



Project Name & Address: 710 Orton Court
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and exterior alterations
Legistar File ID # [78231](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: June 21, 2023

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Andrew Rubsam
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a dormer addition, replacement of existing asphalt shingles, replacement of two windows, and installation of two skylights.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features

1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
- (4) Roofs
- (c) Skylights
 2. Other forms of skylights are allowed on elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
 3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
 5. Rooftop additions, decks, terraces, and mechanical and service equipment shall be located to be set back from elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way in order to minimize its visibility and impact on the historic character of the building.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.
 - (b) Wood
 1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
 - (b) Materials
 1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
 - (f) Dormers
 1. Dormer additions not visible from the developed public right-of-way shall be permitted.
 3. The ridge line of a dormer shall not extend above the ridge line of the main roof or extend beyond the face of the main structure wall below.
 4. Dormer roof form, overhang, cladding, trim, and window shall be compatible with the character of the structure.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General

1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to construct a centrally-located dormer to the back of the house at 710 Orton Ct., replace the two fixed gable-end windows with awning windows to meet egress standards, and install two operable skylights to the rear of the roof. The simple two-story, side-gabled structure was constructed in 1914 and features a transitional porch with both Victorian and Craftsman elements.

The applicant has investigated the siding in place under the existing vinyl and it is a similarly styled wide wood clapboard underneath with an approximately 6" reveal. The proposal is to use a smooth-surfaced composite product for the siding on the dormer that would replicate the reveal on the structure. The pair of double-hung windows in the dormer would replicate the appearance and operation of the windows on the historic structure. The skylights are approximately 9' away from the edge of the roof, but as they are not visible to the developed public right-of-way, they do not need to be stepped back 12' as visible skylights would be required to be. The two gable-end windows are not decorative and the replacement windows would make them operable in order to meet egress standards. All proposed windows meet historic district standards for their exterior materials replicating the appearance of wood.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

(1) General

(a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.

(b) Materials and Features

2. The alterations of the windows and introduction of skylights is in keeping with the design and character of the building. The new windows will replicate the appearance of the existing and the skylights will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way.

(4) Roofs

(c) Skylights

2. As these skylights will be located on the back side of the roof where they will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way, their location and style are allowable.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

(1) General

(a) General

2. The new dormer is designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
3. The location of the dormer in the center and on the back side provides a visible separation of the addition to the historic structure.
4. The pair of windows centrally located on the face of the dormer is in line with both the character of the structure and with the character of dormers in the vicinity.
5. The new dormer is centrally located on the rear of the roof so as to minimize the visibility and impact on the historic character of the building.

(b) Materials and Features

1. The dormer addition is located on a secondary and non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
- (2) Building Site
 - (a) General
 1. The application materials provide substantial evidence of dormer additions being a part of the character of historic resources within 200 feet.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 1. The siding on the dormer will be a smooth-surfaced composite that replicates the reveal of the historic siding in place beneath the vinyl siding.
 - (b) Wood
 1. The proposed clapboard material replicates the appearance of wood with a smooth surface.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 1. The form and pitch of the dormer has a similar roof form and pitch to the existing structure.
 - (b) Materials
 1. The proposed roofing materials would match the existing roofing.
 - (f) Dormers
 1. The dormer is substantial, but will be minimally, if at all, visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 3. The ridge line of a dormer does not extend above the ridge line of the main roof or extend beyond the face of the main structure wall below.
 4. Dormer roof form, overhang, cladding, trim, and windows are compatible with the character of the structure.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them are compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
 2. The new openings have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows of the structure.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.