



**Project Name/Address:** 219 W Gilman Street

**Application Type:** Advisory Recommendation for Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission (Referral by Alder)

**Legistar File ID #** [43694](#)

**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** July 11, 2016

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Mark Kruser, Assemblage Architects

**Requested Action:** Alder Verveer requested that the development project at 219 and 223 W Gilman Street be referred to the Landmarks Commission for an advisory recommendation for the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission.

## Background Information

The subject site is located on a block fronted by State Street and is bounded on one side by a City-owned parking lot. The development site includes the existing Chabad House at 223 W Gilman and a rental property at 219 W Gilman. The intent of the proposal is to demolish the building at 219 in order to construct an addition to 223. Both buildings are contributing buildings in the Mansion Hill National Register Historic District. The buildings are not located in the Mansion Hill local historic district.

Alder Verveer has requested that this proposal come before the Landmarks Commission for an advisory recommendation for the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission, offering these comments related to the Landmarks Commission review – *“I believe that this parcel and her neighbors should be in the local district and would appreciate the Commission offering their advice and expertise to the Plan Commission as if they were.”*

Although this request has not been formally referred to the Landmarks Commission through the development review process, the Applicants have agreed to the review by the Landmarks Commission as requested by the Alder. In order to provide an advisory recommendation related to the Alder’s comments, the following ordinance sections would be relevant if this request were happening in the Mansion Hill local historic district:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest

expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

- (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:
- (a) Whether the structure is of such architectural or historic significance that its demolition or removal would be detrimental to the public interest and contrary to the general welfare of the people of the City and the State.
  - (b) Whether a landmark's designation has been rescinded.
  - (c) Whether the structure, although not itself a landmark structure, contributes to the distinctive architectural or historic character of the historic district as a whole and therefore should be preserved for the benefit of the people of the City and the State.
  - (d) Whether demolition or removal of the subject property would be contrary to the policy and purpose of this ordinance and/or to the objectives of the historic preservation plan for the applicable historic district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
  - (e) Whether the structure is of such old and unusual or uncommon design, method of construction, or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.
  - (f) Whether retention of the structure would promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
  - (g) The condition of the property, provided that any deterioration of the property which is self-created or which is the result of a failure to maintain the property as required by this chapter cannot qualify as a basis for the issuance of a certificate of appropriateness for demolition or removal.
  - (h) Whether any new structure proposed to be constructed or change in use proposed to be made is compatible with the historic resources of the historic district in which the subject property is located, or if outside a historic district, compatible with the mass and scale of buildings within two hundred (200) feet of the boundary of the landmark site.
  - (i) Prior to approving a certificate of appropriateness for demolition, the Landmarks Commission may require the applicant to provide documentation of the structure. Documentation shall be in the form required by the Commission.

#### **41.22 MANSION HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (4) Standards for Review of Development in the Mansion Hill Historic District.
- (1) Any new structure located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - (a) Height
    - (b) Gross Volume
    - (c) In the street elevation(s) of a structure, the proportion of width to height in the facade(s).
    - (d) The proportions and relationships of width to height of the doors and windows in street facade(s).
    - (e) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
  - (2) All street facades shall blend with other structures via directional expression. When adjacent structures have a dominant vertical or horizontal expression, this expression should be carried over and reflected.

## **Recommendation**

Staff does not provide a recommendation on advisory referrals. Instead, the Landmarks Commission's report is forwarded to the Plan Commission and the Urban Design Commission for their information.