports. The applicant says the houses are not in good condition. This is wrong. There are no negative city reports. The applicant has produced no home inspection reports showing any structural problems. The photos provided by the applicant show two houses in good condition.

It should be noted that the house at 1007 Edgewood Ave. is currently listed online as a "House for Rent" for \$2,800 per month, with a list of desirable features and no mention of defects. This shows that the owners know it is in fact a very nice, very livable and sound house in good condition.

Finally, Standard 7 and the Statement of Purpose in the Ordinances say the Plan Commission should consider whether demolition is consistent with several factors, including preservation of historic buildings and the welfare of the city. Demolition would remove two houses that contribute to a historic district and replace them with a much larger house that would not fit in.

As far as the overall welfare of the city is concerned, demolition would remove two average-sized houses which could be purchased by middle class families and replace them with one large house unaffordable for most families. There would be a net loss of housing stock and a loss of some of Madison's distinctive identity. The Ordinances encourage preservation of all houses that contribute to the city's historic character, not just grand mansions.

The Ordinances set up a sequence for review:

- Do the houses contribute to Madison's historic character? The answer is yes.
- Are the houses structurally sound? Yes.
- Will demolition produce net benefits for the city? No. We would have a net loss of housing stock and lose two mid-range houses that contribute to the neighborhood's historic identity.

The Plan Commission correctly concluded that the demolition permit should be denied, based on its thorough review of the standards in the Madison Ordinances that must be applied here. The Common Council should oppose the appeal by the owners and uphold the decision of the Plan Commission.

Respectfully submitted,

Richard Chandler

Richard Chandler
President
Madison Trust for Historic Preservation

From: [Robin Hill](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Support for agenda item #8
Date: Saturday, October 26, 2024 7:43:10 AM

[Some people who received this message don't often get email from robinmalooofhill@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification>]

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

As a resident of the Vilas neighborhood at 1010 Grant Street, I support the demolition of the properties under appeal in agenda item number eight.

Robin Hill

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Mike Hill](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Support for agenda item #8
Date: Saturday, October 26, 2024 7:47:33 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from michaelhill72@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

As a resident of the Vilas neighborhood at 1010 Grant Street, I support the demolition of the properties under appeal in agenda item number eight.

Mike Hill

From: [Catherine Howley](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Demolition of 2121 Jefferson and 1007 Edgewood
Date: Tuesday, October 29, 2024 12:21:43 PM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from cat.howley@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Hello,

I am writing voicing my concern with the upcoming decision to grant a demolition permit to the owners and project of the above listed address, in order to build one large single family home. I understand the review is being post-poned till a later date, however my concern stands. This is practice of taking 2 lots into one in these dense areas of the city deeply deteriorates the historic character of these neighborhoods. There are plenty of 4000 SF homes being built in the area, ready for the taking. Please see Bishops Bay for large, brand new houses. These smaller homes tell the story of Madisons history and contribute to the character, continuing to make Madison a desirable place to live and increasing its value. We need to balance diversity with this growth. Further more, this proximity to a place of education, private or public, and the great employment that comes with it, we should be looking to INCREASE density, not reduce it. This is a protected district for a reason, and we should not allow perfectly good, affordable homes to be removed in order to make way for a super large single family home.

Thank you for your consideration.
Catherine Howley
435 N Paterson Street
Madison, 53703

--

Catherine Howley | catherinehowley.com | 708.528.8829

From: [Cathy hynum](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Date: Saturday, October 26, 2024 8:08:40 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from mch.cathy3@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Up hold your denial for demo of houses in Edgewood area. Madison needs houses for middle class families..not a big new house that only a few can afford. We need to uphold our historic neighborhoods.

Thank you
Mary C Hynum
5511 mc gann lane
Fitchburg

From: [Elizabeth Kraege-Soechting](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Demo Permit - 2121 Jefferson St & 1007 Edgewood Ave
Date: Monday, October 28, 2024 7:50:05 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from elizabeth.soechting@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Hello,

I am writing in **support** of the request for a demolition permit request for 2121 Jefferson St & 1007 Edgewood Ave. Their appeal is item number 8 on the agenda for 10/29/2024.

<https://madison.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=6832777&GUID=FFEA920C-1A95-4534-8A5D-3DA7F8CB0681&Options=ID%7CText%7C&Search=84825>

I live in the 2000 block of Jefferson St. I believe this permit should be granted. The assessment of the City Preservation Planner, Heather Bailey, is that these houses "...are still able to convey their historic associations...". The houses have had alterations and are not in a good state of repair. Perhaps they are still able to do this - I don't know how this vague standard is applied. However, given the state of repair of the two houses, which existed prior to the current owners, I think demolition is appropriate to build a house that is in line with the character of the neighborhood.

I will also point out that there isn't an alternative plan to preserve and restore these houses. They do not have any major historical significance. They are simply listed on the register because of the time period in which they were built. A new house that fits into the neighborhood and has all the energy benefits of modern construction seems like a much better alternative than two houses that are in disrepair.

I strongly urge the council to approve this request.
~Elizabeth Kraege-Soechting

From: [Meg Lamm](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Plan for 2121 Jefferson and 1007 Edgewood
Date: Sunday, October 27, 2024 10:05:16 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from meglamm@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear alders,

We are writing to support the building of a new house at 2121 Jefferson Street (and the tearing down of the 2 houses currently there). We live on that same block, two houses away, at 2117 Jefferson Street. We believe that a new house of the nature the owners are proposing would add to the neighborhood (we say this based on what they have said and on the architect they have hired). The two houses that would be torn down are not of historic value - they are in terrible shape and pretty much devoid of character or charm, with vinyl siding outside and seemingly no original details left inside (if there ever were any).

We say this as people who generally support of historic preservation. Our family's house was also in terrible shape when we bought it in 2017 and we invested a lot into renovating it. But it doesn't seem to make any financial sense for anyone to invest what would be needed to preserve the houses in question, given their small size, lack of character, and the nature of the extensive repairs they would require. So I'm not sure what alternative those opposed to the demolition of these houses would propose. The building of a new house as proposed by the new owners seems to us like an ideal outcome for the neighborhood and for our block.

Thank you for considering our point of view.

Sincerely,

Margaret Lamm and Daniel Grabois
2117 Jefferson St.
Madison, WI 53711

meglamm@gmail.com

From: [Ebby Melahn](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Edgewood Avenue houses
Date: Friday, October 25, 2024 2:30:21 PM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from ebbymelahn@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I am writing to express my opposition to the demolition of the two Edgewood Avenue houses. We need to do what we can to preserve our historic neighborhoods. Thank you

Ebby Melahn
730 Dempsey Rd
Madison WI

From: [Rhonda OBrien](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Opposition
Date: Saturday, October 26, 2024 1:37:13 PM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from robrien0415@icloud.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

We would like to voice our opposition to agenda item #8, demolition of properties 2121 Jefferson St. and 1007 Edgewood. Given our neighborhoods historic designation, demolition is not consistent with the values of such a designation. We value and want to protect the historical nature of this neighborhood, each and every house. We would fully support a restoration of each of these properties to become two updated yet historically accurate homes. Lastly, this request falls directly contrary to Madison's recent declaration for increased density in all neighborhoods. How can anyone, VNA, or the city council be supportive of two such opposing actions? We hope the council can be consistent in supporting historical preservation and fostering our cities need for increased housing.

Rhonda and Kevin OBrien
1901 Vilas Ave Madison Wi

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Brad Ricker](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Cc: [VNA President](#); [Sue Ellingson*](#); gunderman13@gmail.com
Subject: Re: [VilasNA] Comments to Common Council Regarding Proposed Demolitions
Date: Sunday, October 27, 2024 10:11:49 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from pinelakewi@icloud.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

October 27, 2024

To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing to say that I support the move to over-rule the Madison Plan Commission with regard to the demolition permit for the houses located at 1007 Edgewood Avenue and 2121 Jefferson Street. This property is highly appropriate as a single family dwelling unit, and my experience living at 1815 Adams Street (built in 1914) is that some homes, at times, need to be replaced by a new, larger one. We have been happy with the "tear-down" replacement across the street from us (in 2007!) and I imagine the same will be the experience of those living closest to this site.

Brad Ricker
1815 Adams Street

On Oct 26, 2024, at 7:16 AM, VNA President via groups.io
<vnapresident@gmail.com@groups.io> wrote:

Vilas Neighbors-

As was noted in Wednesday's VNA Council agenda and my email on Monday, the Plan Commission's denial of the demolitions of 1007 Edgewood and 2121 Jefferson is being appealed to the Common Council at next Tuesday's meeting. It is Agenda Item #8.

<https://www.cityofmadison.com/city-hall/committees/common-council/2024-10-29>

If you have comments or wish to register in support or opposition, please do so following the instructions on the agenda with written comments to:

allalders@cityofmadison.com

This will go to Alder Evers and the other 19 alders. A total of 14 alders are needed to overturn the Plan Commission's decision, so this is a high bar.

The VNA Council passed a motion of support at last Wednesday's meeting and I've filed that with the Common Council along with key arguments both in favor and against that were expressed at Wednesday's meeting.

Thanks,
-Doug Carlson, VNA President

Groups.io Links:

You receive all messages sent to this group.

[View/Reply Online \(#3327\)](#) | [Reply to Sender](#) | [Reply to Group](#) | [Mute This Topic](#)
| [New Topic](#)

[Your Subscription](#) | [Contact Group Owner](#) | [Unsubscribe](#)
[pinelakewi@icloud.com]

From: [Pat Scheckel](#)
To: [Evers, Tag](#); [All Alders](#)
Subject: Support for Agenda Item 8 - Demolition of houses at 2121 Jefferson St and 1007 Edgewood Ave
Date: Sunday, October 27, 2024 7:09:09 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from pschecke@yahoo.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I am writing in support of the demolition of the houses at 2121 Jefferson St and 1007 Edgewood. These houses are not in good condition. If the demolition is not approved, the most likely outcome is for these houses to become even more poorly maintained student rentals.

Patrick Scheckel
1915 Jefferson St.

From: [marta sells](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Edgewood/Jefferson
Date: Saturday, October 26, 2024 5:14:58 PM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from marta.sells@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

In regard to proposed demolition of the historic houses at 2121 Jefferson and 1007 Edgewood, I oppose the demolition. Please preserve our historic neighborhood/s.

Marta Sells

2112 Madison St, #2 Madison, WI 53711

From: [JudySidran](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Houses on Edgewood
Date: Sunday, October 27, 2024 11:42:16 AM

[Some people who received this message don't often get email from judysidran@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification>]

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Please overturn the present ruling and allow the houses to be demolished first a family to build their new home.

Thank you,
Judy Sidran
1922 Jefferson st.
53711

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Jon standridge](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: support for demolition permit for 1007 Edgewood Ave and 2121 Jefferson St. October 29 common council agenda number 85527
Date: Monday, October 28, 2024 10:39:44 AM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from jonstandridge66@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

My house is right next door and on the same block as the houses proposed for demolition. I have lived in my house since 1976. I have been active in the Vilas neighborhood for many years, serving on the Vilas Neighborhood Association Council, the zoning committee and the Edgewood Liaison Team. I strongly support the proposed demolition of the two houses and the plans to replace them with a single family house consistent with the current zoning. The houses have been minimally maintained for all the years I have lived next door and are in generally poor condition. My original hope was that the houses could be bought, restored and sold as single family, owner occupied homes. With the 1.1 million dollar selling price for the combined properties along with the several hundred thousand dollar updates needed to make them attractive, would result in two unreasonably high priced houses that would, because of the high price, not appeal to most buyers. The plan to tear down the current structures and replace them with a single family house is a strong alternative and fully supported by me. In my various roles on neighborhood committees I have worked long and hard to maintain the historic character of the Vilas neighborhood. My view is that a new structure on this lot, built with adherence to the historic architectural character of the Vilas Neighborhood. would go a lot further in protecting the historic nature of Vilas, than having these houses become student rentals or some other non owner occupied use. I urge you as an alder to overturn the Plan Commission denial of the demolition permit. Thanks for reading!

Jon Standridge
Cell, 608-669-8770

From: kurt.stege@gmail.com
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Council meeting of October 29: Agenda item 8, File 85527, Appeal from Plan Commission action to deny demolition requests for two contributing buildings in the Wingra Park National Register Historic District
Date: Sunday, October 27, 2024 10:17:15 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Individual historic buildings and historic districts occupy approximately 1% of the city's total area. The historic district boundaries have been established after careful evaluation of the individual structures within them.

The property owners seeking these two demolitions are undoubtedly very nice people who we are fortunate to have as citizens of Madison. However, by identifying this parcel of land for raising their family in a single family home of their dreams, they are actually asserting that historic districts have no future in Madison.

Despite unsupported statements to the contrary, the two existing homes (both of which are indisputably designated as "contributing" to the district) are in reasonably good condition and merely fail to fulfill the applicants' ideal of a dream home.

The answer is not to tear down two homes that are entirely consistent with the other homes in this historic district, but for the applicants to expand the scope and duration of their dream home search.

The demolition application improperly focuses on the vinyl siding that covers both homes except inside one screened porch. The Wingra Park Historic District nomination document specifies that modifications such as vinyl siding do not disqualify a home from qualifying as "contributing" to the district. Furthermore, when asked at the Plan Commission public hearing, the applicant's architect did not know whether the vinyl siding was simply applied over the homes' original wood clapboard siding, a common practice that is easily remedied by removing the vinyl and exposing the wood.

Approval of these demolition applications would open a gaping fissure in the current standard for allowing tear downs in historic districts. The only way to grant this appeal would be to ignore the standard without justification.

Thank you.

Kurt Stege
82 Cambridge Road
Madison

From: [Jule Stroick](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: RE: Appeal of the Plan Commission Action on the Demolition Permit for 1007 Edgewood Ave and 2121 Jefferson St
Date: Monday, October 28, 2024 12:00:03 PM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from jule.stroick@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I support the action taken by the Plan Commission on its denial of the demolition permit for 1007 Edgewood Avenue and 2121 Jefferson Street. These two residential structures are within the Wingra Park National Register Historic District and are contributing to the integrity of the overall historic character of the area. I support the renovation of the two structures rather than the demolition of the existing structures and their replacement with a single residential unit.

I am a homeowner that purchased our existing property in 1992. At the time, our existing structure experienced many decades of deferred maintenance. With the assistance from the State of Wisconsin Historic Preservation Tax Credit, as well as other sources, we have been able to refurbish our property so it is structurally sound. It would be preferable that the residences on Edgewood Avenue and Jefferson Street be retained as is with the refurbishments needed to keep the scale, rhythm, and historic value of the area.

I support the denial of the demolition permit and hope that you will uphold the Plan Commission action.

Thank you.
Jule Stroick
2015 Adams St, Madison, WI 53711

From: [Karen Tolle](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: proposed demo in Vilas
Date: Saturday, October 26, 2024 5:28:20 PM

Some people who received this message don't often get email from ktolle@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I'm very proud of the people who recently denied the demolition permit for the two properties at Jefferson and Edgewood. Please do not allow the proposed demolition to go forward.

Deferred maintenance should never be permitted as an avenue to achieve some profitable, desired demolition. I live nearby, and I have observed these two homes over time and they are no more decrepit than many of the simpler homes in our neighborhood. If we excluded all homes with replacement windows, or vinyl siding, for example, few historic homes could remain. Remodeling updates are made over time based on what the current fashion is at the time, along with affordability. Letting this type of routine maintenance morph into legitimate grounds for demolition will set a very bad precedent for our area. It must not become grounds for demolition.

Most compelling, though, is that the continued existence of these two homes, as they are, doubles the housing density of that proposed larger lot. I want more neighbors, not fewer. I particularly treasure having neighbors who are not extremely wealthy; by purchasing one of these homes, a person may be able to access a terrific neighborhood at a lower entrance cost. Our neighborhood needs more of that, not less.

I am generally in favor of greater housing density in Vilas, and denying this demo permit is a simple way to continue just one small manifestation of that.

Please do not allow the proposed demolition to go forward. I may be contacted for further comment if you wish (262-308-5694).

Vilas resident Karen Tolle
2005 Madison Street
Madison WI 53711

From: [Jennifer Lucas Townsend](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: Proposed demolition of Vilas houses
Date: Monday, October 28, 2024 8:23:59 AM

You don't often get email from jenlucastownsend@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I adamantly oppose the demolition of the two Edgewood Avenue houses, and hope you uphold the decision of the Plan Commission to deny the demolition permit.

There is no need for an oversized house to take up an entire city block. It would alter the face of the neighborhood and reduce our city stock of single family homes.

Thank you,

Jennifer Townsend

From: [VNA President](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: VNA Support for 10/29 Agenda #8; Legistar #85527
Date: Friday, October 25, 2024 2:30:50 PM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Alders:

The Vilas Neighborhood Association (VNA) expresses its support for the proposed demolitions of 1007 Edgewood and 2121 Jefferson per the appeal, Agenda item #8.

VNA residents and the homeowners discussed the proposed demolitions and plans for an hour at our 10/23/24 meeting. Following extensive discussions, the VNA passed the following resolution:

"The VNA Council supports the Kawas family's proposed demolition of 1007 Edgewood and 2121 Jefferson in order to build a single-family home."

The vote was four in favor, one opposed, and one abstain.

Supporters noted that these properties are in poor condition, are inconsistent with the style and lot sizes of surrounding homes, and do not retain the contributing characteristics of the Wingra Park Historic District except their age. There was also broad support for the owners to build a home for their family at this location. Noteworthy is that the strongest proponents are the neighbors living in the immediate vicinity of these properties.

Concerns raised include the fact that these homes are the same age as most homes in this area, are relatively affordable compared to surrounding homes, they may be salvageable by an investor or other owner, and the specific design of the replacement structure is unknown at this time.

Thanks for your consideration,
-Doug Carlson, VNA President

From: [Nancy Webb](#)
To: [All Alders](#)
Subject: 2121 Jefferson Street
Date: Saturday, October 26, 2024 9:54:37 PM

[Some people who received this message don't often get email from rupa621@sbcglobal.net. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification>]

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Our family has enjoyed living in the Vilas neighborhood for more than 20 years. Its history and the diversity of housing styles, ages, sizes and prices keeps things interesting and prevents mistaking it for a cookie cutter suburb. But “old” does not mean “of historical interest or value.” There is an unfortunate tendency here toward simplistic and unsupported claims. The housing proposed for this site appears to be much more in keeping with adjacent properties than the dilapidated stock there now.

Sincerely,
Nancy Webb
1710 Adams Street
Madison
Sent from my iPhone